
ALBERT GORE, SR., AND HIS PAPERS: THE SENATE COLLECTION

Tara Michele Mitchell
Middle Tennessee State University

Albert Gore was born in Jackson County, Tennessee, on December 26, 1907. He taught school, fiddled at barn dances, and pitched for a local baseball team to put himself through college. In 1932, this young man from Carthage, Tennessee, graduated from State Teachers College in Murfreesboro, and was appointed to his first political position, Superintendent of Schools in Smith County. While Superintendent, Gore also attended night school at the YMCA law school in Nashville, where he met a Vanderbilt Law Student, Pauline LaFon of Jackson, Tennessee, whom he married in 1937. That same year, Governor Gordon Browning appointed Gore as Tennessee's first Commissioner of Labor. In 1939, he and his wife moved from their Tennessee home to Washington, D.C., to begin the life of a Congressman's family. It was thirty years before they packed up for good to leave Washington. After fourteen years in the House, Gore successfully challenged incumbent Senator K.D. McKellar in 1952, beginning his eighteen-year Senate career in 1953.

Gore served during several particularly trying periods in American history. He was the first Congressman to have a weekly radio program, broadcast locally on WSM radio. His was quite possibly the first official voice Tennesseeans heard after the bombing of Pearl Harbor. He enlisted shortly after war began, but President Roosevelt kept him in Washington, and in Congress. Later, as a Senator, Gore was one of the few southern moderates throughout the period known as the "Second Reconstruction," a difficult position to take in an increasingly volatile South. Gore was also one of the leading "doves" during the Vietnam War. He opposed American involvement in the war, but at the same time strongly supported American troops, including his own son, who fought in the war in which he did not believe.

The contributions Albert Gore made to Tennessee and the United States are numerous. A great supporter of the Tennessee Valley Authority, Gore was one of the Senators responsible for exposing the Dixon-Yates controversy, thus preventing the sale of TVA to private investors. Albert Gore authored the first Medicare bill, and led in the passage of progressive tax reforms, undone as he says, by President Reagan. Gore was the father of the Interstate Highway System, authoring the bill, overseeing its passage, and keeping a close watch on its implementation.

A highly successful Senator, Albert Gore would be the first to admit that he had hoped to be nominated for vice-president in 1956, and had presidential aspirations for the 1960 election. It is certain that the Senator took great pride in campaigning for his son Al in the 1988 and 1992 elections, and is delighted in watching him fulfill his duties as vice-president.

Albert Gore is perhaps best-remembered by Tennesseeans for his stand on Civil Rights. His refusal to sign the Southern Manifesto and his support of almost all the Civil Rights acts during his tenure angered and alienated many Tennesseeans and Southerners in this period of massive resistance. Gore was a self-styled southern moderate, not a radical or liberal; however, as Gore admits, "this hot and rancid political stuff was an open

invitation to extremism, which made moderation a hazardous political course."¹ While Gore voted against the Civil Rights Act of 1964, he supported every other piece of Civil Rights legislation from 1953 to 1970. His "no" vote came only after his amendment opposing cut-off of federal funds to schools and hospitals failed. As a former teacher and school superintendent, Gore felt he could not support legislation that would penalize children and the sick for bureaucratic failure to comply.

Because of his very vocal opposition to the administration's policies in Vietnam, Albert Gore became the primary target in the Nixon-Agnew "Southern Strategy." Using Gore's stand on Vietnam, Civil Rights, and Senator Dirksen's amendment on prayer in public schools, Republican Bill Brock and a well-financed campaign against Gore succeeded in unseating the incumbent Senator. As Gore remembers, he was "promoted to private life by a marginal error on the part of the people of Tennessee."² Senator Gore went on to become Chairman of the Board of Occidental Petroleum, although he has since retired from that post as well.

Upon leaving the Senate, Senator Gore sent his papers, official correspondence, and other memorabilia from his Washington career to his good friend, Norman Parks, then professor of political science at Middle Tennessee State University, Gore's alma mater. The papers began arriving in 1971. Unfortunately, for lack of facilities, the Gore Papers sat in filing cabinets, boxes, and mailbags in a room in Todd Library, inaccessible except to the bravest of researchers.

In 1978, a Vanderbilt Ph.D. candidate, James Gardner, was researching his dissertation, a comparative study of Frank Clement, Albert Gore, and Estes Kefauver. In doing so, he relied heavily on the papers of these three men. Most of Clement's papers are in Nashville, at the Tennessee State Library and Archives, and Kefauver's papers are at the University of Tennessee. In 1978, when the dissertation was completed, Gardner complained of the difficulty in working with Albert Gore papers, that they were "housed in the library in the haphazard fashion in which they were shipped originally, not as they were filed in the Senator's office. There is no guide and has been no attempt at putting the collection in a more systematic arrangement that would make the papers more usable."³ While his complaint was legitimate, much has changed in the years since Gardner wrote his dissertation.

In 1986, Professor James Neal in the History Department at MTSU, along with a graduate student, began the arduous task of putting some order to the jumble of papers. Luckily, the papers and correspondence were in their original folders, and Senator Gore and his staff had neatly labeled almost every folder. Once the information on the labels was put into the computer, a filing system emerged, giving some order to the papers, and some idea to the historical value they held. For the past two years, Neal, and his graduate assistants, and volunteers have been working to make the papers physically conform to the computer-generated list, to produce a finding aid to the various collections, and to make the collections more accessible to the general researcher.

Twenty-four series make up the Albert Gore Senate Collection. There are over fifteen thousand folders in the Senate collection alone, to say nothing of the papers from the Tennessee Commissioner of Labor and later U.S. Congressmen. More people have been shown these papers in the past year (1993-94) than in their first twenty at MTSU. They have been used by many professionals, by biographers of Lyndon Johnson and Armand Hammer, by authors of books and articles on everything from reciprocal trade to juke-box legislation, and by graduate students and professors from Tennessee and Kentucky to Colorado and England. Gore Research Center staff is particularly proud that over six hundred MTSU undergraduates have been exposed to the Gore papers.

Through a unique program developed by Neal and other professors in the MTSU History Department, undergraduates have the opportunity to use primary documents to supplement their research for term papers. Most

students are given packets containing constituent correspondence concerning an aspect of recent American history (usually Civil Rights or Vietnam), and asked to write a short essay on the issue involved, and discuss the arguments on both sides of the issue, ascertain Senator Gore's position on the issue, and give a brief personal opinion on both the issue and the assignment. Other professors have required their classes to attend an orientation session in the Gore Research Center where the students view various types of materials before researching topics for new term papers. The response from students and professors alike has been overwhelmingly favorable.

While some of the students are history majors who will go on to work in other archives and manuscript repositories, the vast majority are students taking American history because it is required. For the majority of these students it is their first and last trip of this nature, although there have been some repeat visitors. For instance, last fall a student in American history wrote his term paper on nuclear testing in the 1950s and 1960s in his home town of Oak Ridge. His findings were rather surprising, and have paralleled many items in the news as of late. He returned this semester, although he has already received his grade, to talk about his paper and the chance to do further research now that many more things concerning Oak Ridge have been revealed.

It is projects like this that the staff members at the Albert Gore Center are trying to cultivate, although all researchers are welcome. There are grants available to researchers, and plans are under consideration for an Albert and Pauline Gore lecture series at Middle Tennessee State University. Most recently, Democrats 200 supplied the center with sixteen videotapes used in the making of a presentation of their Lifetime Achievement Award to the Senator. These videotapes include interviews with James Sasser, Edward Kennedy, Carl Rowan, and other notable figures who have worked with Senator Gore, as well as interviews with Albert and Pauline Gore.

Since Senator Gore's tenure in Washington lasted from 1939 to 1970, many twentieth century issues concerning Tennessee, the Southeast, and the United States are covered in his papers. The Gore Research Center welcomes inquiries as to the availability of Center materials for research. We at Middle Tennessee State University feel very privileged to provide a home to these very interesting and valuable papers, and hope that they will be used to their fullest extent.

NOTES

¹Albert Gore, *Let the Glory Out: My South and Its Politics* (New York: Viking, 1972), 85.

²As quoted in Suma Clark, "Family Ties," *Middle Tennessee State University Magazine*, 1 (March 1993), 4.

³James R. Gardner, "Political Leadership in a Period of Transition: Frank G. Clement, Albert Gore, Estes Kefauver, and Tennessee Politics, 1948-1956," (Ph.D. dissertation, Vanderbilt University, 1978), 708-709.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](http://spider.georgetowncollege.edu).

This page was last updated on 3/29/99. | [Border States On-Line](http://spider.georgetowncollege.edu/htallant/border/bs10/fr-mitch.htm) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College

400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

ALBERT GORE, SR., AND HIS PAPERS: THE SENATE COLLECTION

Tara Michele Mitchell
Middle Tennessee State University

Albert Gore was born in Jackson County, Tennessee, on December 26, 1907. He taught school, fiddled at barn dances, and pitched for a local baseball team to put himself through college. In 1932, this young man from Carthage, Tennessee, graduated from State Teachers College in Murfreesboro, and was appointed to his first political position, Superintendent of Schools in Smith County. While Superintendent, Gore also attended night school at the YMCA law school in Nashville, where he met a Vanderbilt Law Student, Pauline LaFon of Jackson, Tennessee, whom he married in 1937. That same year, Governor Gordon Browning appointed Gore as Tennessee's first Commissioner of Labor. In 1939, he and his wife moved from their Tennessee home to Washington, D.C., to begin the life of a Congressman's family. It was thirty years before they packed up for good to leave Washington. After fourteen years in the House, Gore successfully challenged incumbent Senator K.D. McKellar in 1952, beginning his eighteen-year Senate career in 1953.

Gore served during several particularly trying periods in American history. He was the first Congressman to have a weekly radio program, broadcast locally on WSM radio. His was quite possibly the first official voice Tennesseans heard after the bombing of Pearl Harbor. He enlisted shortly after war began, but President Roosevelt kept him in Washington, and in Congress. Later, as a Senator, Gore was one of the few southern moderates throughout the period known as the "Second Reconstruction," a difficult position to take in an increasingly volatile South. Gore was also one of the leading "doves" during the Vietnam War. He opposed American involvement in the war, but at the same time strongly supported American troops, including his own son, who fought in the war in which he did not believe.

The contributions Albert Gore made to Tennessee and the United States are numerous. A great supporter of the Tennessee Valley Authority, Gore was one of the Senators responsible for exposing the Dixon-Yates controversy, thus preventing the sale of TVA to private investors. Albert Gore authored the first Medicare bill, and led in the passage of progressive tax reforms, undone as he says, by President Reagan. Gore was the father of the Interstate Highway System, authoring the bill, overseeing its passage, and keeping a close watch on its implementation.

A highly successful Senator, Albert Gore would be the first to admit that he had hoped to be nominated for vice-president in 1956, and had presidential aspirations for the 1960 election. It is certain that the Senator took great pride in campaigning for his son Al in the 1988 and 1992 elections, and is delighted in watching him fulfill his duties as vice-president.

Albert Gore is perhaps best-remembered by Tennesseans for his stand on Civil Rights. His refusal to sign the Southern Manifesto and his support of almost all the Civil Rights acts during his tenure angered and alienated

many Tennesseans and Southerners in this period of massive resistance. Gore was a self-styled southern moderate, not a radical or liberal; however, as Gore admits, "this hot and rancid political stuff was an open invitation to extremism, which made moderation a hazardous political course."¹ While Gore voted against the Civil Rights Act of 1964, he supported every other piece of Civil Rights legislation from 1953 to 1970. His "no" vote came only after his amendment opposing cut-off of federal funds to schools and hospitals failed. As a former teacher and school superintendent, Gore felt he could not support legislation that would penalize children and the sick for bureaucratic failure to comply.

Because of his very vocal opposition to the administration's policies in Vietnam, Albert Gore became the primary target in the Nixon-Agnew "Southern Strategy." Using Gore's stand on Vietnam, Civil Rights, and Senator Dirksen's amendment on prayer in public schools, Republican Bill Brock and a well-financed campaign against Gore succeeded in unseating the incumbent Senator. As Gore remembers, he was "promoted to private life by a marginal error on the part of the people of Tennessee."² Senator Gore went on to become Chairman of the Board of Occidental Petroleum, although he has since retired from that post as well.

Upon leaving the Senate, Senator Gore sent his papers, official correspondence, and other memorabilia from his Washington career to his good friend, Norman Parks, then professor of political science at Middle Tennessee State University, Gore's alma mater. The papers began arriving in 1971. Unfortunately, for lack of facilities, the Gore Papers sat in filing cabinets, boxes, and mailbags in a room in Todd Library, inaccessible except to the bravest of researchers.

In 1978, a Vanderbilt Ph.D. candidate, James Gardner, was researching his dissertation, a comparative study of Frank Clement, Albert Gore, and Estes Kefauver. In doing so, he relied heavily on the papers of these three men. Most of Clement's papers are in Nashville, at the Tennessee State Library and Archives, and Kefauver's papers are at the University of Tennessee. In 1978, when the dissertation was completed, Gardner complained of the difficulty in working with Albert Gore papers, that they were "housed in the library in the haphazard fashion in which they were shipped originally, not as they were filed in the Senator's office. There is no guide and has been no attempt at putting the collection in a more systematic arrangement that would make the papers more usable."³ While his complaint was legitimate, much has changed in the years since Gardner wrote his dissertation.

In 1986, Professor James Neal in the History Department at MTSU, along with a graduate student, began the arduous task of putting some order to the jumble of papers. Luckily, the papers and correspondence were in their original folders, and Senator Gore and his staff had neatly labeled almost every folder. Once the information on the labels was put into the computer, a filing system emerged, giving some order to the papers, and some idea to the historical value they held. For the past two years, Neal, and his graduate assistants, and volunteers have been working to make the papers physically conform to the computer-generated list, to produce a finding aid to the various collections, and to make the collections more accessible to the general researcher.

Twenty-four series make up the Albert Gore Senate Collection. There are over fifteen thousand folders in the Senate collection alone, to say nothing of the papers from the Tennessee Commissioner of Labor and later U.S. Congressmen. More people have been shown these papers in the past year (1993-94) than in their first twenty at MTSU. They have been used by many professionals, by biographers of Lyndon Johnson and Armand Hammer, by authors of books and articles on everything from reciprocal trade to juke-box legislation, and by graduate students and professors from Tennessee and Kentucky to Colorado and England. Gore Research Center staff is particularly proud that over six hundred MTSU undergraduates have been exposed to the Gore papers.

Through a unique program developed by Neal and other professors in the MTSU History Department, undergraduates have the opportunity to use primary documents to supplement their research for term papers. Most students are given packets containing constituent correspondence concerning an aspect of recent American history (usually Civil Rights or Vietnam), and asked to write a short essay on the issue involved, and discuss the arguments on both sides of the issue, ascertain Senator Gore's position on the issue, and give a brief personal opinion on both the issue and the assignment. Other professors have required their classes to attend an orientation session in the Gore Research Center where the students view various types of materials before researching topics for new term papers. The response from students and professors alike has been overwhelmingly favorable.

While some of the students are history majors who will go on to work in other archives and manuscript repositories, the vast majority are students taking American history because it is required. For the majority of these students it is their first and last trip of this nature, although there have been some repeat visitors. For instance, last fall a student in American history wrote his term paper on nuclear testing in the 1950s and 1960s in his home town of Oak Ridge. His findings were rather surprising, and have paralleled many items in the news as of late. He returned this semester, although he has already received his grade, to talk about his paper and the chance to do further research now that many more things concerning Oak Ridge have been revealed.

It is projects like this that the staff members at the Albert Gore Center are trying to cultivate, although all researchers are welcome. There are grants available to researchers, and plans are under consideration for an Albert and Pauline Gore lecture series at Middle Tennessee State University. Most recently, Democrats 200 supplied the center with sixteen videotapes used in the making of a presentation of their Lifetime Achievement Award to the Senator. These videotapes include interviews with James Sasser, Edward Kennedy, Carl Rowan, and other notable figures who have worked with Senator Gore, as well as interviews with Albert and Pauline Gore.

Since Senator Gore's tenure in Washington lasted from 1939 to 1970, many twentieth century issues concerning Tennessee, the Southeast, and the United States are covered in his papers. The Gore Research Center welcomes inquiries as to the availability of Center materials for research. We at Middle Tennessee State University feel very privileged to provide a home to these very interesting and valuable papers, and hope that they will be used to their fullest extent.

NOTES

¹Albert Gore, *Let the Glory Out: My South and Its Politics* (New York: Viking, 1972), 85.

²As quoted in Suma Clark, "Family Ties," *Middle Tennessee State University Magazine*, 1 (March 1993), 4.

³James R. Gardner, "Political Leadership in a Period of Transition: Frank G. Clement, Albert Gore, Estes Kefauver, and Tennessee Politics, 1948-1956," (Ph.D. dissertation, Vanderbilt University, 1978), 708-709.

400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

APPALACHIAN PUBLIC RELATIONS AND THE CONSCIOUS MANIPULATION OF A REGIONAL STEREOTYPE 1890S TO THE PRESENT

Harry Robie
Berea College

One of the most potent symbols ever used to describe the culture of the Southern mountains is that of the hillbilly. Not appearing in print until 1900, when the term was first used by the New York Journal ([Cassidy and Hall 1010](#)), the word was attached to a stereotype which had been around since the Civil War. Soon, both word and stereotype were used to characterize "any resident of the southern mountains" ([Wilson and Ferris 504](#)). Dumb, slow, slovenly, and speakers of comically fractured English (as typified by Li'l Abner, Snuffy Smith, Ma and Pa Kettle, the Beverly Hillbillies, and the characters of Hee Haw), hillbillies have become stock characters in the popular media of the twentieth century. Furthermore, according to the Encyclopedia of Southern Culture, the stereotype was not confined just to the media, but "also permeated scholarly thought and writing on the southern mountaineer" ([505](#)). It turns out, in fact, that many people had agendas requiring the presence of hillbillies. Since most fund-raising literature, for example, creates a need before it asks its audience to make a contribution to the cause, it is not surprising that the image of the hillbilly was played for all it was worth as various individuals and organizations solicited funds for educational work in the Southern mountains. In his article "Old Men and New Schools" in *Folklife Annual*, David H. Whisnant argued that the hillbilly was the central figure of "a complex myth" created by outsiders ([74](#)). In this essay I wish to explore the dimensions of this complex myth as it appears in the literature of the settlement school fund-raising appeals.¹ In the process I will show how the myth has hurt as well as helped the Appalachian's search for self-identity.

The basic argument, as used by the fund-raisers, represented hillbillies in the following way. First, hillbillies are noble because they are ethnically "pure," that is descended from English and Scotch-Irish forbears; but they are savage because they are "degenerate," the result of inbreeding, feuding, illiteracy, and homemade alcohol. These characteristics make it impossible for them to save themselves. Yet outsiders who are products of advanced American civilization are capable of redeeming hillbillies if they are granted the resources which will enable them to bring education and religion into the mountains. The result--donors will discover--will be that hillbillies can become worthy allies in the struggle to resist the influences of the foreign-born and others (including at least implicitly the Negro) who are attempting to subvert and reshape American society.

In support of a school she intended to found, Susan G. Chester described to the Philadelphia Conference of Church Women the status of "three hundred thousand" North Carolinian mountaineers who appeared satisfied to live "the life of animals" ([Whisnant, "Old Men" 77](#)). Yet, when confronted with the possibility of improving their lives through education and religion, the rustics became pathetically eager to do so. Chester spoke to the churchwomen of a "shaggy bearded, loud-voiced almost savage-looking" individual who rode his mule into Asheville carrying a "pale, delicate little girl whose labored breathing and . . . faraway look . . . show that the world's trials are almost at an end." But somehow in his despair the mountaineer has heard that there might be help for his little girl. Fighting his tears, the mountaineer pleads to the clergyman. "O, Mister," he says, "I've rid plumb twenty mile to see

you'uns. They told me as how you knowed a powerful good man who'd make my little 'un well. I 'low his name is Mr. God. Whur d'ye reckon I can find him?" ([Whisnant 78](#)).

Whether this story is true or false is beside the point; what is important is that stories like this find themselves repeated over and over again in the fund-raising literature. Fund-raising literature for the settlement schools was written for urbanized, middle-class, moderately well-educated churchwomen from the Northeast. Therefore, the work to be done in the mountains was likened to a religious crusade. Children are portrayed as innocent, victimized, eager to improve, and irrepressibly cute. Women are also victims, in their case of cruel, alcoholic spouses given to fits of random violence. The saviors of these unfortunates, often themselves women and from the best of homes, have come from the outside to dedicate their lives to helping others. Always the saviors would need to struggle against the Appalachian menfolk, who are usually against any kind of educational reform. The Berea Quarterly reprinted a story about a hillbilly named Eleasar Van Horn, probably to show what the educators were up against. Van Horn reportedly took part in a schoolhouse debate on the rotation of the earth, and was supposed to have said that astronomy was unnecessary in the schools since God would provide "all necessary astronomical information" when people got to heaven ([Barton 25](#)).

Despite the ignorant character of the mountain menfolk, however, even they might be capable of redemption. True, many mountaineers would be portrayed as vicious, moonshining feudists who fought progress and tyrannized their families. But Abisha Johnson and the nameless mountaineer who went looking for "Mr. God" would not be the last males who would see, however dimly, the value of a settlement school education. There was Uncle William Creech, for example, who gave one hundred acres of his land to the "fotched-on" ladies he had implored to build Pine Mountain School. In almost identical ways, the roles Abisha Johnson and Uncle William played at Caney Creek and Pine Mountain would be enacted by Uncle Sol, Uncle Luce, "Moses," and others at the other settlement schools. They validate the arrival of the "furring-women" by demonstrating that the reform is wanted from within the community, not just imposed from without ([Whisnant, "Old Men" 83](#)). The need for education and religion, therefore, is real, not merely assumed by outsiders who may not know what the conditions really are. And thus the pleas of the Uncles justify both the intervention of the outside benefactors and the necessity for contributions to support their good work.

It was necessary for the Uncles (and at least some of the other males in the mountains) to show occasional redeeming virtues because of another theme which ran through the appeals from the settlement schools. This was the issue of ethnicity. George Brosi argues rather convincingly that the "do-gooders" who had come south to redeem the Negro after the Civil War had pretty well given up by the 1890s, when the settlement school fund-raising efforts began. Brosi claims the "do-gooders" looked around for other objects of their charity and concluded that the mountaineers would be a much easier cause to champion. After all, if they could be educated and given "religion," they would not be much different from mainstream whites ([Conversation with the author, 30 July 1992](#); see also [Shapiro 47 -52](#)). Furthermore, there was at the turn of the century a vast influx of newcomers from Asia, Italy, and Eastern Europe. If the mixed populations of the mountains could be portrayed as "pure" Anglo-Saxon Protestants, then they could be presented to donors as potential allies who could be enlisted to help combat the pernicious influences of this foreign immigration. Thus President William Frost of Berea College asserted that these "sturdy people" were "God's moral reserve. Uncontaminated with slavery, they are not Catholics, nor aliens, nor infidels. They come of vigorous English and Scotch-Irish stock, and only need the touch of education to make them what the Scotch are to England" ([quoted in Shannon Wilson 390](#)).

Another common appeal in fund-raising was the poverty of the typical Appalachian family. The poverty described in this literature was unrealistic--because it was invariably old-fashioned and quaint. William Frost, in his first trip

to the homes of his new charges, wrote that "there was an Arcadian freshness" about life in the mountains that was "altogether charming." "Just think," he went on,

of stepping out to wash your face in the creek, and using your own jack-knife at table! The colonial arts of spinning and weaving were to be seen on many a veranda, and at meal time the men sat with the guests, discoursing of ginseng root, "fodder-pulling," or local politics and stories of the Civil War, while the women were serving the table or shooing off the flies with green boughs. The attitudes of these flyshooers were sometimes suggestive of the figures on a Greek vase! ([*For the Mountains* 82](#))

It is also significant that when Frost tried to find a weaving teacher for his school, he did not find her on one of his mountain verandas but at Pratt Institute in New York City. Yet writers would continue to emphasize the old-fashioned way of life that was supposed to exist among our "contemporary ancestors" in the Southern mountains. Later, when photography accompanied the appeals, these "attitudes" noted by Frost would be visually preserved by Doris Ullman and others who posed their subjects in old-fashioned clothing amid relics of a by-gone time. It goes without saying that a poverty which possesses nostalgia and charm is more attractive than poverty which is so wretched that one wishes to avert one's eyes from it.

In any event, after establishing a need, the fund-raising literature had to provide its readers with evidence of the effectiveness of the organization. For example, the Scripture Memory Mountain Mission of Emmalena, Kentucky, reported to its donor list that "the harvest is reaped. Hundreds come to Camp Nathanael where they are brought face to face with the claims of Christ and from here they go back home to godless families and churchless communities with a testimony." The mission, of course, needed more money to carry its message to "the many schools, both white and colored, that are UNreached," the "communities WITHOUT a Sunday School or any Christian witness and teaching," and the "many souls mired in the slough of false teaching and superstition with none to make clear the Way" ([*Franklin*](#)).

The mission school era in the southern mountains lasted from 1892 to the 1930s--though a number of philanthropic institutions in Appalachia remain. Not surprisingly, they continue to make use of the same fund-raising motifs which have served them in the past. Not the least of these is the image of the hillbilly. This image, I suggest, is not particularly helpful in attacking the region's very real problems. Essentially the symbol infantilizes an entire people. Just as Eastern Native Americans began to dress in Western Plains costumes to conform to the image which mainstream Americans had of them, so "the Briar" in Jim Wayne Miller's poem finds he has to dress and act in certain ways to conform to the perceptions others have of the Appalachian mountaineer. In other words, the stereotype can become a self-fulfilling prophecy.

This negative stereotyping of the mountaineer naturally existed outside the fund-raising literature of the settlement schools. Cratis Williams, a mountain boy who went on to become a distinguished scholar, once summarized his own experience attending the public schools. "When I came along," he wrote, "I had the impression that it was the first objective of every high school teacher to 'correct' what was provincial. I went to a mountain college, too, and every college teacher I had tried to force me into destroying every vestige in my speech and manners of my mountain culture. In other words, it was almost a missionary zeal of my teachers to make me completely ashamed of my mountain background and to make me over into a nice little middle class boy, according to somebody's standards" ([58](#)). Williams's experience suggests that although the settlement schools were frequently helpful, they may also have worked considerable harm, psychologically and socially, on the region they sought to serve.

Motivated by high ideals, for the most part, the fund-raisers for the settlement schools tried to raise money by characterizing a whole people as benighted, irreligious, amoral, anachronistic, shiftless, and unclean. If we are the sums of the roles we play, enacting negative stereotypes creates the risk of transferring that negativity to our conceptions of self. Thus, while the hillbilly symbol may have been useful in raising money for various philanthropic enterprises, it certainly did not help the region in its quest for self-esteem.

Notes & Works Cited

¹ I restrict myself purposely to the fund-raising literature, not to the settlement schools themselves. For those interested in the larger cultural ramifications to the hillbilly stereotype, I suggest a recent article of mine in *Appalachian Heritage* and the more extensive treatments of the subject in the books by Shapiro and Whisnant. Two excellent sources for fund-raising material are the education files of the University of Kentucky archives, in Lexington, KY, and the Mountain Collection of Berea College in Berea, KY. The examples in this paper come from these archives.

Works Cited

Barton, Wm. E. "Is the Earth Round or Flat?" *Berea Quarterly*, I (May 1896), 23-25.

Brosi, George. Personal interview. 30 July 1992.

Cassidy, Frederick G., and Joan Houston Hall, eds. *Dictionary of American Regional English*. Vol. 2. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991.

Franklin, Garland D. "America--Still Calling." Emmalena, KY: Scripture Memory Mountain Mission, undated solicitation pamphlet.

Frost, William Goodell. "An Educational Program for Appalachian America," *Berea Quarterly*, 1 (May 1896), 3-22. Reprinted in revised form in "The Last Log Schoolhouse": Address before the Cincinnati Teachers Club, December 13, 1895; *Cincinnati Commercial Gazette*, December 14, 1895.

---. *For the Mountains. an Autobiography*. New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1937.

Robie, Harry. "Resolved: That on Balance the Settlement Schools Were Harmful to the Culture of the Southern Mountains. The Affirmative Stand." *Appalachian Heritage*, 19 (Winter 1991), 6-10.

Shapiro, Henry D. *Appalachia On Our Mind*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1978.

Whisnant, David E. *All That Is Native and Fine*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1983.

---. "Old Men and New Schools." *Folklife Annual 88-89* (1989): 74-85.

Williams, Cratis D. *Southern Mountain Speech*. Berea, KY: Berea College P, 1992.

Wilson, Charles Reagan, and William Ferris, eds. *Encyclopedia of Southern Culture*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1989.

Wilson, Shannon H. "Window on the Mountains: Berea's Appalachia 1870-1930." *The Filson Club History Quarterly*, 64 (July 1990), 384-400.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.
Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).
This page was last updated on 3/24/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by
Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075
E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu



Border States: Journal of the Kentucky-Tennessee American Studies Association, [No. 10 \(1995\)](#)

APPALACHIAN PUBLIC RELATIONS AND THE CONSCIOUS MANIPULATION OF A REGIONAL STEREOTYPE 1890S TO THE PRESENT

Harry Robie
Berea College

One of the most potent symbols ever used to describe the culture of the Southern mountains is that of the hillbilly. Not appearing in print until 1900, when the term was first used by the New York Journal ([Cassidy and Hall 1010](#)), the word was attached to a stereotype which had been around since the Civil War. Soon, both word and stereotype were used to characterize "any resident of the southern mountains" ([Wilson and Ferris 504](#)). Dumb, slow, slovenly, and speakers of comically fractured English (as typified by Li'l Abner, Snuffy Smith, Ma and Pa Kettle, the Beverly Hillbillies, and the characters of Hee Haw), hillbillies have become stock characters in the popular media of the twentieth century. Furthermore, according to the Encyclopedia of Southern Culture, the stereotype was not confined just to the media, but "also permeated scholarly thought and writing on the southern mountaineer" ([505](#)). It turns out, in fact, that many people had agendas requiring the presence of hillbillies. Since most fund-raising literature, for example, creates a need before it asks its audience to make a contribution to the cause, it is not surprising that the image of the hillbilly was played for all it was worth as various individuals and organizations solicited funds for educational work in the Southern mountains. In his article "Old Men and New Schools" in *Folklife Annual*, David H. Whisnant argued that the hillbilly was the central figure of "a complex myth" created by outsiders ([74](#)). In this essay I wish to explore the dimensions of this complex myth as it appears in the literature of the settlement school fund-raising appeals.¹ In the process I will show how the myth has hurt as well as helped the Appalachian's search for self-identity.

The basic argument, as used by the fund-raisers, represented hillbillies in the following way. First, hillbillies are noble because they are ethnically "pure," that is descended from English and Scotch-Irish forbears; but they are savage because they are "degenerate," the result of inbreeding, feuding, illiteracy, and homemade alcohol. These characteristics make it impossible for them to save themselves. Yet outsiders who are products of advanced American civilization are capable of redeeming hillbillies if they are granted the resources which will enable them to bring education and religion into the mountains. The result--donors will discover--will be that hillbillies can become worthy allies in the struggle to resist the influences of the foreign-born and others (including at least implicitly the Negro) who are attempting to subvert and reshape American society.

In support of a school she intended to found, Susan G. Chester described to the Philadelphia Conference of Church Women the status of "three hundred thousand" North Carolinian mountaineers who appeared satisfied to live "the life of animals" ([Whisnant, "Old Men" 77](#)). Yet, when confronted with the possibility of improving their lives through education and religion, the rustics became pathetically eager to do so. Chester spoke to the churchwomen of a "shaggy bearded, loud-voiced almost savage-looking" individual who rode his mule into Asheville carrying a "pale, delicate little girl whose labored breathing and . . . faraway look . . . show that the world's trials are almost at an end." But somehow in his despair the mountaineer has heard that there might be help for his little girl. Fighting his tears, the mountaineer pleads to the clergyman. "O, Mister," he says, "I've rid plumb twenty mile to see you'uns. They told me as how you knowed a powerful good man who'd make my little 'un well. I 'low his name is Mr. God. Whur d'ye reckon I can find him?" ([Whisnant 78](#)).

Whether this story is true or false is beside the point; what is important is that stories like this find themselves repeated over and over again in the fund-raising literature. Fund-raising literature for the settlement schools was written for urbanized, middle-class, moderately well-educated churchwomen from the Northeast. Therefore, the work to be done in the mountains was likened to a religious crusade. Children are portrayed as innocent, victimized, eager to improve, and irrepressibly cute. Women are also victims, in their case of cruel, alcoholic spouses given to fits of random violence. The saviors of these unfortunates, often themselves women and from the best of homes, have come from the outside to dedicate their lives to helping others. Always the saviors would need to struggle against the Appalachian menfolk, who are usually against any kind of educational reform. The Berea Quarterly reprinted a story about a hillbilly named Eleasar Van Horn, probably to show what the educators were up against. Van Horn reportedly took part in a schoolhouse debate on the rotation of the earth, and was supposed to have said that astronomy was unnecessary in the schools since God would provide "all necessary astronomical information" when people got to heaven ([Barton 25](#)).

Despite the ignorant character of the mountain menfolk, however, even they might be capable of redemption. True, many mountaineers would be portrayed as vicious, moonshining feudists who fought progress and tyrannized their families. But Abisha Johnson and the nameless mountaineer who went looking for "Mr. God" would not be the last males who would see, however dimly, the value of a settlement school education. There was Uncle William Creech, for example, who gave one hundred acres of his land to the "fotched-on" ladies he had implored to build Pine Mountain School. In almost identical ways, the roles Abisha Johnson and Uncle William played at Caney Creek and Pine Mountain would be enacted by Uncle Sol, Uncle Luce, "Moses," and others at the other settlement schools. They validate the arrival of the "furring-women" by demonstrating that the reform is wanted from within the community, not just imposed from without ([Whisnant, "Old Men" 83](#)). The need for education and religion, therefore, is real, not merely assumed by outsiders who may not know what the conditions really are. And thus the pleas of the Uncles justify both the intervention of the outside benefactors and the necessity for contributions to support their good work.

It was necessary for the Uncles (and at least some of the other males in the mountains) to show occasional redeeming virtues because of another theme which ran through the appeals from the settlement schools. This was the issue of ethnicity. George Brosi argues rather convincingly that the "do-gooders" who had come south to redeem the Negro after the Civil War had pretty well given up by the 1890s, when the settlement school fund-raising efforts began. Brosi claims the "do-gooders" looked around for other objects of their charity and concluded that the mountaineers would be a much easier cause to champion. After all, if they could be educated and given "religion," they would not be much different from mainstream whites ([Conversation with the author, 30 July 1992](#); see also [Shapiro 47 -52](#)). Furthermore, there was at the turn of the century a vast influx of newcomers from Asia, Italy, and Eastern Europe. If the mixed populations of the mountains could be portrayed as "pure" Anglo-Saxon Protestants, then they could be presented to donors as potential allies who could be enlisted to help combat the pernicious influences of this foreign immigration. Thus President William Frost of Berea College asserted that these "sturdy people" were "God's moral reserve. Uncontaminated with slavery, they are not Catholics, nor aliens, nor infidels. They come of vigorous English and Scotch-Irish stock, and only need the touch of education to make them what the Scotch are to England" ([quoted in Shannon Wilson 390](#)).

Another common appeal in fund-raising was the poverty of the typical Appalachian family. The poverty described in this literature was unrealistic--because it was invariably old-fashioned and quaint. William Frost, in his first trip to the homes of his new charges, wrote that "there was an Arcadian freshness" about life in the mountains that was "altogether charming." "Just think," he went on,

of stepping out to wash your face in the creek, and using your own jack-knife at table! The colonial arts of spinning and weaving were to be seen on many a veranda, and at meal time the men sat with the guests, discoursing of ginseng root, "fodder-pulling," or local politics and stories of the Civil War, while the women were serving the table or shooing off the flies with green boughs. The attitudes of these flyshooers were sometimes suggestive of the figures on a Greek vase! ([For the Mountains 82](#))

It is also significant that when Frost tried to find a weaving teacher for his school, he did not find her on one of his mountain verandas but at Pratt Institute in New York City. Yet writers would continue to emphasize the old-fashioned way of life that was supposed to exist among our "contemporary ancestors" in the Southern mountains. Later, when photography accompanied the appeals, these "attitudes" noted by Frost would be visually preserved by Doris Ullman and others who posed their subjects in old-fashioned clothing amid relics of a by-gone time. It goes without saying that a poverty which possesses nostalgia and charm is more attractive than poverty which is so wretched that one wishes to avert one's eyes from it.

In any event, after establishing a need, the fund-raising literature had to provide its readers with evidence of the effectiveness of the organization. For example, the Scripture Memory Mountain Mission of Emmalena, Kentucky, reported to its donor list that "the harvest is reaped. Hundreds come to Camp Nathanael where they are brought face to face with the claims of Christ and from here they go back home to godless families and churchless communities with a testimony." The mission, of course, needed more money to carry its message to "the many schools, both white and colored, that are UNreached," the "communities WITHOUT a Sunday School or any Christian witness and teaching," and the "many souls mired in the slough of false teaching and superstition with none to make clear the Way" ([Franklin](#)).

The mission school era in the southern mountains lasted from 1892 to the 1930s--though a number of philanthropic

institutions in Appalachia remain. Not surprisingly, they continue to make use of the same fund-raising motifs which have served them in the past. Not the least of these is the image of the hillbilly. This image, I suggest, is not particularly helpful in attacking the region's very real problems. Essentially the symbol infantilizes an entire people. Just as Eastern Native Americans began to dress in Western Plains costumes to conform to the image which mainstream Americans had of them, so "the Briar" in Jim Wayne Miller's poem finds he has to dress and act in certain ways to conform to the perceptions others have of the Appalachian mountaineer. In other words, the stereotype can become a self-fulfilling prophecy.

This negative stereotyping of the mountaineer naturally existed outside the fund-raising literature of the settlement schools. Cratis Williams, a mountain boy who went on to become a distinguished scholar, once summarized his own experience attending the public schools. "When I came along," he wrote, "I had the impression that it was the first objective of every high school teacher to 'correct' what was provincial. I went to a mountain college, too, and every college teacher I had tried to force me into destroying every vestige in my speech and manners of my mountain culture. In other words, it was almost a missionary zeal of my teachers to make me completely ashamed of my mountain background and to make me over into a nice little middle class boy, according to somebody's standards" (58). Williams's experience suggests that although the settlement schools were frequently helpful, they may also have worked considerable harm, psychologically and socially, on the region they sought to serve. Motivated by high ideals, for the most part, the fund-raisers for the settlement schools tried to raise money by characterizing a whole people as benighted, irreligious, amoral, anachronistic, shiftless, and unclean. If we are the sums of the roles we play, enacting negative stereotypes creates the risk of transferring that negativity to our conceptions of self. Thus, while the hillbilly symbol may have been useful in raising money for various philanthropic enterprises, it certainly did not help the region in its quest for self-esteem.

Notes & Works Cited

1 I restrict myself purposely to the fund-raising literature, not to the settlement schools themselves. For those interested in the larger cultural ramifications to the hillbilly stereotype, I suggest a recent article of mine in *Appalachian Heritage* and the more extensive treatments of the subject in the books by Shapiro and Whisnant. Two excellent sources for fund-raising material are the education files of the University of Kentucky archives, in Lexington, KY, and the Mountain Collection of Berea College in Berea, KY. The examples in this paper come from these archives.

Works Cited

Barton, Wm. E. "Is the Earth Round or Flat?" *Berea Quarterly*, 1 (May 1896), 23-25.

Brosi, George. Personal interview. 30 July 1992.

Cassidy, Frederick G., and Joan Houston Hall, eds. *Dictionary of American Regional English*. Vol. 2. Cambridge, MA: Harvard UP, 1991.

Franklin, Garland D. "America--Still Calling." Emmalena, KY: Scripture Memory Mountain Mission, undated solicitation pamphlet.

Frost, William Goodell. "An Educational Program for Appalachian America," *Berea Quarterly*, 1 (May 1896), 3-22. Reprinted in revised form in "The Last Log Schoolhouse": Address before the Cincinnati Teachers Club,

December 13, 1895; *Cincinnati Commercial Gazette*, December 14, 1895.

---. *For the Mountains. an Autobiography*. New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1937.

Robie, Harry. "Resolved: That on Balance the Settlement Schools Were Harmful to the Culture of the Southern Mountains. The Affirmative Stand." *Appalachian Heritage*, 19 (Winter 1991), 6-10.

Shapiro, Henry D. *Appalachia On Our Mind*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1978.

Whisnant, David E. *All That Is Native and Fine*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1983.

---. "Old Men and New Schools." *Folklife Annual 88-89* (1989): 74-85.

Williams, Cratis D. *Southern Mountain Speech*. Berea, KY: Berea College P, 1992.

Wilson, Charles Reagan, and William Ferris, eds. *Encyclopedia of Southern Culture*. Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1989.

Wilson, Shannon H. "Window on the Mountains: Berea's Appalachia 1870-1930." *The Filson Club History Quarterly*, 64 (July 1990), 384-400.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](http://spider.georgetowncollege.edu/htallant/border/bs10/fr-robie.htm).

This page was last updated on 3/24/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

A SENSE OF PERMANENCY: THE COMMONWEALTH FUND AND THE RUTHERFORD HOSPITAL AND HEALTH CENTER, 1926-1940

Carroll Van West
Middle Tennessee State University

In 1924, the Commonwealth Fund of New York established model public health projects in four different American communities, one of which was in Rutherford County, Tennessee. The purpose was to show how powerful national foundations could successfully work with state and local governments and private individuals to reshape basic community institutions.^{[1](#)}

The Fund, founded in 1918 by Anna Harkness, the wife of one of Rockefeller's original partners in Standard Oil Company, and her son Edward S. Harkness, sought the establishment of an interlocking public health delivery system which would include a hospital, an outpatient clinic, a laboratory, and a public health center. Even though this plan had encountered serious roadblocks in New York, Fund director Barry C. Smith still believed in its potential. Because of its proximity to major medical centers, its already existing local programs, and its general racial and economic characteristics, Rutherford County, Tennessee, was chosen for four rural health projects, beginning in 1924 and lasting for five years.^{[2](#)} Despite initial community resistance, the child health demonstration unit eventually found substantial success in Rutherford by using school-based programs to serve "as a reasonable entering wedge" to put the reformers directly in touch with rural families.^{[3](#)}

The inadequacy of medical facilities was one impediment to success. The demonstration project discovered that a small downtown Murfreesboro office and classroom visits did not provide the necessary delivery system for meaningful health service. Director Dr. Harry S. Mustard especially needed proper laboratory facilities. When Fund general director Barry Smith inspected the new Rutherford project, he gave Mustard approval to pursue the possibility of a local hospital.^{[4](#)}

Over the next year Mustard quickly gained the support of Simeon Christy of the local Red Cross and leaders of the city government and medical community. Observers from the Fund also emphasized the need for a modern lab and hospital facilities.^{[5](#)} "Dr. Gulbrandsen, during one of the preschool conferences held in a rural negro school, was obliged to let pass two cases of somewhat-well-advanced tuberculosis and several cases of serious tonsil and adenoid difficulties. She advised the mothers as well as she could, but beyond that had no solution to offer" because of the county's lack of long-term care facilities.^{[6](#)}

In the summer of 1925, the Commonwealth Fund decided to completely fund the construction of the Rutherford Hospital at a cost of \$161,620, largely, as the local newspaper noted, "to give efficiency to the Child Health Demonstration work so successfully carried on here."^{[7](#)} The hospital was chartered as a private corporation, directed by a representative lay board composed primarily of local physicians and civic leaders. The presence of local citizens assured the community that its interests would be well represented and served; otherwise, town

people might have resented the goals and operation of the hospital and would never provide the necessary long-term financial support.⁸

The construction of the new hospital came at a particularly opportune moment. It opened at approximately the same time the Fund abandoned its original "top-down" organizational plan in favor of a "bottom-up" reliance on neighborhood health committees. Local business, civic, and medical leaders viewed the hospital as such a crucial professional and economic tool that their support for the Fund was solidified and few questioned the Fund's new organizational strategy.

Acceptance of the new institution by the local business and political elite is partially documented by the elaborate ceremonies and receptions scheduled for the official opening of the hospital in May 1927. The main speakers were Dr. William D. Haggard of Vanderbilt University (a former American Medical Association president) and Dr. Harry Mustard of the demonstration unit. Both emphasized the gift of modern technology represented by the new hospital.⁹

Another indication of local acceptance is provided by the many testimonial advertisements published in the local newspaper in which local businesses and contractors bragged about their contributions to the new building. The Commonwealth Fund had wisely chosen a local firm, Maugans-Bell, to construct the building and the contractors, in turn, had picked mostly local sub-contractors and suppliers.

Looking back at the Commonwealth Fund's rural hospital program, Henry J. Southmayd and Geddes Smith remarked that in most towns the new hospitals were the biggest events since the coming of the railroad in the nineteenth century. Indeed, local writers in Rutherford County expressed great pride and excitement about the arrival of the latest in medical science and technology in words that were reminiscent of the embrace of railroad technology documented in the work of John Stilgoe.¹⁰

The remarks of Dr. Haggard even compared the new hospital to another institution often associated with the railroad corridor, the grand hotel.¹¹ In fact, the new hospital's Colonial Revival architecture further enhanced the hospital's reputation among the elite of Murfreesboro, who had been critical of the construction of a new post office in Italian Renaissance style. Much more pleasing to local sensibilities were the properly "imposing" Classical Revival buildings at the recently completed Middle Tennessee Normal College. The hospital project was a first for the Commonwealth Fund and was supervised, in part, by Henry J. Southmayd, who became director of the Fund's famous Rural Hospital Division upon its creation in 1925. Southmayd's program built hospitals in needy communities throughout the country, while setting design standards that many hospitals would follow once public money became increasingly available by mid-century. Rutherford Hospital was an early test of model rural hospital design.¹²

The architects were Robert C. Berlin (1851-1937) and Percy W. Swern (1887-1946), who had formed a Chicago-based firm in 1919. The initial Berlin and Swern design was for a two-and-a-half story hospital of forty beds, with its long center section flanked by two end wings. This functional floor plan centralized service facilities at the junction of the center section with the wings. The first floor held patient wards, administrative offices, and a large lobby/waiting room while the second floor had the operating room, additional patient wards, and the delivery ward. The basement was for the laboratory, storage rooms, physical plant, and kitchen. On the south end of the building was a two-story sun porch so patients could spend time outdoors on pleasant days. Yet Rutherford Hospital did not prove to be a model design for most other Commonwealth Fund-supported hospitals built from 1927 to 1944.¹³

The hospital made a strong statement in favor of modern medical practice and technology; yet Commonwealth Fund officials were always at pains to emphasize that this technological intrusion into the lives of Rutherford Countians was under local control, not that of the medical experts. The local board of directors, stressed Mustard, had full responsibility for the employment and administration of the institution. Everyday operations, however, remained under the jurisdiction of the hospital superintendent. The first was Mary F. Petitte, R.N., P.H.N., a New York native handpicked by the Commonwealth Fund. Her role was to guarantee that the hospital serve not only the local physicians but also the demonstration program. The superintendent, according to two hospital experts for the Commonwealth Fund, "sets the tone of the hospital, keeps the balance between physicians, and interprets the whole process to the board of directors."¹⁴

The demonstration program ended in January 1929, and Dr. Mustard submitted a full report lauding its success to the Commonwealth Fund. "Very striking results have been attained in the lowering of the death rates among mothers and infants," reported the *Murfreesboro Home Journal* in June 1930. With the assistance of the Commonwealth Fund, the county's health care program had evolved into one of statewide importance. In 1929, the nursing school at Vanderbilt University provided student nurses for fieldwork and clinic activities. Student nurses spent a ten-week summer internship in Murfreesboro, learning practical knowledge of the public health field. Students from the Vanderbilt Medical School as well as the Meharry Medical School in Nashville also came for public health training. The next year, the State Department of Health began to use Rutherford County personnel as trainers in its Field Technical Unit helping other counties create viable public health programs. In 1930 a report from the American Public Health Association showed that the Rutherford County public health program received the highest score of any rural county in the nation; the hospital, in turn, received the highest ranking in its category from the American College of Physicians and Surgeons.¹⁵

Commonwealth Fund general director Barry Smith was pleased with the hospital's contribution to the successful Rutherford demonstration project. Yet the community still lacked a permanent public health center--another component of the delivery system found in the earlier New York State health plan admired by Smith. In June 1930 the Commonwealth Fund's Division of Rural Hospitals appropriated \$75,000 for a modern public health facility to be built in Murfreesboro, and granted an additional \$15,000 for improvements at Rutherford Hospital. The Fund also fully equipped and furnished the new Health Center. Like the hospital, the new center was an outright gift to the people of Rutherford County. Once again a local Board of Directors administered the building's operations and supervised the new health department's activities; Simeon Christy of the local Red Cross became chairman of the board.¹⁶

At the dedication of the new Health Department on October 5, 1931, Commonwealth Fund director Smith explained why the Fund had lavished so much time and money--by now the amount was estimated at \$500,000--on Rutherford County. This community, Smith emphasized, presented "an opportunity for the development of a rural public health program which would be outstanding in the United States and which would naturally and of necessity be of tremendous educational value to other communities."¹⁷

Unlike the basic functionalism of the earlier hospital, the health center's design spoke to its dual mission in medical reform and education. The first floor center lobby, entered by either the front or rear door, served as a reception area. Neatly detailed with paneled wooden wainscoting and a cast iron Colonial Revival gate, which divided the lobby in half, the lobby split the first floor into two spaces. The south wing contained the clinic itself. In keeping with the Commonwealth Foundation's tradition of working for southern reform without directly challenging segregation, as well as strictly adhering to the "separate but equal" doctrine of *Plessy v. Ferguson* (1896), this area contained restrooms for whites and blacks that were separate but equal in size and facilities. (Interestingly, the

building had no segregated waiting room.) Then came matching examination rooms with small dressing cubicles dividing these rooms from the clinic rooms at the end of the hallway. The north wing contained offices for nurses, administrators, and the public health officer along with a small clinic laboratory.

To Fund officials, the most important space came on the second floor, where a large public auditorium, designed for public meetings, health seminars, and training sessions, was located. A Commonwealth Fund report in 1935 emphasized that Rutherford County was one of the few rural places in the nation that provided "the opportunity to see a well-conceived and carefully administered health service functioning in the field." Indeed by 1938, the Health Department would train almost one thousand health officers, nurses, and medical students from throughout the nation and many foreign countries. The second floor also contained a library along with two rooms for sanitary officers and health officers in training.^{[18](#)}

The architect of the Rutherford Health Center was James Gamble Rogers (1867-1947) for the partnership of Pelton and Rogers of New York City. A graduate of Yale in 1889, Rogers first studied and practiced architecture under the watchful eye of LeBaron Jenney in Chicago. Rogers began his formal architectural training in the Paris atelier of Paul Blondel, whose students worked in the classical tradition. Rogers designed a family home--later the headquarters for the Commonwealth Fund--for the Harkness family, and other buildings commissioned by them, including the great majority of the clinics and hospitals of the Fund's Division of Rural Hospitals.^{[19](#)}

Although the design of the health center came from an architect of national significance, the Commonwealth Fund once again placated local interests by using area contractors. Ralph Stephens of Murfreesboro served as the architects' on-site superintendent; Bell Brothers and Company of Nashville was the general contractor. W. W. Rion & Son of Murfreesboro carried out the property's landscaping, which featured, in true Colonial Revival style, a row of boxwoods from the front door to the sidewalk.^{[20](#)}

The health center, together with the earlier hospital, gave a sense of permanency to the progressive effort for public health reform in a typical Southern community. By 1939, for example, Rutherford County scored 773 points out of a possible 1,000 on the public health program ratings of the American Public Health Association. In 1924, when the child demonstration project began, the county's rating only reached 90 points. The Rutherford County model moved as well to other Tennessee communities, such as Gibson County and Sumner County.^{[21](#)}

After World War II, the Rutherford Health Department expanded its service into dental hygiene, creating an office out of part of the second floor auditorium. The altered use of this room signified that the center's significance as a training ground for Tennessee public health professionals was over. The department, by now, had ended its earlier reliance on the Commonwealth Fund for continued financial and professional support; its funding came largely from local sources and that constituency increasingly dominated the attention of the health center's staff. After Congressional approval of the Hill-Burton Act in 1946, which provided federal assistance for the construction of local hospitals and health centers, the Commonwealth Fund discontinued its divisions of public health and rural hospitals. The hospital and health center in Rutherford County received their last monies in 1947. A chapter in the partnership between private foundations and the development of the American health system was closed.^{[22](#)}

The Rutherford Hospital and Health Department were the first buildings in the nation to be built by a private foundation specifically for a rural community's public health program. Their success, however, was predicated on the earlier child health demonstration project which had paved the way for a wider community acceptance of outside institutions. The neighborhood health committees, working through the schools and directly with families, gave rural people greater confidence in modern medicine. Without that confidence and willingness to accept the

advice of doctors and nurses, far fewer rural people would have used the services of the new hospital and health center.²³ Once established and accepted, the hospital and health center provided the physical infrastructure for the state's first showcase in rural public health, serving as a training ground for an entire generation of southern public health officers, doctors, and nurses.

Notes

1. E. Richard Brown, *Rockefeller Medicine Men: Medicine and Capitalism in America* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979), 8.
2. Waldemar A. Nielsen, *The Big Foundations* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1972), 254-256; Mary S. Hoffschwelle, "Rebuilding the Rural Southern Community: Reformers, Schools, and Homes in Tennessee, 1914-1929," Diss, Vanderbilt University, 1993, 341-385; Robert Ransom, "The History of Medicine in Rutherford County, Tennessee," *Rutherford County Historical Society Publications* 24 (Winter 1985): 190-97; W. Frank Walker, *Ten Years of Rural Health Work: Rutherford County, Tennessee. 1924-1933* (New York: Commonwealth Fund, 1935), 4-7.
3. William Link, *The Paradox of Southern Progressivism, 1880-1930* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1992), 290-291; Dr. Harry Mustard, "Annual Report, Child Health Demonstration, Murfreesboro, Rutherford County, Tennessee, January 1st to September 1st, 1924," Commonwealth Fund Archives, Child Health Demonstration series, Rockefeller Archives Center, North Tarrytown, NY. Hereinafter cited as Commonwealth Fund Papers; Nielsen, 256; W. Frank Walker and Carolina R. Randolph, *Influence of a Public Health Program on a Rural Community: Fifteen Years in Rutherford County, Tennessee, 1924-1938* (New York: Commonwealth Fund, 1940), 63.
4. Dr. Harry Mustard to Courtney Dinwiddie, Memorandum, June 10, 1924, Commonwealth Fund Papers; Ransom, "Rutherford County Medicine," 212-13.
5. Rosemary Stevens, *In Sickness and In Wealth: American Hospitals in the Twentieth Century* (New York: Basic Books, 1989), 124.
6. "Memorandum of Mr. Dinwiddie's Visit to the Rutherford County Child Health Demonstration, May 5-6, 1924," Commonwealth Fund Papers; "Memorandum re Visit to Murfreesboro Child Health Demonstration," [1924], Commonwealth Fund Papers, 4.
7. *Murfreesboro News Banner*, April 13, 1927.
8. Ibid., May 2, 1927.
9. Ibid.
10. Henry J. Southmayd and Geddes Smith, *Small Community Hospitals* (New York: Commonwealth Fund, 1944), 8; John R. Stilgoe, *Metropolitan Corridor: Railroads and the American Scene, 1880-1930* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1983).

11. *Murfreesboro News Banner*, May 2, 1927.
12. Correspondence concerning the new post office, February 4, 1909 to January 4, 1910, Tennessee Room Collection, Linebaugh Library, Murfreesboro; *Murfreesboro News Banner*, April 27, May 2, 1927.
13. Henry F. and Elsie R. Withey, *Biographical Dictionary of American Architects (Deceased)* (Los Angeles: Hennessey & Ingalls, Inc., 1970 [1956]), 54, 587; Southmayd and Smith, 105-122.
14. *Murfreesboro News Banner*, April 16, May 2, 1927; Southmayd and Smith, 16-17, 54-58.
15. *Murfreesboro Home Journal*, June 17, 1930; Harry S. Mustard, *Cross-Sections of Rural Health Progress: Report of the Commonwealth Fund Child Health Demonstration in Rutherford County, Tennessee, 1924-1928* (New York: Commonwealth Fund, 1930), 20-23; Walker and Randolph, 47-54; *Murfreesboro Daily News Journal*, April 6, 1952.
16. History Files, Office of Public Health Officer, Rutherford Health Center, Murfreesboro, TN; *Murfreesboro Home Journal*, June 17, November 21, 1930; *Murfreesboro Daily News Journal*, October 5, 1931; Ramson, 206-208; Walker and Randolph, 54.
17. *Murfreesboro Daily News Journal*, October 5, 1931, p. 6.; *Murfreesboro Home Journal*, December 12, 1930.
18. The original blueprints are in History File, Office of Public Health Officer, Rutherford Health Center; the floorplans are also copied in Walker, 59-60; quote is from Walker, 57.
19. Paul V. Turner, *Campus: An American Planning Tradition* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1984), 238-41; Marcus Whiffen and Frederick Koeper, *American Architecture*, Vol. 2: *1860-1976* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1981), 289; Eugene J. Johnson and Robert D. Russell, Jr., *Memphis: An Architectural Guide* (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1990), 62, 72, 203; Withey, *Biographical Dictionary*, 465-66, 522-23.
20. History Files, Office of Public Health Officer, Rutherford Health Center; "Rutherford Health Center," National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form, Tennessee Historical Commission, Nashville, 1992.
21. *Murfreesboro Daily News Journal*, April 6, 1952; Ransom, 218; Frederick Culp and Mrs. R. E. Ross, *Gibson County, Past and Present* (Trenton: Gibson County Historical Society, 1961), 317; Walter T. Durham and James W. Thomas, *A Pictorial History of Sumner County, Tennessee, 1876-1986* (Gallatin: Sumner County Historical Society, 1986), 21, 33.
22. History Files, Office of Public Health Officer, Rutherford Health Center; interview with Dr. Robert Sanders and Polly (Mrs. A. B.) Buckner, December 1991; John Duffy, *The Sanitarians: A History of American Public Health* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1990), 278-79; Nielsen, 257-58.
23. Mary S. Hoffschwelle, "Organizing Rural Communities for Change: The Commonwealth Fund Child Health Demonstration in Rutherford County, 1923-1927," *Tennessee Historical Quarterly* 53 (Fall 1994).

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.
Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).
This page was last updated on 3/24/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by
Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075
E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu



Border States: Journal of the Kentucky-Tennessee American Studies Association, [No. 10](#)
(1995)

A SENSE OF PERMANENCY: THE COMMONWEALTH FUND AND THE RUTHERFORD HOSPITAL AND HEALTH CENTER, 1926-1940

Carroll Van West
Middle Tennessee State University

In 1924, the Commonwealth Fund of New York established model public health projects in four different American communities, one of which was in Rutherford County, Tennessee. The purpose was to show how powerful national foundations could successfully work with state and local governments and private individuals to reshape basic community institutions.^{[1](#)}

The Fund, founded in 1918 by Anna Harkness, the wife of one of Rockefeller's original partners in Standard Oil Company, and her son Edward S. Harkness, sought the establishment of an interlocking public health delivery system which would include a hospital, an outpatient clinic, a laboratory, and a public health center. Even though this plan had encountered serious roadblocks in New York, Fund director Barry C. Smith still believed in its potential. Because of its proximity to major medical centers, its already existing local programs, and its general racial and economic characteristics, Rutherford County, Tennessee, was chosen for four rural health projects, beginning in 1924 and lasting for five years.^{[2](#)} Despite initial community resistance, the child health demonstration unit eventually found substantial success in Rutherford by using school-based programs to serve "as a reasonable entering wedge" to put the reformers directly in touch with rural families.^{[3](#)}

The inadequacy of medical facilities was one impediment to success. The demonstration project discovered that a small downtown Murfreesboro office and classroom visits did not provide the necessary delivery system for meaningful health service. Director Dr. Harry S. Mustard especially needed proper laboratory facilities. When Fund general director Barry Smith inspected the new Rutherford project, he gave Mustard approval to pursue the possibility of a local hospital.^{[4](#)}

Over the next year Mustard quickly gained the support of Simeon Christy of the local Red Cross and leaders of the city government and medical community. Observers from the Fund also emphasized the need for a modern lab and

hospital facilities.⁵ "Dr. Gulbrandsen, during one of the preschool conferences held in a rural negro school, was obliged to let pass two cases of somewhat-well-advanced tuberculosis and several cases of serious tonsil and adenoid difficulties. She advised the mothers as well as she could, but beyond that had no solution to offer" because of the county's lack of long-term care facilities.⁶

In the summer of 1925, the Commonwealth Fund decided to completely fund the construction of the Rutherford Hospital at a cost of \$161,620, largely, as the local newspaper noted, "to give efficiency to the Child Health Demonstration work so successfully carried on here."⁷ The hospital was chartered as a private corporation, directed by a representative lay board composed primarily of local physicians and civic leaders. The presence of local citizens assured the community that its interests would be well represented and served; otherwise, town people might have resented the goals and operation of the hospital and would never provide the necessary long-term financial support.⁸

The construction of the new hospital came at a particularly opportune moment. It opened at approximately the same time the Fund abandoned its original "top-down" organizational plan in favor of a "bottom-up" reliance on neighborhood health committees. Local business, civic, and medical leaders viewed the hospital as such a crucial professional and economic tool that their support for the Fund was solidified and few questioned the Fund's new organizational strategy.

Acceptance of the new institution by the local business and political elite is partially documented by the elaborate ceremonies and receptions scheduled for the official opening of the hospital in May 1927. The main speakers were Dr. William D. Haggard of Vanderbilt University (a former American Medical Association president) and Dr. Harry Mustard of the demonstration unit. Both emphasized the gift of modern technology represented by the new hospital.⁹

Another indication of local acceptance is provided by the many testimonial advertisements published in the local newspaper in which local businesses and contractors bragged about their contributions to the new building. The Commonwealth Fund had wisely chosen a local firm, Maugans-Bell, to construct the building and the contractors, in turn, had picked mostly local sub-contractors and suppliers.

Looking back at the Commonwealth Fund's rural hospital program, Henry J. Southmayd and Geddes Smith remarked that in most towns the new hospitals were the biggest events since the coming of the railroad in the nineteenth century. Indeed, local writers in Rutherford County expressed great pride and excitement about the arrival of the latest in medical science and technology in words that were reminiscent of the embrace of railroad technology documented in the work of John Stilgoe.¹⁰

The remarks of Dr. Haggard even compared the new hospital to another institution often associated with the railroad corridor, the grand hotel.¹¹ In fact, the new hospital's Colonial Revival architecture further enhanced the hospital's reputation among the elite of Murfreesboro, who had been critical of the construction of a new post office in Italian Renaissance style. Much more pleasing to local sensibilities were the properly "imposing" Classical Revival buildings at the recently completed Middle Tennessee Normal College. The hospital project was a first for the Commonwealth Fund and was supervised, in part, by Henry J. Southmayd, who became director of the Fund's famous Rural Hospital Division upon its creation in 1925. Southmayd's program built hospitals in needy communities throughout the country, while setting design standards that many hospitals would follow once public money became increasingly available by mid-century. Rutherford Hospital was an early test of model rural hospital design.¹²

The architects were Robert C. Berlin (1851-1937) and Percy W. Swern (1887-1946), who had formed a Chicago-based firm in 1919. The initial Berlin and Swern design was for a two-and-a-half story hospital of forty beds, with its long center section flanked by two end wings. This functional floor plan centralized service facilities at the junction of the center section with the wings. The first floor held patient wards, administrative offices, and a large lobby/waiting room while the second floor had the operating room, additional patient wards, and the delivery ward. The basement was for the laboratory, storage rooms, physical plant, and kitchen. On the south end of the building was a two-story sun porch so patients could spend time outdoors on pleasant days. Yet Rutherford Hospital did not prove to be a model design for most other Commonwealth Fund-supported hospitals built from 1927 to 1944.^{[13](#)}

The hospital made a strong statement in favor of modern medical practice and technology; yet Commonwealth Fund officials were always at pains to emphasize that this technological intrusion into the lives of Rutherford Countians was under local control, not that of the medical experts. The local board of directors, stressed Mustard, had full responsibility for the employment and administration of the institution. Everyday operations, however, remained under the jurisdiction of the hospital superintendent. The first was Mary F. Petite, R.N., P.H.N, a New York native handpicked by the Commonwealth Fund. Her role was to guarantee that the hospital serve not only the local physicians but also the demonstration program. The superintendent, according to two hospital experts for the Commonwealth Fund, "sets the tone of the hospital, keeps the balance between physicians, and interprets the whole process to the board of directors."^{[14](#)}

The demonstration program ended in January 1929, and Dr. Mustard submitted a full report lauding its success to the Commonwealth Fund. "Very striking results have been attained in the lowering of the death rates among mothers and infants," reported the *Murfreesboro Home Journal* in June 1930. With the assistance of the Commonwealth Fund, the county's health care program had evolved into one of statewide importance. In 1929, the nursing school at Vanderbilt University provided student nurses for fieldwork and clinic activities. Student nurses spent a ten-week summer internship in Murfreesboro, learning practical knowledge of the public health field. Students from the Vanderbilt Medical School as well as the Meharry Medical School in Nashville also came for public health training. The next year, the State Department of Health began to use Rutherford County personnel as trainers in its Field Technical Unit helping other counties create viable public health programs. In 1930 a report from the American Public Health Association showed that the Rutherford County public health program received the highest score of any rural county in the nation; the hospital, in turn, received the highest ranking in its category from the American College of Physicians and Surgeons.^{[15](#)}

Commonwealth Fund general director Barry Smith was pleased with the hospital's contribution to the successful Rutherford demonstration project. Yet the community still lacked a permanent public health center--another component of the delivery system found in the earlier New York State health plan admired by Smith. In June 1930 the Commonwealth Fund's Division of Rural Hospitals appropriated \$75,000 for a modern public health facility to be built in Murfreesboro, and granted an additional \$15,000 for improvements at Rutherford Hospital. The Fund also fully equipped and furnished the new Health Center. Like the hospital, the new center was an outright gift to the people of Rutherford County. Once again a local Board of Directors administered the building's operations and supervised the new health department's activities; Simeon Christy of the local Red Cross became chairman of the board.^{[16](#)}

At the dedication of the new Health Department on October 5, 1931, Commonwealth Fund director Smith explained why the Fund had lavished so much time and money--by now the amount was estimated at \$500,000--on

Rutherford County. This community, Smith emphasized, presented "an opportunity for the development of a rural public health program which would be outstanding in the United States and which would naturally and of necessity be of tremendous educational value to other communities."¹⁷

Unlike the basic functionalism of the earlier hospital, the health center's design spoke to its dual mission in medical reform and education. The first floor center lobby, entered by either the front or rear door, served as a reception area. Neatly detailed with paneled wooden wainscoting and a cast iron Colonial Revival gate, which divided the lobby in half, the lobby split the first floor into two spaces. The south wing contained the clinic itself. In keeping with the Commonwealth Foundation's tradition of working for southern reform without directly challenging segregation, as well as strictly adhering to the "separate but equal" doctrine of *Plessy v. Ferguson* (1896), this area contained restrooms for whites and blacks that were separate but equal in size and facilities. (Interestingly, the building had no segregated waiting room.) Then came matching examination rooms with small dressing cubicles dividing these rooms from the clinic rooms at the end of the hallway. The north wing contained offices for nurses, administrators, and the public health officer along with a small clinic laboratory.

To Fund officials, the most important space came on the second floor, where a large public auditorium, designed for public meetings, health seminars, and training sessions, was located. A Commonwealth Fund report in 1935 emphasized that Rutherford County was one of the few rural places in the nation that provided "the opportunity to see a well-conceived and carefully administered health service functioning in the field." Indeed by 1938, the Health Department would train almost one thousand health officers, nurses, and medical students from throughout the nation and many foreign countries. The second floor also contained a library along with two rooms for sanitary officers and health officers in training.¹⁸

The architect of the Rutherford Health Center was James Gamble Rogers (1867-1947) for the partnership of Pelton and Rogers of New York City. A graduate of Yale in 1889, Rogers first studied and practiced architecture under the watchful eye of LeBaron Jenney in Chicago. Rogers began his formal architectural training in the Paris atelier of Paul Blondel, whose students worked in the classical tradition. Rogers designed a family home--later the headquarters for the Commonwealth Fund--for the Harkness family, and other buildings commissioned by them, including the great majority of the clinics and hospitals of the Fund's Division of Rural Hospitals.¹⁹

Although the design of the health center came from an architect of national significance, the Commonwealth Fund once again placated local interests by using area contractors. Ralph Stephens of Murfreesboro served as the architects' on-site superintendent; Bell Brothers and Company of Nashville was the general contractor. W. W. Rion & Son of Murfreesboro carried out the property's landscaping, which featured, in true Colonial Revival style, a row of boxwoods from the front door to the sidewalk.²⁰

The health center, together with the earlier hospital, gave a sense of permanency to the progressive effort for public health reform in a typical Southern community. By 1939, for example, Rutherford County scored 773 points out of a possible 1,000 on the public health program ratings of the American Public Health Association. In 1924, when the child demonstration project began, the county's rating only reached 90 points. The Rutherford County model moved as well to other Tennessee communities, such as Gibson County and Sumner County.²¹

After World War II, the Rutherford Health Department expanded its service into dental hygiene, creating an office out of part of the second floor auditorium. The altered use of this room signified that the center's significance as a training ground for Tennessee public health professionals was over. The department, by now, had ended its earlier reliance on the Commonwealth Fund for continued financial and professional support; its funding came largely

from local sources and that constituency increasingly dominated the attention of the health center's staff. After Congressional approval of the Hill-Burton Act in 1946, which provided federal assistance for the construction of local hospitals and health centers, the Commonwealth Fund discontinued its divisions of public health and rural hospitals. The hospital and health center in Rutherford County received their last monies in 1947. A chapter in the partnership between private foundations and the development of the American health system was closed.²²

The Rutherford Hospital and Health Department were the first buildings in the nation to be built by a private foundation specifically for a rural community's public health program. Their success, however, was predicated on the earlier child health demonstration project which had paved the way for a wider community acceptance of outside institutions. The neighborhood health committees, working through the schools and directly with families, gave rural people greater confidence in modern medicine. Without that confidence and willingness to accept the advice of doctors and nurses, far fewer rural people would have used the services of the new hospital and health center.²³ Once established and accepted, the hospital and health center provided the physical infrastructure for the state's first showcase in rural public health, serving as a training ground for an entire generation of southern public health officers, doctors, and nurses.

Notes

1. E. Richard Brown, *Rockefeller Medicine Men: Medicine and Capitalism in America* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979), 8.
2. Waldemar A. Nielsen, *The Big Foundations* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1972), 254-256; Mary S. Hoffschwelle, "Rebuilding the Rural Southern Community: Reformers, Schools, and Homes in Tennessee, 1914-1929," Diss, Vanderbilt University, 1993, 341-385; Robert Ransom, "The History of Medicine in Rutherford County, Tennessee," *Rutherford County Historical Society Publications* 24 (Winter 1985): 190-97; W. Frank Walker, *Ten Years of Rural Health Work: Rutherford County, Tennessee, 1924-1933* (New York: Commonwealth Fund, 1935), 4-7.
3. William Link, *The Paradox of Southern Progressivism, 1880-1930* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1992), 290-291; Dr. Harry Mustard, "Annual Report, Child Health Demonstration, Murfreesboro, Rutherford County, Tennessee, January 1st to September 1st, 1924," Commonwealth Fund Archives, Child Health Demonstration series, Rockefeller Archives Center, North Tarrytown, NY. Hereinafter cited as Commonwealth Fund Papers; Nielsen, 256; W. Frank Walker and Carolina R. Randolph, *Influence of a Public Health Program on a Rural Community: Fifteen Years in Rutherford County, Tennessee, 1924-1938* (New York: Commonwealth Fund, 1940), 63.
4. Dr. Harry Mustard to Courtney Dinwiddie, Memorandum, June 10, 1924, Commonwealth Fund Papers; Ransom, "Rutherford County Medicine," 212-13.
5. Rosemary Stevens, *In Sickness and In Wealth: American Hospitals in the Twentieth Century* (New York: Basic Books, 1989), 124.
6. "Memorandum of Mr. Dinwiddie's Visit to the Rutherford County Child Health Demonstration, May 5-6, 1924," Commonwealth Fund Papers; "Memorandum re Visit to Murfreesboro Child Health Demonstration," [1924], Commonwealth Fund Papers, 4.

7. *Murfreesboro News Banner*, April 13, 1927.
8. Ibid., May 2, 1927.
9. Ibid.
10. Henry J. Southmayd and Geddes Smith, *Small Community Hospitals* (New York: Commonwealth Fund, 1944), 8; John R. Stilgoe, *Metropolitan Corridor: Railroads and the American Scene, 1880-1930* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1983).
11. *Murfreesboro News Banner*, May 2, 1927.
12. Correspondence concerning the new post office, February 4, 1909 to January 4, 1910, Tennessee Room Collection, Linebaugh Library, Murfreesboro; *Murfreesboro News Banner*, April 27, May 2, 1927.
13. Henry F. and Elsie R. Withey, *Biographical Dictionary of American Architects (Deceased)* (Los Angeles: Hennessey & Ingalls, Inc., 1970 [1956]), 54, 587; Southmayd and Smith, 105-122.
14. *Murfreesboro News Banner*, April 16, May 2, 1927; Southmayd and Smith, 16-17, 54-58.
15. *Murfreesboro Home Journal*, June 17, 1930; Harry S. Mustard, *Cross-Sections of Rural Health Progress: Report of the Commonwealth Fund Child Health Demonstration in Rutherford County, Tennessee, 1924-1928* (New York: Commonwealth Fund, 1930), 20-23; Walker and Randolph, 47-54; *Murfreesboro Daily News Journal*, April 6, 1952.
16. History Files, Office of Public Health Officer, Rutherford Health Center, Murfreesboro, TN; *Murfreesboro Home Journal*, June 17, November 21, 1930; *Murfreesboro Daily News Journal*, October 5, 1931; Ramson, 206-208; Walker and Randolph, 54.
17. *Murfreesboro Daily News Journal*, October 5, 1931, p. 6.; *Murfreesboro Home Journal*, December 12, 1930.
18. The original blueprints are in History File, Office of Public Health Officer, Rutherford Health Center; the floorplans are also copied in Walker, 59-60; quote is from Walker, 57.
19. Paul V. Turner, *Campus: An American Planning Tradition* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1984), 238-41; Marcus Whiffen and Frederick Koeper, *American Architecture*, Vol. 2: *1860-1976* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1981), 289; Eugene J. Johnson and Robert D. Russell, Jr., *Memphis: An Architectural Guide* (Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1990), 62, 72, 203; Withey, *Biographical Dictionary*, 465-66, 522-23.
20. History Files, Office of Public Health Officer, Rutherford Health Center; "Rutherford Health Center," National Register of Historic Places Nomination Form, Tennessee Historical Commission, Nashville, 1992.
21. *Murfreesboro Daily News Journal*, April 6, 1952; Ransom, 218; Frederick Culp and Mrs. R. E. Ross, *Gibson County, Past and Present* (Trenton: Gibson County Historical Society, 1961), 317; Walter T. Durham and James W. Thomas, *A Pictorial History of Sumner County, Tennessee, 1876-1986* (Gallatin: Sumner County Historical

Society, 1986), 21, 33.

22. History Files, Office of Public Health Officer, Rutherford Health Center; interview with Dr. Robert Sanders and Polly (Mrs. A. B.) Buckner, December 1991; John Duffy, *The Sanitarians: A History of American Public Health* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1990), 278-79; Nielsen, 257-58.

23. Mary S. Hoffschwelle, "Organizing Rural Communities for Change: The Commonwealth Fund Child Health Demonstration in Rutherford County, 1923-1927," *Tennessee Historical Quarterly* 53 (Fall 1994).

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 3/24/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College

400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

CATHOLICISM AND COMMUNITY: MOUNTAIN MISSIONS AND "NEW" IMMIGRANTS IN APPALACHIA

Margaret Ripley Wolfe
East Tennessee State University

"Stand at Cumberland Gap and watch the procession of civilization, marching single file," wrote Frederick Jackson Turner, the eminent historian of the eighteenth-century American Trans-Allegheny frontier; "the buffalo following the trail to the salt springs, the Indian, the fur-trader and hunter, the cattle-raiser, the pioneer farmer--and the frontier is passed."¹ Even as Turner penned these very words, the region around the famous gap, in rugged mountain terrain where the borders of Kentucky, Tennessee, and Virginia merge, was experiencing a new frontier. "Stand at Cumberland Gap" in the late nineteenth century and again "watch the procession of civilization, marching single file"--surveyors, geologists, railroad men, coal operators, and journalists; "fetched-on" women,² moonshiners, Catholic priests, and Protestant missionaries; southern blacks, the native mountain whites, and the foreign-born--Italians and Hungarians as well as an assortment of other ethnic groups.³ Southern Appalachia at the turn of the twentieth century was not a melting pot, but it was an ethnic smorgasbord. For approximately four decades, this region, historically somewhat irreligious but nonetheless susceptible to evangelical Protestantism, witnessed a significant Catholic presence.

During the 1880s, capitalists, largely from the northeastern United States and sometimes in league with local entrepreneurs, launched systematic exploitation of mineral resources in the mountains of eastern Tennessee, southwest Virginia, eastern Kentucky, and parts of West Virginia.⁴ The marketing of coal from the newly opened mines and coke from the beehive-style ovens required a transportation system to link the Appalachian wilderness with the American Midwest and East Coast. The advent of the mining industry in the region sparked extensive railroad construction, which, without sophisticated earth-moving equipment, made brutal demands on human labor. From the perspective of the capitalists, the grueling, dangerous work of railroad construction, coke-drawing, and mining seemed ready-made for immigrants. Coincidentally and advantageously for developers operating in Southern Appalachia, southern and eastern Europe flooded the United States with millions of newcomers during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.⁵

The transformation that began around Cumberland Gap during the late 1880s was much in keeping with development throughout the region. "In 1888, the hamlet of Cumberland Gap . . . was an isolated and lonely spot in the heart of the Cumberland Mountains . . . thirteen miles from a railroad," wrote one observer, Alexander A. Arthur. A Scotch-Canadian and a distant relative of United States President Chester A. Arthur, Alexander Arthur enlisted the support of British investors and organized The American Association, Limited. This company linked the gap to the outside world by rail, built the town of Middlesboro, Kentucky, and established the nearby residential suburb of Harrogate, Tennessee, before suffering major financial setbacks during the depression of the 1890s.⁶

The gigantic undertaking required hundreds of laborers to alter the face of the land. Blacks, Italians, and native

whites worked like the devil during the day and raised hell at night. Conditions resembled those of a "frontier town or gold-rush settlement in the Far West," wrote Charles Blanton Roberts, Arthur's secretary. Large numbers carried pistols; "killings were common, and not infrequently several men would fall in a single fight." On Virginia soil near the intersection of the three states lay "Hell's Half Acre," marked by drinking, gambling, carousing, and debauchery.⁷ Construction camps seemed even rowdier than settled mining communities where coal operators discouraged the use of alcohol and attempted to maintain order, but drinking, fights, and killings were fairly commonplace all the same. Paydays, Saturday nights, and special holidays including the ethnic observances usually produced a rash of property destruction, personal injuries, and even deaths.

From the 1880s through the 1910s, thousands of immigrants found their way into the remote mining and construction camps of Southern Appalachia. Just off the boat, unable to speak English, anxious for work, and ignorant of their destination, they often fell easy prey to labor agents--usually of their own ethnic background--who promised them steady employment and regular pay. Once in the Southern Appalachians, they were cut off from the ethnic enclaves of the large northeastern and midwestern cities that have generally been regarded by immigration historians as highly valuable in the assimilation process.⁸ Their numbers were relatively sparse compared to the teeming neighborhoods of large urban areas, and the sense of alienation was exacerbated by the isolation and remoteness of industrial outposts in the southern mountains. Furthermore, the single males or males without their families who comprised a significant proportion of foreign-born workers proved highly transient.⁹

While there were some Protestants among the "new" immigrants in the Appalachian region, for many of them the one familiar institution was the Catholic Church. Mountain missions maintained principally by German priests of the Benedictine order from St. Bernard Abbey at Cullman, Alabama,¹⁰ responded to the immigrants. Catholicism served as a refuge and as a nucleus for some semblance of ethnic community. The formalism that generally characterizes the Catholic faith could not be grafted onto the Appalachian social setting of this era, but the opportunity for these immigrants to practice their religion through infant baptisms, confirmations, marriages, funeral rites, and observances of religious holidays provided them an important remnant of their Old-World heritage. This was important in their adjustment to a new environment.

Although these remote but rapidly-developing industrial enclaves fell within the boundaries of the dioceses of Covington, Kentucky, and Wheeling, West Virginia, the bishops generally had located resident priests in only a very few of the major towns where small congregations had existed for many decades. Periodically the bishops sent priests to minister to scattered Catholics in even more remote locations. Even then, the appearance of large numbers of Catholic laborers in the 1880s placed a strain on the regular dioceses, but the bishops attempted to find the means to serve this new constituency. As early as 1882, The bishop of the Covington diocese had no priest to send to Jellico, a new town that had grown up on both sides of the Kentucky-Tennessee border, but asked a clergyman from Knoxville, Tennessee, to make occasional visits and offer Mass for Catholics there.¹¹

The dedication of St. Boniface Catholic Church and parsonage took place during the autumn of 1886 at Jellico, and it soon became the mission center or mother church for the southwestern section of the Covington diocese. Other small sanctuaries soon appeared in eastern Kentucky, among them St. Anthony's at Pineville in 1889, St. Julian's at Middlesboro in 1892 (a new brick church which began as a frame structure in 1889), and St. Casimir at Van Lear in 1911. As industrial development proceeded, the number of Catholics rose accordingly. Consequently, the bishop of the Covington diocese enlisted the services of the Benedictine Fathers from St. Bernard Abbey at Cullman in 1899. An agreement with Benedict Menges, the abbot at St. Bernard's, gave the Benedictines responsibility for Whitley, Knox, and Bell counties. The Benedictines soon placed resident priests of their own order at Jellico and Middlesboro.¹²

The bishop of the Wheeling diocese, whose jurisdiction took in southwest Virginia, also called upon the Benedictines. A railroad accident in 1902, which cost a man both of his legs, brought the first Benedictine priest into Wise County, Virginia. The Reverend Ambrose Reger, having arrived in Middlesboro, Kentucky, only two days earlier, answered the sick call. Shortly thereafter, he received a request from the small mining town of Stonega to baptize several children. Because it was irregular to enter the territory of another diocese without permission, he wrote to the bishop of Wheeling to determine if there were a priest responsible for Stonega. The bishop, confronted with a shortage of personnel, promptly granted him the faculties of the diocese and asked him to look after the Catholics in southwest Virginia. From July to December 1902, the bishop of Wheeling, the abbot at St. Bernard's, priests, and coal company officials dealt with formalities; and by the end of the year, Stonega had its first resident priest, Father Vincent Haegle, perhaps the most popular priest ever to work in the southwest Virginia mining district. The Reverend Augustine Palm, an assistant missionary, joined "Father Vinz," as the Hungarians called him, and ministered to surrounding mining camps. Eventually, churches, financed partially by the coal companies and also by the offerings of the miners, appeared at Glamorgan, Dorchester, and Toms Creek. Father Joseph Stangl, another of the Benedictines, labored physically to build sanctuaries, wielding "broom or brush, ax and sledge hammer to solidify his foundations," thereby perpetuating "his name . . . in the altars, towers and walls" of the churches "and in the very stone steps leading up to the humble temples in the coal field."¹³

Father Vincent subsequently moved to Pocahontas, Virginia, where he and Father Anthony Hoch ministered to a large Hungarian congregation. Indeed, Father Anthony had been sent by the Benedictine Order to Hungary to study the Magyar language and the customs and character of the Hungarians to prepare for this mission station. Father Vincent, who did not initially speak the languages of the different ethnic groups around Stonega, still had "found means and ways to make himself understood," and the coal company "used his services freely as an interpreter and go between. His word was law to both sides and his decision as a rule was final in any kind of settlement." Another priest in the district, the Reverend Robert Reitmeier, a native of Bohemia, "acquired a perfect mastery of the Slavonic idiom," but his fondness for strong drink marred his ministry. He left the mountains and the Church, reportedly headed for Milwaukee, Wisconsin.¹⁴

The Benedictine fathers responded to the full range of human joys and miseries, and they suffered hardships and deprivations alongside their congregations. The Reverend Clarence Meyer, who worked among first- and second-generation Italian immigrants in southeastern Kentucky and northeastern Tennessee from 1926 to 1932, described prevailing conditions. Although "they did not have the facilities to practice their religion formally, . . . they considered it a must to have their children baptized and to marry and be buried in the Catholic Rite," he remembered. "The church in Jellico, Tennessee, with its adjoining Catholic Cemetery was unofficially their religious center and they considered laying to rest the remains of their deceased in that cemetery an obligation." He recalled officiating "in the commitment of many who were killed in the mines" and noted that "since the people could not come to the priest by reason of lack of transportation, . . . the priest would do the best to come to them." "My practice," he added, "was to pack my bags, hitch a ride on a railroad as far as I could and then walk the railroad track or ride a mule to wherever my destination was and then have religious services in some home."¹⁵

Although the bishops of the Covington and Wheeling dioceses had sometimes visited the mountain missions and retained an administrative interest in them, the Benedictine fathers, not the diocesan priests, served Catholic immigrants in the coal camps of eastern Kentucky and southwest Virginia from the 1890s until the 1930s. Native white Appalachians made them feel subject to considerable gossip and speculation about their personal conduct, some of which was justified and most of which was not. Nonetheless, for the most part, the Fathers gave a good account of themselves and fulfilled two distinctive functions. First, they operated on a very basic human level. Even in the rugged, isolated mountains of southern Appalachia, they provided some comfort and security, "a rock

and a hiding place," for those who had carried their religion across an ocean and clung to it in an area basically hostile toward them and their faith. Hugh W. Clement, company doctor at Toms Creek during the 1920s, remembered that "priests, usually stationed at Dante or Norton were very attentive, and responded quickly to their people's call. The younger people rarely attended Sunday services, but in case of marriage, sickness, or death the priest was always called and he responded promptly." "Sometimes," remarked Clement, "even the Protestants would call the priest in case of impending death; the rationale being . . . any port in a storm."¹⁶ Furthermore, the priests contributed to the assimilation process. Their abilities to communicate in native dialects and their offerings of familiar rites provided a bridge from the past to the future for these Catholic immigrants as they attempted to adjust in the strange environment of a new nation.

The Southern Appalachian region is noted for its Anglo-Saxon population and rock-ribbed Protestantism,¹⁷ and the injection of this Catholic religious experience of "new" immigrants was a relatively short-lived aberration in this mountain region. During the 1920s, a Benedictine priest observed that "at occasions like First Communion, Confirmation or dedication of a new church, the outpouring of Catholics is quite a revelation and one would imagine to live for the time in a village of the former Austrian-Hungarian Empire."¹⁸ Two decades later, however, in the same vicinity, two Glenmarian priests estimated that not more than 150 Catholics could be found around Norton, Virginia, the heart of the southwest Virginia coal-mining region, an area that possessed an estimated total population of 175,000.¹⁹

These statements reflect the boom-bust cycle of the coal industry. During the 1920s and 1930s, the fortunes of the industry collapsed in Southern Appalachia, diminishing employment possibilities for unskilled labor. The almost insatiable demand that began in the 1880s and continued into the 1910s had abated, and the great majority of "new" immigrants left the region, usually making their way to the large cities of the Northeast and Midwest. During the boom of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, however, when industrialists actively recruited immigrant labor, Catholicism flowered.

NOTES

1. Frederick Jackson Turner, *The Frontier in American History*, with a foreword by Ray Allen Billington, reprint ed. (Huntington, New York: Robert E. Krieger, 1976), 12.
2. "Fotched-on" women was a colloquialism peculiar to eastern Kentucky. It refers to women reformers--missionaries, nurses, and teachers--who came to work among the mountain people during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.
3. The following sources make important contributions to the understanding of Appalachia's rediscovery and development during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries: Henry D. Shapiro, *Appalachia On Our Mind: The Southern Mountains and Mountaineers in the American Consciousness, 1870-1920* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1978); Ronald D [sic] Eller, *Miners, Millhands and Mountaineers: Industrialization of the American South, 1880-1930* (Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press, 1982); and David E. Whisnant, *All That is Native & Fine: The Politics of Culture in an American Region* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1983).
4. See, for example, John Gaventa, *Power and Powerlessness: Quiescence and Rebellion in an Appalachian Valley* (Urbana, Chicago: University of Illinois Press); Margaret Ripley Wolfe, *Kingsport, Tennessee: A Planned American City* (Lexington: The University Press of Kentucky, 1987); and Eugene A. Conti, Jr., "The Cultural Role

- of Local Elites in the Kentucky Mountains: A Retrospective Analysis," *Appalachian Journal* 7 (Autumn-Winter 1979-1980): 51-68.
5. Numerous studies dealing with American immigration during this era exist. A useful recent source is Alan M. Kraut, *The Huddled Masses: The Immigrant in American Society, 1880-1921* (Arlington Heights, Illinois: Harlan Davidson, 1982).
6. Charles Blanton Roberts, "The Building of Middlesborough: A Notable Epoch in Eastern Kentucky History," *Filson Club Quarterly* 7 (January 1933): 18-33. Middlesborough was an early spelling, but it is now more common to use Middlesboro.
7. Roberts 22.
8. For an explanation of the ethnic neighborhoods of large American cities as staging grounds in the assimilation process, see Humbert S. Nelli, *The Italians in Chicago, 1880-1930: A Study in Ethnic Mobility* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1970).
9. U.S. Congress, Senate, Reports of the Immigration Commission, S. Doc. 633, 61st Cong., 2nd sess., 1909-1910, Immigrants in Industry: The Bituminous Coal Mining Industry in the South, 5: 148, 153, 155.
10. *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, 1967 ed., s.v. "St. Bernard College," by R. L. Lohr.
11. Paul E. Ryan, *History of the Diocese of Covington, Kentucky, on the Occasion of the Centenary of the Diocese* (n.p.: The Diocese of Covington, Kentucky, 1954), 346.
12. Ibid., 347, 350, 351, and 355; and James Hayden Siler, "A History of Jellico, Tennessee," [mimeographed copy], 1938, 29, in the possession of the author.
13. From loose documents and files on the mountain missions of the Wheeling Diocese and correspondence between the Abbot at St. Bernard Abbey and the Bishop of the Diocese of Wheeling, West Virginia, 1902-1932, St. Bernard Abbey, Cullman, Alabama.
14. Ibid.
15. Recollections of the Reverend Clarence Meyer O.S.B. [unpublished manuscript], 1974, in the possession of the author.
16. 29. Recollections of Dr. Hugh W. Clement [unpublished typescript], 1975, in the possession of the author.
17. Two very popular accounts that have perpetuated this interpretation are Harry M. Caudill, *Night Comes to the Cumberland: A Biography of a Depressed Area* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1963); and Jack E. Weller, *Yesterday's People: Life in Contemporary Appalachia* (Lexington: The University of Kentucky Press. 1965).
18. "Sacred Heart Church of Stonega and Missions," [typescript], 4, St. Bernard Abbey, Cullman, Alabama.

19. "The Story of St. Anthony's in Norton," [typescript], 1, St. Anthony Catholic Church, Norton, Virginia.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.
Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).
This page was last updated on 4/19/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by
Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075
E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu



Border States: Journal of the Kentucky-Tennessee American Studies Association, [No. 10 \(1995\)](#)

CATHOLICISM AND COMMUNITY: MOUNTAIN MISSIONS AND "NEW" IMMIGRANTS IN APPALACHIA

Margaret Ripley Wolfe
East Tennessee State University

"Stand at Cumberland Gap and watch the procession of civilization, marching single file," wrote Frederick Jackson Turner, the eminent historian of the eighteenth-century American Trans-Allegheny frontier; "the buffalo following the trail to the salt springs, the Indian, the fur-trader and hunter, the cattle-raiser, the pioneer farmer--and the frontier is passed."¹ Even as Turner penned these very words, the region around the famous gap, in rugged mountain terrain where the borders of Kentucky, Tennessee, and Virginia merge, was experiencing a new frontier. "Stand at Cumberland Gap" in the late nineteenth century and again "watch the procession of civilization, marching single file"--surveyors, geologists, railroad men, coal operators, and journalists; "fetched-on" women,² moonshiners, Catholic priests, and Protestant missionaries; southern blacks, the native mountain whites, and the foreign-born--Italians and Hungarians as well as an assortment of other ethnic groups.³ Southern Appalachia at the turn of the twentieth century was not a melting pot, but it was an ethnic smorgasbord. For approximately four decades, this region, historically somewhat irreligious but nonetheless susceptible to evangelical Protestantism, witnessed a significant Catholic presence.

During the 1880s, capitalists, largely from the northeastern United States and sometimes in league with local entrepreneurs, launched systematic exploitation of mineral resources in the mountains of eastern Tennessee, southwest Virginia, eastern Kentucky, and parts of West Virginia.⁴ The marketing of coal from the newly opened mines and coke from the beehive-style ovens required a transportation system to link the Appalachian wilderness with the American Midwest and East Coast. The advent of the mining industry in the region sparked extensive railroad construction, which, without sophisticated earth-moving equipment, made brutal demands on human labor. From the perspective of the capitalists, the grueling, dangerous work of railroad construction, coke-drawing,

and mining seemed ready-made for immigrants. Coincidentally and advantageously for developers operating in Southern Appalachia, southern and eastern Europe flooded the United States with millions of newcomers during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.^{[5](#)}

The transformation that began around Cumberland Gap during the late 1880s was much in keeping with development throughout the region. "In 1888, the hamlet of Cumberland Gap . . . was an isolated and lonely spot in the heart of the Cumberland Mountains . . . thirteen miles from a railroad," wrote one observer, Alexander A. Arthur. A Scotch-Canadian and a distant relative of United States President Chester A. Arthur, Alexander Arthur enlisted the support of British investors and organized The American Association, Limited. This company linked the gap to the outside world by rail, built the town of Middlesboro, Kentucky, and established the nearby residential suburb of Harrogate, Tennessee, before suffering major financial setbacks during the depression of the 1890s.^{[6](#)}

The gigantic undertaking required hundreds of laborers to alter the face of the land. Blacks, Italians, and native whites worked like the devil during the day and raised hell at night. Conditions resembled those of a "frontier town or gold-rush settlement in the Far West," wrote Charles Blanton Roberts, Arthur's secretary. Large numbers carried pistols; "killings were common, and not infrequently several men would fall in a single fight." On Virginia soil near the intersection of the three states lay "Hell's Half Acre," marked by drinking, gambling, carousing, and debauchery.^{[7](#)} Construction camps seemed even rowdier than settled mining communities where coal operators discouraged the use of alcohol and attempted to maintain order, but drinking, fights, and killings were fairly commonplace all the same. Paydays, Saturday nights, and special holidays including the ethnic observances usually produced a rash of property destruction, personal injuries, and even deaths.

From the 1880s through the 1910s, thousands of immigrants found their way into the remote mining and construction camps of Southern Appalachia. Just off the boat, unable to speak English, anxious for work, and ignorant of their destination, they often fell easy prey to labor agents--usually of their own ethnic background--who promised them steady employment and regular pay. Once in the Southern Appalachians, they were cut off from the ethnic enclaves of the large northeastern and midwestern cities that have generally been regarded by immigration historians as highly valuable in the assimilation process.^{[8](#)} Their numbers were relatively sparse compared to the teeming neighborhoods of large urban areas, and the sense of alienation was exacerbated by the isolation and remoteness of industrial outposts in the southern mountains. Furthermore, the single males or males without their families who comprised a significant proportion of foreign-born workers proved highly transient.^{[9](#)}

While there were some Protestants among the "new" immigrants in the Appalachian region, for many of them the one familiar institution was the Catholic Church. Mountain missions maintained principally by German priests of the Benedictine order from St. Bernard Abbey at Cullman, Alabama,^{[10](#)} responded to the immigrants. Catholicism served as a refuge and as a nucleus for some semblance of ethnic community. The formalism that generally characterizes the Catholic faith could not be grafted onto the Appalachian social setting of this era, but the opportunity for these immigrants to practice their religion through infant baptisms, confirmations, marriages, funeral rites, and observances of religious holidays provided them an important remnant of their Old-World heritage. This was important in their adjustment to a new environment.

Although these remote but rapidly-developing industrial enclaves fell within the boundaries of the dioceses of Covington, Kentucky, and Wheeling, West Virginia, the bishops generally had located resident priests in only a very few of the major towns where small congregations had existed for many decades. Periodically the bishops sent priests to minister to scattered Catholics in even more remote locations. Even then, the appearance of large

numbers of Catholic laborers in the 1880s placed a strain on the regular dioceses, but the bishops attempted to find the means to serve this new constituency. As early as 1882, The bishop of the Covington diocese had no priest to send to Jellico, a new town that had grown up on both sides of the Kentucky-Tennessee border, but asked a clergyman from Knoxville, Tennessee, to make occasional visits and offer Mass for Catholics there.[11](#)

The dedication of St. Boniface Catholic Church and parsonage took place during the autumn of 1886 at Jellico, and it soon became the mission center or mother church for the southwestern section of the Covington diocese. Other small sanctuaries soon appeared in eastern Kentucky, among them St. Anthony's at Pineville in 1889, St. Julian's at Middlesboro in 1892 (a new brick church which began as a frame structure in 1889), and St. Casimir at Van Lear in 1911. As industrial development proceeded, the number of Catholics rose accordingly. Consequently, the bishop of the Covington diocese enlisted the services of the Benedictine Fathers from St. Bernard Abbey at Cullman in 1899. An agreement with Benedict Menges, the abbot at St. Bernard's, gave the Benedictines responsibility for Whitley, Knox, and Bell counties. The Benedictines soon placed resident priests of their own order at Jellico and Middlesboro.[12](#)

The bishop of the Wheeling diocese, whose jurisdiction took in southwest Virginia, also called upon the Benedictines. A railroad accident in 1902, which cost a man both of his legs, brought the first Benedictine priest into Wise County, Virginia. The Reverend Ambrose Reger, having arrived in Middlesboro, Kentucky, only two days earlier, answered the sick call. Shortly thereafter, he received a request from the small mining town of Stonega to baptize several children. Because it was irregular to enter the territory of another diocese without permission, he wrote to the bishop of Wheeling to determine if there were a priest responsible for Stonega. The bishop, confronted with a shortage of personnel, promptly granted him the faculties of the diocese and asked him to look after the Catholics in southwest Virginia. From July to December 1902, the bishop of Wheeling, the abbot at St. Bernard's, priests, and coal company officials dealt with formalities; and by the end of the year, Stonega had its first resident priest, Father Vincent Haegle, perhaps the most popular priest ever to work in the southwest Virginia mining district. The Reverend Augustine Palm, an assistant missionary, joined "Father Vinz," as the Hungarians called him, and ministered to surrounding mining camps. Eventually, churches, financed partially by the coal companies and also by the offerings of the miners, appeared at Glamorgan, Dorchester, and Toms Creek. Father Joseph Stangl, another of the Benedictines, labored physically to build sanctuaries, wielding "broom or brush, ax and sledge hammer to solidify his foundations," thereby perpetuating "his name . . . in the altars, towers and walls" of the churches "and in the very stone steps leading up to the humble temples in the coal field."[13](#)

Father Vincent subsequently moved to Pocahontas, Virginia, where he and Father Anthony Hoch ministered to a large Hungarian congregation. Indeed, Father Anthony had been sent by the Benedictine Order to Hungary to study the Magyar language and the customs and character of the Hungarians to prepare for this mission station. Father Vincent, who did not initially speak the languages of the different ethnic groups around Stonega, still had "found means and ways to make himself understood," and the coal company "used his services freely as an interpreter and go between. His word was law to both sides and his decision as a rule was final in any kind of settlement." Another priest in the district, the Reverend Robert Reitmeier, a native of Bohemia, "acquired a perfect mastery of the Slavonic idiom," but his fondness for strong drink marred his ministry. He left the mountains and the Church, reportedly headed for Milwaukee, Wisconsin.[14](#)

The Benedictine fathers responded to the full range of human joys and miseries, and they suffered hardships and deprivations alongside their congregations. The Reverend Clarence Meyer, who worked among first- and second-generation Italian immigrants in southeastern Kentucky and northeastern Tennessee from 1926 to 1932, described prevailing conditions. Although "they did not have the facilities to practice their religion formally, . . . they considered it a must to have their children baptized and to marry and be buried in the Catholic Rite," he

remembered. "The church in Jellico, Tennessee, with its adjoining Catholic Cemetery was unofficially their religious center and they considered laying to rest the remains of their deceased in that cemetery an obligation." He recalled officiating "in the commitment of many who were killed in the mines" and noted that "since the people could not come to the priest by reason of lack of transportation, . . . the priest would do the best to come to them." "My practice," he added, "was to pack my bags, hitch a ride on a railroad as far as I could and then walk the railroad track or ride a mule to wherever my destination was and then have religious services in some home."¹⁵

Although the bishops of the Covington and Wheeling dioceses had sometimes visited the mountain missions and retained an administrative interest in them, the Benedictine fathers, not the diocesan priests, served Catholic immigrants in the coal camps of eastern Kentucky and southwest Virginia from the 1890s until the 1930s. Native white Appalachians made them feel subject to considerable gossip and speculation about their personal conduct, some of which was justified and most of which was not. Nonetheless, for the most part, the Fathers gave a good account of themselves and fulfilled two distinctive functions. First, they operated on a very basic human level. Even in the rugged, isolated mountains of southern Appalachia, they provided some comfort and security, "a rock and a hiding place," for those who had carried their religion across an ocean and clung to it in an area basically hostile toward them and their faith. Hugh W. Clement, company doctor at Toms Creek during the 1920s, remembered that "priests, usually stationed at Dante or Norton were very attentive, and responded quickly to their people's call. The younger people rarely attended Sunday services, but in case of marriage, sickness, or death the priest was always called and he responded promptly." "Sometimes," remarked Clement, "even the Protestants would call the priest in case of impending death; the rationale being . . . any port in a storm."¹⁶ Furthermore, the priests contributed to the assimilation process. Their abilities to communicate in native dialects and their offerings of familiar rites provided a bridge from the past to the future for these Catholic immigrants as they attempted to adjust in the strange environment of a new nation.

The Southern Appalachian region is noted for its Anglo-Saxon population and rock-ribbed Protestantism,¹⁷ and the injection of this Catholic religious experience of "new" immigrants was a relatively short-lived aberration in this mountain region. During the 1920s, a Benedictine priest observed that "at occasions like First Communion, Confirmation or dedication of a new church, the outpouring of Catholics is quite a revelation and one would imagine to live for the time in a village of the former Austrian-Hungarian Empire."¹⁸ Two decades later, however, in the same vicinity, two Glenmarian priests estimated that not more than 150 Catholics could be found around Norton, Virginia, the heart of the southwest Virginia coal-mining region, an area that possessed an estimated total population of 175,000.¹⁹

These statements reflect the boom-bust cycle of the coal industry. During the 1920s and 1930s, the fortunes of the industry collapsed in Southern Appalachia, diminishing employment possibilities for unskilled labor. The almost insatiable demand that began in the 1880s and continued into the 1910s had abated, and the great majority of "new" immigrants left the region, usually making their way to the large cities of the Northeast and Midwest. During the boom of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, however, when industrialists actively recruited immigrant labor, Catholicism flowered.

NOTES

1. Frederick Jackson Turner, *The Frontier in American History*, with a foreword by Ray Allen Billington, reprint ed. (Huntington, New York: Robert E. Krieger, 1976), 12.

2. "Fotched-on" women was a colloquialism peculiar to eastern Kentucky. It refers to women reformers--

missionaries, nurses, and teachers--who came to work among the mountain people during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.

3. The following sources make important contributions to the understanding of Appalachia's rediscovery and development during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries: Henry D. Shapiro, *Appalachia On Our Mind: The Southern Mountains and Mountaineers in the American Consciousness, 1870-1920* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1978); Ronald D [sic] Eller, *Miners, Millhands and Mountaineers: Industrialization of the American South, 1880-1930* (Knoxville: The University of Tennessee Press, 1982); and David E. Whisnant, *All That is Native & Fine: The Politics of Culture in an American Region* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1983).

4. See, for example, John Gaventa, *Power and Powerlessness: Quiescence and Rebellion in an Appalachian Valley* (Urbana, Chicago: University of Illinois Press); Margaret Ripley Wolfe, *Kingsport, Tennessee: A Planned American City* (Lexington: The University Press of Kentucky, 1987); and Eugene A. Conti, Jr., "The Cultural Role of Local Elites in the Kentucky Mountains: A Retrospective Analysis," *Appalachian Journal* 7 (Autumn-Winter 1979-1980): 51-68.

5. Numerous studies dealing with American immigration during this era exist. A useful recent source is Alan M. Kraut, *The Huddled Masses: The Immigrant in American Society, 1880-1921* (Arlington Heights, Illinois: Harlan Davidson, 1982).

6. Charles Blanton Roberts, "The Building of Middlesborough: A Notable Epoch in Eastern Kentucky History," *Filson Club Quarterly* 7 (January 1933): 18-33. Middlesborough was an early spelling, but it is now more common to use Middlesboro.

7. Roberts 22.

8. For an explanation of the ethnic neighborhoods of large American cities as staging grounds in the assimilation process, see Humbert S. Nelli, *The Italians in Chicago, 1880-1930: A Study in Ethnic Mobility* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1970).

9. U.S. Congress, Senate, Reports of the Immigration Commission, S. Doc. 633, 61st Cong., 2nd sess., 1909-1910, Immigrants in Industry: The Bituminous Coal Mining Industry in the South, 5: 148, 153, 155.

10. *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, 1967 ed., s.v. "St. Bernard College," by R. L. Lohr.

11. Paul E. Ryan, *History of the Diocese of Covington, Kentucky, on the Occasion of the Centenary of the Diocese* (n.p.: The Diocese of Covington, Kentucky, 1954), 346.

12. Ibid., 347, 350, 351, and 355; and James Hayden Siler, "A History of Jellico, Tennessee," [mimeographed copy], 1938, 29, in the possession of the author.

13. From loose documents and files on the mountain missions of the Wheeling Diocese and correspondence between the Abbot at St. Bernard Abbey and the Bishop of the Diocese of Wheeling, West Virginia, 1902-1932, St. Bernard Abbey, Cullman, Alabama.

14. Ibid.
15. Recollections of the Reverend Clarence Meyer O.S.B. [unpublished manuscript], 1974, in the possession of the author.
16. 29. Recollections of Dr. Hugh W. Clement [unpublished typescript], 1975, in the possession of the author.
17. Two very popular accounts that have perpetuated this interpretation are Harry M. Caudill, *Night Comes to the Cumberlands: A Biography of a Depressed Area* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1963); and Jack E. Weller, *Yesterday's People: Life in Contemporary Appalachia* (Lexington: The University of Kentucky Press. 1965).
18. "Sacred Heart Church of Stonega and Missions," [typescript], 4, St. Bernard Abbey, Cullman, Alabama.
19. "The Story of St. Anthony's in Norton," [typescript], 1, St. Anthony Catholic Church, Norton, Virginia.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.
Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).
This page was last updated on 4/19/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by
Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075
E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

DOCUMENTING THE DIRECTOR: DELBERT MANN, HIS LIFE, HIS WORK, AND HIS PAPERS

Sarah Harwell
Vanderbilt University Library

The Papers of Delbert Mann at the Special Collections Library of Vanderbilt University provide not only a rich chronicle of the award-winning television and motion picture director's life and work, but also document the history of aspects of American popular culture and motion picture art in the latter half of the twentieth century.

Delbert Mann was born in Lawrence, Kansas, in 1920. He moved to Nashville, which he considers his home town, as a young boy when his father came to teach at Scarritt College. He graduated from Hume-Fogg High School and Vanderbilt University, where Dinah Shore and Mann's future wife, Ann Caroline Gillespie, were among his classmates. Also in Nashville he developed a lifelong friendship with Fred Coe through their mutual involvement in the Nashville Community Playhouse. Coe would play a very important role in Mann's life. A few months after his graduation from Vanderbilt in 1941, Mann joined the Eighth Air Force, for which he completed thirty-five missions as a pilot of a B-24 bomber. After the end of the Second World War he attended the Yale Drama School, followed by two years as director of the Town Theatre of Columbia, South Carolina.

In 1949, Fred Coe, already a producer at NBC television network, invited Delbert Mann to come to New York to direct live television drama on the "Philco Television Playhouse." Then in its infancy, television offered many fine original plays to its relatively small viewing audience. During the 1950s, now known as television's "Golden Age," Mann directed many critically acclaimed television dramas for the "Philco Playhouse," which later alternated weeks with the "Goodyear Television Playhouse," and "Producers' Showcase." Some of his productions during this period included *Vincent Van Gogh*, *Sense and Sensibility*, *Anything Can Happen*, *October Story* (with Julie Harris and Leslie Nielsen), *Middle of the Night* (with Eva Marie Saint and E.G. Marshall), two productions of *Othello* (one with Walter Matthau as Iago), *The Petrified Forest* (with Humphrey Bogart, Lauren Bacall, and Jack Klugman), *Darkness at Noon*, a musical version of *Our Town* (with Paul Newman, Eva Marie Saint, and Frank Sinatra), and *Marty* (with Rod Steiger and Nancy Marchand).

Marty was so successful as a television drama that in 1954 Mann, at playwright Paddy Chayefsky's insistence, went to Hollywood to direct a cinema version. This production, starring Ernest Borgnine and Betsy Blair, won the Academy Award for Best Picture, as well as Best Director and Best Leading Actor awards for Mann and Borgnine. Delbert Mann directed several more live television productions after *Marty*, but, in the second half of the decade, moved increasingly into directing feature films. During his long and distinguished career he has directed *Separate Tables* (with Burt Lancaster, Deborah Kerr, and David Niven), *The Dark at the Top of the Stairs* (with Robert Preston and Dorothy McGuire), *The Outsider* (with Tony Curtis), *A Gathering of Eagles* (with Rock Hudson), *Lover, Come Back* (with Doris Day, Rock Hudson, and Tony Randall), *That Touch of Mink* (with Doris Day and Cary Grant), and *Dear Heart* (with Glenn Ford and Geraldine Page).

Toward the end of the 1960s Mann turned his attention to television films, directing a variety of productions: *Heidi* (with Maximilian Schell, Michael Redgrave, and Jean Simmons), *David Copperfield* (with Robin Phillips, Richard Attenborough, Laurence Olivier, Edith Evans, Michael Redgrave, Wendy Hiller, and Ralph Richardson), *Jane Eyre* (with George C. Scott and Susannah York), *No Place to Run* (with Herschel Bernardi, Tom Bosley, and Stefanie Powers), *The Man Without a Country* (with Cliff Robertson, Robert Ryan, and Beau Bridges), *Francis Gary Powers: The True Story of the U-2 Spy Plane Incident* (with Lee Majors), *All Quiet on the Western Front* (with Richard Thomas, Patricia Neal, and Ernest Borgnine), *Love Leads the Way* (with Timothy Bottoms, Eva Marie Saint, and Arthur Hill), *The Last Days of Patton* (with George C. Scott and Eva Marie Saint), *April Morning* (with Tommy Lee Jones and Robert Urich), and *Ironclads* (with Alex Hyde-White and Virginia Madsen), among many others.

Mann has prove himself adept at a great variety of genres, be they comedy, drama, literary classics, historical epics and vignettes, or stories drawn from contemporary headlines. He continues to work, although at a somewhat more relaxed pace. His most recent production, was *Lily in Winter*, starring Natalie Cole, released in December, 1994.

The Papers of Delbert Mann, which cover the period 1947-1993, consist of forty-five cubic feet of materials, and are primarily concerned with the professional life and career of the director. Major series in the papers include the Production Papers, General Correspondence, Script Reports, Writings, Personal and Biographical Material, Events and Activities, Theatre and Opera Collection, Photographs, Videotapes and other Special Media, and Scrapbooks.

The Production Papers form the heart of the collection. Most of the motion pictures, television films, and plays directed by Delbert Mann are well documented in the papers, although there is less material for the beginning of Mann's career, during which he directed live television drama. For later productions a Script is almost included. Cast Lists are quite common. Many of the Scripts are annotated by the director and reveal his views on character and action, as well as approaches to the technique of directing. Often included with the Script is a prose outline that provides a summary of the story, a description of the characters, and a delineation of the structure of the project. Cast Lists often include notes on interviews and auditions with people being considered for acting roles. Biographical details and physical characteristics may be part of the Cast Lists.

Another important component of the Production Papers is the sub-series simply called Notes. The Notes are quite substantive and comprise one of the best sources, in addition to the annotations of the scripts themselves, by which the user can gain insight into the director's thought processes as he works through the story that will become a motion picture or television film. Notes on music and sound are separately designated and placed after the general Notes.

Background papers reveal the research that goes into making a picture. They are most useful and voluminous for the historical or real-life productions, such as *April Morning* or *A Gathering of Eagles*, or in the productions based on classical literature, such as *David Copperfield* or *Jane Eyre*.

Documents on filming, with titles like Scene and Actor Breakdown or Scene and Timing Breakdown, provide information about the structure of each scene along with a list of characters in the scene or a notation of how long the scene should take. Other scene-related documents include plans for setting up and filming scenes, the program format for television films, lists of scenes to be cut or added, and the like.

A vital part of the Production Papers, Schedules tell the cast and crew members where they should be, how long they will be there, what they will be doing on any given day, and, in many cases, how much of the script should be

filmed on that day. Related to Schedules are the Daily Production Reports. These reports tell how much of a production was filmed, note any special occurrences, and describe any problems encountered. The Daily Diary gives an hour-by-hour accounting of how the time was used during the shooting period.

Set documents include Set Lists, Set Designs, Illustrations, Sketches, Prop Lists, Wardrobe Lists, Wardrobe Notes, and even Animal Lists. Location Information is related the Set materials, and includes details about places in which a production is to be filmed.

The last grouping of the Production Papers consists of Publicity, Reviews, and Correspondence. The correspondence, both to and from Mann and others, consists of letters exchanged in planning the production, and congratulatory letters from viewers after the release of the production.

The General Correspondence is located after the Production Papers. It is comprised of letters not directly related to any one production, though it often includes letters from people with whom Delbert Mann has worked. Prominent correspondents include Steve Allen, Carol Burnett, Frank Capra, Paddy Chayefsky, Doris Day, Greer Garson, Lillian Gish, Julie Harris, Angela Lansbury, Anthony Hopkins, Paul Newman, Gregory Peck, Tyrone Power, Lee Remick, and Eva Marie Saint, among many others.

The Script Reports, 1960-1992, written by Mann about scripts that he was asked to consider, offer another perspective on the director's insight into the process of motion picture production. Mann's thoughts on what makes a good story, comments on character, structure, plausibility of story line, and various nuances, are revealed through his comments on the script under consideration.

The major component of Mann's Writings is the autobiography, entitled *Looking Back*. Mann's memoirs are remarkable in their thoroughness, providing detail and analysis on his career as a director. Writing in a conversational and graceful style, Mann relates stories of how productions were made, provides substantive information on productions for which there is little or no material elsewhere in the papers, and reminisces affectionately about his family, friends, and associates. He recounts the excitement and challenges encountered in exotic and rugged locales, the many elements that must be orchestrated to bring fragments together into the whole cloth of a film, the technique of directing, and amusing anecdotes about famous people.

Personal and Biographical Materials, which follow Mann's memoirs, provide a wealth of information about his life and work. Included are summaries and lists of his directing activities, biographical sketches, and articles. Various awards and honors won are also in this series. The Events and Activities series is closely related to the Biographical Material in that this series documents Mann's participation, usually as a panelist, in film and theatre festivals all over the world, including the Cork International Film Festival in Ireland and the Manila International Film Festival. Also of interest will be materials for the recent contest in which Mann served as a judge--

"The Search for Scarlett," for the film sequel to *Gone With the Wind*.

The Theatre and Opera Collection includes many programs from theatrical productions performed at the Ryman Auditorium in Nashville during the 1930s and early 1940s. They are usually signed by one or more of the actors, many of them legends of the stage: Helen Hayes, John and Ethel Barrymore, Judith Anderson, Alfred Lunt, Lynn Fontanne, Maurice Evans, Katherine Cornell, and Gertrude Lawrence, are just a few of the luminaries represented. Other theatres and companies are represented by the program: the Metropolitan Opera, The Theatre Guild, the New York City Opera Company, and the Ben Greet Players.

The Photographs, Videotapes, and Scrapbooks are placed at the end of the Papers because of their special storage requirements. Many of the photographs were taken from Mann's own productions; others are publicity pictures and informal shots of people with whom he has worked. Among the people represented in the photographs are Ernest Borgnine, Tony Curtis, Doris Day, Edith Evans, Grace Kelly, Charles Laughton, Raymond Massey, and David Niven. Videotapes of several Delbert Mann productions are in the collection, including *The Marriages*, *The Medea Cup*, *The Red Mill*, *Wish on the Moon*, and *Without Fear or Favor*. Finally, the Scrapbooks contain a treasure of information compiled over a career of some four and a half decades, include clippings, reviews, photographs, and correspondence about most of Delbert Mann's productions.

The hallmarks of Delbert Mann's directing style and philosophy are character development and realistic drama over plot and spectacle, the redeeming nature of personal relationships, an interest in portraying the lives of normal everyday people, and a naturalistic approach to directing. No director could have been better suited for bringing to life the human dramas of such writers as Paddy Chayefsky and Tad Mosel. Their work--*Marty*, *Middle of the Night*, *The Bachelor Party*, *Dear Heart*, *Ernie Barger Is 50*, *All the Way Home*--have as their themes various universal human concerns: loneliness, loyalty, redemption, acceptance, love, aging. They focus on small stories about the everyday lives of people and their relationships.

Delbert Mann has always made it easy for his actors to relate to these basic human issues. He recently said:

I've got to try to set an atmosphere of harmony and love and relaxation, as relaxed as one can make a set, because...there's going to be enough tension to go around, even under the best of circumstances....When, however, we have rehearsed the scenes and the actors are ready to work, I want discipline and I insist upon absolute silence...[I] prefer to work loosely and easily at first, letting the actors move rather freely and examining together with the actors the emotional content of the scenes and the physical movement that results therefrom...The good director...must make everything the actor does stay with in the framework of reality and truth for the characters in the script and their particular situation...Every move and position must be motivated truly.¹

Delbert Mann is not a director known for imposing his world view or suffusing his productions with idiosyncrasies and flamboyant technique. As he points out: "I am not a great believer in the so-called 'Auteur' theory of film-making." Rather, he is a craftsman, imbuing his work with close attention to narrative, realism, balance, and continuity. As Tommy Lee Jones, who worked with Mann in *April Morning*, wrote:

He has a clear and open mind that leads him and his actors to the kind of preparations that will cause a story to propel itself rather than being laboriously pushed or pulled. As an example, I will cite his reconstruction of Lexington Green. The architecture, landscaping, armory, costumes, and blocking placed me in a quiet New England Commons staring squarely into the teeth of a drum-beating, red-coated, imperialist military force and left me with three choices: liberty, death, or flight. It took no work whatsoever on my part to experience the fear and humiliation of seeing my home overrun by a foreign army or to understand why people, again and again all over the world, have chosen liberty or death in the face of tyranny. Delbert's ability to prepare a day's work placed the sight and touch and smell of American patriotism all around us; it was real, deadly, and glorious--free of jingoism and sentimentality. The story told itself. This made my work as an actor easy and set the finest possible example, should I ever be lucky enough to direct a classical American story.²

NOTES

1. Delbert Mann, interview by Gorham Kindem, 1993, The Delbert Mann Papers, Special Collections, The Jean and Alexander Heart Library, Vanderbilt University, Nashville.
2. Tommy Lee Jones, "Perspectives on the Director: V," in Sara Harwell, ed., *The Papers of Delbert Mann* (Nashville: Vanderbilt University, 1993), 48.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 4/5/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by
Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075
E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu



Border States: Journal of the Kentucky-Tennessee American Studies Association, [No. 10](#) (1995)

DOCUMENTING THE DIRECTOR: DELBERT MANN, HIS LIFE, HIS WORK, AND HIS PAPERS

Sarah Harwell
Vanderbilt University Library

The Papers of Delbert Mann at the Special Collections Library of Vanderbilt University provide not only a rich chronicle of the award-winning television and motion picture director's life and work, but also document the history of aspects of American popular culture and motion picture art in the latter half of the twentieth century.

Delbert Mann was born in Lawrence, Kansas, in 1920. He moved to Nashville, which he considers his home town, as a young boy when his father came to teach at Scarritt College. He graduated from Hume-Fogg High School and Vanderbilt University, where Dinah Shore and Mann's future wife, Ann Caroline Gillespie, were among his classmates. Also in Nashville he developed a lifelong friendship with Fred Coe through their mutual involvement in the Nashville Community Playhouse. Coe would play a very important role in Mann's life. A few months after his graduation from Vanderbilt in 1941, Mann joined the Eighth Air Force, for which he completed thirty-five missions as a pilot of a B-24 bomber. After the end of the Second World War he attended the Yale Drama School, followed by two years as director of the Town Theatre of Columbia, South Carolina.

In 1949, Fred Coe, already a producer at NBC television network, invited Delbert Mann to come to New York to

direct live television drama on the "Philco Television Playhouse." Then in its infancy, television offered many fine original plays to its relatively small viewing audience. During the 1950s, now known as television's "Golden Age," Mann directed many critically acclaimed television dramas for the "Philco Playhouse," which later alternated weeks with the "Goodyear Television Playhouse," and "Producers' Showcase." Some of his productions during this period included *Vincent Van Gogh*, *Sense and Sensibility*, *Anything Can Happen*, *October Story* (with Julie Harris and Leslie Nielsen), *Middle of the Night* (with Eva Marie Saint and E.G. Marshall), two productions of *Othello* (one with Walter Matthau as Iago), *The Petrified Forest* (with Humphrey Bogart, Lauren Bacall, and Jack Klugman), *Darkness at Noon*, a musical version of *Our Town* (with Paul Newman, Eva Marie Saint, and Frank Sinatra), and *Marty* (with Rod Steiger and Nancy Marchand).

Marty was so successful as a television drama that in 1954 Mann, at playwright Paddy Chayefsky's insistence, went to Hollywood to direct a cinema version. This production, starring Ernest Borgnine and Betsy Blair, won the Academy Award for Best Picture, as well as Best Director and Best Leading Actor awards for Mann and Borgnine. Delbert Mann directed several more live television productions after *Marty*, but, in the second half of the decade, moved increasingly into directing feature films. During his long and distinguished career he has directed *Separate Tables* (with Burt Lancaster, Deborah Kerr, and David Niven), *The Dark at the Top of the Stairs* (with Robert Preston and Dorothy McGuire), *The Outsider* (with Tony Curtis), *A Gathering of Eagles* (with Rock Hudson), *Lover, Come Back* (with Doris Day, Rock Hudson, and Tony Randall), *That Touch of Mink* (with Doris Day and Cary Grant), and *Dear Heart* (with Glenn Ford and Geraldine Page).

Toward the end of the 1960s Mann turned his attention to television films, directing a variety of productions: *Heidi* (with Maximilian Schell, Michael Redgrave, and Jean Simmons), *David Copperfield* (with Robin Phillips, Richard Attenborough, Laurence Olivier, Edith Evans, Michael Redgrave, Wendy Hiller, and Ralph Richardson), *Jane Eyre* (with George C. Scott and Susannah York), *No Place to Run* (with Herschel Bernardi, Tom Bosley, and Stefanie Powers), *The Man Without a Country* (with Cliff Robertson, Robert Ryan, and Beau Bridges), *Francis Gary Powers: The True Story of the U-2 Spy Plane Incident* (with Lee Majors), *All Quiet on the Western Front* (with Richard Thomas, Patricia Neal, and Ernest Borgnine), *Love Leads the Way* (with Timothy Bottoms, Eva Marie Saint, and Arthur Hill), *The Last Days of Patton* (with George C. Scott and Eva Marie Saint), *April Morning* (with Tommy Lee Jones and Robert Urich), and *Ironclads* (with Alex Hyde-White and Virginia Madsen), among many others.

Mann has prove himself adept at a great variety of genres, be they comedy, drama, literary classics, historical epics and vignettes, or stories drawn from contemporary headlines. He continues to work, although at a somewhat more relaxed pace. His most recent production, was *Lily in Winter*, starring Natalie Cole, released in December, 1994.

The Papers of Delbert Mann, which cover the period 1947-1993, consist of forty-five cubic feet of materials, and are primarily concerned with the professional life and career of the director. Major series in the papers include the Production Papers, General Correspondence, Script Reports, Writings, Personal and Biographical Material, Events and Activities, Theatre and Opera Collection, Photographs, Videotapes and other Special Media, and Scrapbooks.

The Production Papers form the heart of the collection. Most of the motion pictures, television films, and plays directed by Delbert Mann are well documented in the papers, although there is less material for the beginning of Mann's career, during which he directed live television drama. For later productions a Script is almost included. Cast Lists are quite common. Many of the Scripts are annotated by the director and reveal his views on character and action, as well as approaches to the technique of directing. Often included with the Script is a prose outline that provides a summary of the story, a description of the characters, and a delineation of the structure of the project. Cast Lists often include notes on interviews and auditions with people being considered for acting roles.

Biographical details and physical characteristics may be part of the Cast Lists.

Another important component of the Production Papers is the sub-series simply called Notes. The Notes are quite substantive and comprise one of the best sources, in addition to the annotations of the scripts themselves, by which the user can gain insight into the director's thought processes as he works through the story that will become a motion picture or television film. Notes on music and sound are separately designated and placed after the general Notes.

Background papers reveal the research that goes into making a picture. They are most useful and voluminous for the historical or real-life productions, such as *April Morning* or *A Gathering of Eagles*, or in the productions based on classical literature, such as *David Copperfield* or *Jane Eyre*.

Documents on filming, with titles like Scene and Actor Breakdown or Scene and Timing Breakdown, provide information about the structure of each scene along with a list of characters in the scene or a notation of how long the scene should take. Other scene-related documents include plans for setting up and filming scenes, the program format for television films, lists of scenes to be cut or added, and the like.

A vital part of the Production Papers, Schedules tell the cast and crew members where they should be, how long they will be there, what they will be doing on any given day, and, in many cases, how much of the script should be filmed on that day. Related to Schedules are the Daily Production Reports. These reports tell how much of a production was filmed, note any special occurrences, and describe any problems encountered. The Daily Diary gives an hour-by-hour accounting of how the time was used during the shooting period.

Set documents include Set Lists, Set Designs, Illustrations, Sketches, Prop Lists, Wardrobe Lists, Wardrobe Notes, and even Animal Lists. Location Information is related the Set materials, and includes details about places in which a production is to be filmed.

The last grouping of the Production Papers consists of Publicity, Reviews, and Correspondence. The correspondence, both to and from Mann and others, consists of letters exchanged in planning the production, and congratulatory letters from viewers after the release of the production.

The General Correspondence is located after the Production Papers. It is comprised of letters not directly related to any one production, though it often includes letters from people with whom Delbert Mann has worked. Prominent correspondents include Steve Allen, Carol Burnett, Frank Capra, Paddy Chayefsky, Doris Day, Greer Garson, Lillian Gish, Julie Harris, Angela Lansbury, Anthony Hopkins, Paul Newman, Gregory Peck, Tyrone Power, Lee Remick, and Eva Marie Saint, among many others.

The Script Reports, 1960-1992, written by Mann about scripts that he was asked to consider, offer another perspective on the director's insight into the process of motion picture production. Mann's thoughts on what makes a good story, comments on character, structure, plausibility of story line, and various nuances, are revealed through his comments on the script under consideration.

The major component of Mann's Writings is the autobiography, entitled *Looking Back*. Mann's memoirs are remarkable in their thoroughness, providing detail and analysis on his career as a director. Writing in a conversational and graceful style, Mann relates stories of how productions were made, provides substantive information on productions for which there is little or no material elsewhere in the papers, and reminisces

affectionately about his family, friends, and associates. He recounts the excitement and challenges encountered in exotic and rugged locales, the many elements that must be orchestrated to bring fragments together into the whole cloth of a film, the technique of directing, and amusing anecdotes about famous people.

Personal and Biographical Materials, which follow Mann's memoirs, provide a wealth of information about his life and work. Included are summaries and lists of his directing activities, biographical sketches, and articles. Various awards and honors won are also in this series. The Events and Activities series is closely related to the Biographical Material in that this series documents Mann's participation, usually as a panelist, in film and theatre festivals all over the world, including the Cork International Film Festival in Ireland and the Manila International Film Festival. Also of interest will be materials for the recent contest in which Mann served as a judge--

"The Search for Scarlett," for the film sequel to *Gone With the Wind*.

The Theatre and Opera Collection includes many programs from theatrical productions performed at the Ryman Auditorium in Nashville during the 1930s and early 1940s. They are usually signed by one or more of the actors, many of them legends of the stage: Helen Hayes, John and Ethel Barrymore, Judith Anderson, Alfred Lunt, Lynn Fontanne, Maurice Evans, Katherine Cornell, and Gertrude Lawrence, are just a few of the luminaries represented. Other theatres and companies are represented by the program: the Metropolitan Opera, The Theatre Guild, the New York City Opera Company, and the Ben Greet Players.

The Photographs, Videotapes, and Scrapbooks are placed at the end of the Papers because of their special storage requirements. Many of the photographs were taken from Mann's own productions; others are publicity pictures and informal shots of people with whom he has worked. Among the people represented in the photographs are Ernest Borgnine, Tony Curtis, Doris Day, Edith Evans, Grace Kelly, Charles Laughton, Raymond Massey, and David Niven. Videotapes of several Delbert Mann productions are in the collection, including *The Marriages*, *The Medea Cup*, *The Red Mill*, *Wish on the Moon*, and *Without Fear or Favor*. Finally, the Scrapbooks contain a treasure of information compiled over a career of some four and a half decades, include clippings, reviews, photographs, and correspondence about most of Delbert Mann's productions.

The hallmarks of Delbert Mann's directing style and philosophy are character development and realistic drama over plot and spectacle, the redeeming nature of personal relationships, an interest in portraying the lives of normal everyday people, and a naturalistic approach to directing. No director could have been better suited for bringing to life the human dramas of such writers as Paddy Chayefsky and Tad Mosel. Their work--*Marty*, *Middle of the Night*, *The Bachelor Party*, *Dear Heart*, *Ernie Barger Is 50*, *All the Way Home*--have as their themes various universal human concerns: loneliness, loyalty, redemption, acceptance, love, aging. They focus on small stories about the everyday lives of people and their relationships.

Delbert Mann has always made it easy for his actors to relate to these basic human issues. He recently said:

I've got to try to set an atmosphere of harmony and love and relaxation, as relaxed as one can make a set, because...there's going to be enough tension to go around, even under the best of circumstances....When, however, we have rehearsed the scenes and the actors are ready to work, I want discipline and I insist upon absolute silence...[I] prefer to work loosely and easily at first, letting the actors move rather freely and examining together with the actors the emotional content of the scenes and the physical movement that results therefrom...The good director...must make everything the actor does stay with in the framework of reality and truth for the characters in the

script and their particular situation...Every move and position must be motivated truly.¹

Delbert Mann is not a director known for imposing his world view or suffusing his productions with idiosyncrasies and flamboyant technique. As he points out: "I am not a great believer in the so-called 'Auteur' theory of film-making." Rather, he is a craftsman, imbuing his work with close attention to narrative, realism, balance, and continuity. As Tommy Lee Jones, who worked with Mann in *April Morning*, wrote:

He has a clear and open mind that leads him and his actors to the kind of preparations that will cause a story to propel itself rather than being laboriously pushed or pulled. As an example, I will cite his reconstruction of Lexington Green. The architecture, landscaping, armory, costumes, and blocking placed me in a quiet New England Commons staring squarely into the teeth of a drum-beating, red-coated, imperialist military force and left me with three choices: liberty, death, or flight. It took no work whatsoever on my part to experience the fear and humiliation of seeing my home overrun by a foreign army or to understand why people, again and again all over the world, have chosen liberty or death in the face of tyranny. Delbert's ability to prepare a day's work placed the sight and touch and smell of American patriotism all around us; it was real, deadly, and glorious--free of jingoism and sentimentality. The story told itself. This made my work as an actor easy and set the finest possible example, should I ever be lucky enough to direct a classical American story.²

NOTES

1. Delbert Mann, interview by Gorham Kindem, 1993, The Delbert Mann Papers, Special Collections, The Jean and Alexander Heart Library, Vanderbilt University, Nashville.
2. Tommy Lee Jones, "Perspectives on the Director: V," in Sara Harwell, ed., *The Papers of Delbert Mann* (Nashville: Vanderbilt University, 1993), 48.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.
Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 4/5/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by
Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075
E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

PINEY RIDGE TRILOGY: JANICE HOLT GILES'S ESSAY OF PLACE

Clara L. Metzmeier
Campbellsville College

A sense of place results gradually and unconsciously from inhabiting a landscape over time, becoming familiar with its physical properties, accruing a history within its confines.

Kent C. Ryden

The social history of rural Adair County, Kentucky in the 1930s and 1940s unfolds as one reads Janice Holt Giles's *The Enduring Hills* (1950), *Miss Willie* (1951), and *Tara's Healing* (1951), the novels that comprise the Piney Ridge Trilogy. Giles brings the reader to Piney Ridge by using detailed descriptions of the landscapes and by accurate reporting of the traditions and life styles of the people. Giles provides continuity of plot and setting by developing some of the same characters throughout the three novels and by constructing a literary map of Piney Ridge that includes roads, houses, woods, and hills. She adds reality and history to this map by labeling each place with the name of the owner or the purpose of the building. Because her map includes such intimate details, it is different from a highway map or a map in a geography book. When the reader studies Giles's map, memories of Piney Ridge people recur, and a sense of place "gradually and unconsciously" forms.

The little square marked "Hod Pierce" on the Piney Ridge Map, for example, calls up more than just a house located on Whispering Creek. The reader remembers that in *The Enduring Hills*, Hod and Mary Pierce decide after the close of World War II and after a few years of working in Louisville, Kentucky, that they would live on Piney Ridge, the home of Hod's family for seven generations. The reason Hod and Mary believe it is necessary for Hod to return to his childhood home after many years' absence is that both seek a balance between their place of residence and their spiritual needs. The reader recalls that *The Enduring Hills* ends when Hod takes Mary to see Grandpa Dow's house and states that this old log building will be their home. The reader further recalls that Hod often visited Grandpa Dow, who had talked a lot about life on the Ridge, about the Pierce clan, and about reasons why the Ridge folks lived the way they did. The reader remembers that it is in the Hod Pierce house that many people begin their lives on the Ridge. Miss Willie and Tara Cochrane first live in Hod's and Mary's home when they come to the Ridge; Jeems Pierce, the first child of Hod and Mary, is born in the old log home. Thus the house, becomes a focal point for a multi-generational and multi-cultural family. The old log home helps to establish the thread that weaves through the three books: the influence of geographical location on cultural heritage and of heritage on an individual or a group of individuals. Giles helps readers to focus upon the landscape, the people, and the relationships formed between place of residence and people.

As Giles conducts a tour up and down Gaptown Pike, she stops at the mill and the school and in many houses and fields so that the reader can listen to the people's conversations and come to know them. The reader learns that these are farm families who depend upon tobacco as the main money crop, that the people are poor and uneducated, and that medical treatment is minimal. Electricity and indoor plumbing do not exist in rural Adair County in the 1930s and early 1940s. Most of the people travel around the Ridge on foot or in horse or mule drawn

wagons, and they seldom travel further than The Gap. Isolated by geography, ignorance, and poverty, the people form a close-knit community. Their love of place and the security it gives them keeps them on the Ridge. There they stoically and fatalistically accept their hardships.

The Piney Ridge folks of the 1930s and 1940s accept their hardships with the "Hits allus been" attitude, often expressed in *Miss Willie*, but they are not a dismal people. They make their fun much as America's pioneer families did. They have house- and barn-raising, church dinners and singings, and pie suppers at the beginning of the school term. These functions give the people a chance to see each other and escape from drudgery into fun; they give young couples a chance to hug waists and to steal kisses. Food, the traditional sign of hospitality, is always served at these functions. The Ridge folks usually bring beans of different varieties, fried chicken, potatoes, homemade bread, and pies. The women sometimes make a social event of their sewing and mending jobs, visiting on the porch in the summer or by the fire in the winter, while they mend clothes or make quilts. The men often gather at the mill to swap news and to tell stories while the grain is being ground into flour. Such was the case when the men at the mill pay tribute to Grandpa Dow in *The Enduring Hills*. In *Tara's Healing* the men tell stories at the house raising. Gault's story of Grandpa's throwing a corn cob at an old Tom turkey tricks Tara into asking what happened to the turkey. Tara's question is the point of the story. Thus the men guffaw and slap each other on the back and tease Tara for "biting hook, line, and sinker." This episode is typical of Ridge humor. Folks have their special ways to escape the never-ending farm labor.

Janice Holt Giles did not grow up in rural Adair County, but Henry, her husband, did. He told her many of the stories about Knifley, Giles Ridge, and Caldwell Ridge that enter into her Piney Ridge Trilogy. In fact, the story of Hod and Mary Pierce as it is written in *The Enduring Hills* parallels Henry's and then Janice's and Henry's lives. Janice, like Mary Pierce, visited the Ridge many times before she moved there. She slowly learned the established customs, the sayings, and the habits of the people. Eudora Welty, in her well-known essay "[Place in Fiction](#)," says that place is like a brimming frame. Point of view, according to Welty, is "a product of personal experience and time . . . and the imagination," causing the writer to see his or her picture and the world's picture superimposed in the frame of place. Welty believes the writer works best when he or she is aware of the relationship between the two [\(8\)](#). Giles's knowledge of place gained over a period of time from her many visits to Adair County and from Henry's accounts of his life on the Ridge, enriched by her interpretation of the place and its people, allows her to write as Welty recommends. Folklorist Lynwood Montell agrees, stating in "[Folklore in the Works of Janice Holt Giles](#)" that Giles's works accurately preserve "in literature certain folk elements of the culture of south central Kentucky that may never again be interpreted by a writer so familiar with the land and its people" [\(42\)](#). Giles's description of Piney Ridge and her presentation of the Ridge people show how geographic location shapes the cultural practices of a people and how the people relate to those practices in order to develop a history of the place.

The opening paragraphs of *The Enduring Hills* introduce the reader to a young Hod Pierce working before breakfast in the cornfield. The scene could be a painting, with the rising sun, the young boy in a blue work shirt, the young corn in a field on top of a ridge bordered by a pine tree, silver poplar trees, and a hickory nut tree with a wood thrush. Giles's verbal description of the Ridge continues to be as vivid as the opening scene. It shows how the lay of the land informed the lives of the people who lived there many years ago and how it controlled the kind of people who settled there.

Piney Ridge is the backbone of a knobby, stony, almost barren line of hills, lying in a remote and neglected section of South Central Kentucky. A gravel pike winds through their jutting lower slopes, but roads back into the hills are little more than trails. Green River cuts a deep gash in the hills, but for a space after it leaves the hills, it flows gently and placidly. In the rich bottoms, the land stretches black and loamy on either side. Piney Ridge rises like a

hog back from the litter of low clustering hills, and broods timelessly over old Green. Clinging to the rocky ledges, the thin level tops, and the deep-scarred hollows of Piney Ridge are the descendants of a resolute man who pushed past the great wall of the hills and settled himself and his wife behind it. This resolute man was Thomas Pierce, who had received "600 acres of land near or about Wandering Creek in the territory of Kentucky" (11) as payment for his services in the Continental Army.

Piney Ridge is so rocky and thorny and the community is so isolated that the reader easily understands why Hod is anxious to leave the Ridge and perhaps wonders why he wishes to return. *The Enduring Hills* offers a clue when Hod returns home on a furlough. Nothing was changed: "The rocks are just as sharp, the trees are just as old, the hills are just as steep" (162). The white birch in which he had carved his initials many years ago is still there, mockingbirds still sing and blue jays still squawk. As Hod walks on toward his house, he notices familiar trees and places. When he sees his house he is overcome with emotion. The house too is unchanged. Because the scenery is unchanged, Piney Ridge gives Hod a sense of identity and stability. He knows that he can return to his people who have always lived on Piney Ridge and that he will always be welcome because he is one of them.

Giles's description of winter and spring in *Miss Willie* helps the reader to picture the beauty of rural Kentucky in the 1930s and 1940s. Tara Cochrane, in *Tara's Healing*, is invigorated by the cold winter night and the December night sky. The description is so real that the reader, like Tara, is "transfixed in the atmospheric cold" (104). Like Tara, Miss Willie is carried away by the physical beauty of these isolated hills and she philosophizes that if a place can be so beautiful, surely the people are beautiful too.

The people of Piney Ridge are also beautiful in many ways, but outsiders have to search for this beauty. Matt Jasper, the pathetic, epileptic young man in *The Enduring Hills* who frightened Mary Hogan, is transformed into a beautiful person when he sings "And I, If I Be Lifted Up, Will Draw All Men Unto Me" at the ice cream social (*Miss Willie*). Wells Pierce, a weathered outdoorsman, is a beautiful person because of his kindness to and sensitivity for other people (*Miss Willie*). Jory Clark is spiritually a beautiful person (*Tara's Healing*). The loveliness of scenery can be seen when passing through a place, but the loveliness of the people can be experienced only by living and working in a place. Piney Ridge, like any other community, has crisis situations which tend to bring out the best in people. Sickness within a family such as Tom's appendectomy, Grandpa Dow's final illness (*The Enduring Hills*), and Hattie's long illness and death (*Tara's Healing*) call upon all members of the Pierce clan to do the chores for the sick person and to help the family care-givers. Happy times such as a shivaree and a house-raising call for a community celebration; tragedies, such as Matt Jasper's murder-suicide which leaves several orphaned children, call for community response. Fredy Jones's successful rehabilitation from alcoholism depends upon the patience and concern of several people.

Some of the crises on Piney Ridge could have been prevented if proper education and medical facilities had been available. However, they were not. When an area such as Piney Ridge in the 1930s and 1940s lacks such facilities, the people are dependent upon subsistence farming, moonshining, and crafts to make a living. Because currency is in short supply, the community has only what the community provides for itself. Few if any professionals go there; natives seldom leave the area because they are not prepared for the outside world. If a Ridge person does leave, he seldom returns. Hod and Mary Pierce are certainly among the exceptions. The Ridge folks are suspicious of outsiders. Mary is accepted into the community because she is Hod's wife. Miss Willie is accepted because she is Mary's aunt and because she finally marries a Pierce. Tara is accepted because of the wartime friendship with Hod. Sarah Pierce's chance to study outside the community is an opportunity that rarely presents itself to Ridge people.

The location of Piney Ridge caused educational and economic isolation, which led Ridge folks to develop sayings

peculiar to the area. Giles accurately incorporates local sayings into the conversations of the people. In *Tara's Healing*, "It had been a time and a time" is used to mean "for a long time" (166). In *Miss Willie* the expression "they'd jist got spliced" meaning "just married" is heard in conversation (194), as is "get in behind that young man" meaning "give him a spanking" (172).

The geographical isolation of the Ridge caused some people to turn to a rather fatalistic kind of religion as represented by the faith healers, the group to which John and Irma Walton belong. On the other hand, the Church of the Brethren in Christ or White Caps, as they are locally called, are a small congregation of worshipers on Piney Ridge who approach life through active service rather than fatalistic acceptance. Jory Clark lives out the doctrines of the White Caps.

The isolation of the Ridge folks causes them not to trust outsiders and to prefer the old ways. Miss Willie is constantly frustrated by the folks' acceptance of customs because they have always been done that way. Some of the customs such as the older boys playing pranks on the new school teacher and the women serving the men their meals and then eating their own meals, Miss Willie has to accept. These practices really do not harm any person on the Ridge. However, other customs such as leaving the spring at the schoolhouse uncovered and not listening to new ideas of good nutrition do prove harmful to the Ridge community. Giles tells in *The Enduring Hills* of Hod Pierce's rejecting an opportunity to go to Officers' Candidate School because his poor education makes him feel inferior to the other men. He feels that he is a successful sergeant and that he must stay in that position rather than accept promotion and risk possible failure. His "ridge attitude" robs him of an opportunity to better himself. Hattie dies because she does not want to change. She keeps her old eating habits and chooses not to have surgery. "Hits allus been done this way" and "It's the Lord's will" are two stock replies to an outsider's pleas for change.

In *The Enduring Hills*, *Miss Willie*, and *Tara's Healing*, Janice Holt Giles adopts the strategy recommended by Floyd Watkins. Like most good fiction writers, Giles "provides clutter of a world accurate for the knowing reader and yet clear to the reader who does not know the time and Place" (15). In particular, Giles documents the Ridge people's traditions of hunting and singing the foods they eat. She also documents their traditions of funerals and marriages and river baptisms. She records methods of transportation, superstitions and folk medicine. She talks about the tradition of making moonshine and the community attitudes toward moonshiners and revenueurs. Giles also tells of subsistence farmers picking tomatoes in Indiana and working in lumber camps or on WPA projects during the Depression years in order to earn desperately needed cash.

In the 1930s and 1940s, hard work and a close-knit community helped the Piney Ridge people survive and overcome, to some extent, financial crisis, war, poverty, and ignorance. The emotional stability that comes to people when they balance their place of residence with their spiritual life is as desired in contemporary America as it was then. Kent C. Ryden believes that sense of place makes literary works solid and significant: "[P]laces, or our understanding of and attachment to vanished places, sometimes feel like all that is solid in a world of change, all that is undiminished value in a world of maddening flux (95). This is the true value of Janice Holt Giles's Piney Ridge Trilogy.

Works Cited

Giles, Janice Holt. *The Enduring Hills*. Lexington, KY: UP of Kentucky, 1971.

_____. *Miss Willie*. Chicago. The People's Book Club. 1951.

_____. *Tara's Healing*. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1951.

Montell, Lynwood. "Folklore in the Works of Janice Holt Giles." Address. Campbellsville College: Campbellsville, Kentucky. Giles Symposium, 1991.

Ryden, Kent C. *Mapping the Invisible Landscape, Folklore, Writing, and the Sense of Place*. Iowa City: U of Iowa P, 1993.

Watkins, Floyd C. *In Time and Place, Some Origins of American Fiction*. Athens: U of Georgia P, 1977.

Welty, Eudora. "Place in Fiction." *Three Papers on Fiction*. Northhampton, MA: Smith College, 1962.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.
Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).
This page was last updated on 3/24/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by
Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075
E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu



Border States: Journal of the Kentucky-Tennessee American Studies Association, [No. 10 \(1995\)](#)

PINEY RIDGE TRILOGY: JANICE HOLT GILES'S ESSAY OF PLACE

Clara L. Metzmeier
Campbellsville College

A sense of place results gradually and unconsciously from inhabiting a landscape over time, becoming familiar with its physical properties, accruing a history within its confines.

Kent C. Ryden

The social history of rural Adair County, Kentucky in the 1930s and 1940s unfolds as one reads Janice Holt Giles's [The Enduring Hills \(1950\)](#), [Miss Willie \(1951\)](#), and [Tara's Healing \(1951\)](#), the novels that comprise the Piney Ridge Trilogy. Giles brings the reader to Piney Ridge by using detailed descriptions of the landscapes and by accurate reporting of the traditions and life styles of the people. Giles provides continuity of plot and setting by developing some of the same characters throughout the three novels and by constructing a literary map of Piney Ridge that includes roads, houses, woods, and hills. She adds reality and history to this map by labeling each place

with the name of the owner or the purpose of the building. Because her map includes such intimate details, it is different from a highway map or a map in a geography book. When the reader studies Giles's map, memories of Piney Ridge people recur, and a sense of place "gradually and unconsciously" forms.

The little square marked "Hod Pierce" on the Piney Ridge Map, for example, calls up more than just a house located on Whispering Creek. The reader remembers that in *The Enduring Hills*, Hod and Mary Pierce decide after the close of World War II and after a few years of working in Louisville, Kentucky, that they would live on Piney Ridge, the home of Hod's family for seven generations. The reason Hod and Mary believe it is necessary for Hod to return to his childhood home after many years' absence is that both seek a balance between their place of residence and their spiritual needs. The reader recalls that *The Enduring Hills* ends when Hod takes Mary to see Grandpa Dow's house and states that this old log building will be their home. The reader further recalls that Hod often visited Grandpa Dow, who had talked a lot about life on the Ridge, about the Pierce clan, and about reasons why the Ridge folks lived the way they did. The reader remembers that it is in the Hod Pierce house that many people begin their lives on the Ridge. Miss Willie and Tara Cochrane first live in Hod's and Mary's home when they come to the Ridge; Jeems Pierce, the first child of Hod and Mary, is born in the old log home. Thus the house, becomes a focal point for a multi-generational and multi-cultural family. The old log home helps to establish the thread that weaves through the three books: the influence of geographical location on cultural heritage and of heritage on an individual or a group of individuals. Giles helps readers to focus upon the landscape, the people, and the relationships formed between place of residence and people.

As Giles conducts a tour up and down Gaptown Pike, she stops at the mill and the school and in many houses and fields so that the reader can listen to the people's conversations and come to know them. The reader learns that these are farm families who depend upon tobacco as the main money crop, that the people are poor and uneducated, and that medical treatment is minimal. Electricity and indoor plumbing do not exist in rural Adair County in the 1930s and early 1940s. Most of the people travel around the Ridge on foot or in horse or mule drawn wagons, and they seldom travel further than The Gap. Isolated by geography, ignorance, and poverty, the people form a close-knit community. Their love of place and the security it gives them keeps them on the Ridge. There they stoically and fatalistically accept their hardships.

The Piney Ridge folks of the 1930s and 1940s accept their hardships with the "Hits allus been" attitude, often expressed in *Miss Willie*, but they are not a dismal people. They make their fun much as America's pioneer families did. They have house- and barn-raising, church dinners and singings, and pie suppers at the beginning of the school term. These functions give the people a chance to see each other and escape from drudgery into fun; they give young couples a chance to hug waists and to steal kisses. Food, the traditional sign of hospitality, is always served at these functions. The Ridge folks usually bring beans of different varieties, fried chicken, potatoes, homemade bread, and pies. The women sometimes make a social event of their sewing and mending jobs, visiting on the porch in the summer or by the fire in the winter, while they mend clothes or make quilts. The men often gather at the mill to swap news and to tell stories while the grain is being ground into flour. Such was the case when the men at the mill pay tribute to Grandpa Dow in *The Enduring Hills*. In *Tara's Healing* the men tell stories at the house raising. Gault's story of Grandpa's throwing a corn cob at an old Tom turkey tricks Tara into asking what happened to the turkey. Tara's question is the point of the story. Thus the men guffaw and slap each other on the back and tease Tara for "biting hook, line, and sinker." This episode is typical of Ridge humor. Folks have their special ways to escape the never-ending farm labor.

Janice Holt Giles did not grow up in rural Adair County, but Henry, her husband, did. He told her many of the stories about Knifley, Giles Ridge, and Caldwell Ridge that enter into her Piney Ridge Trilogy. In fact, the story of Hod and Mary Pierce as it is written in *The Enduring Hills* parallels Henry's and then Janice's and Henry's lives.

Janice, like Mary Pierce, visited the Ridge many times before she moved there. She slowly learned the established customs, the sayings, and the habits of the people. Eudora Welty, in her well-known essay "[Place in Fiction](#)," says that place is like a brimming frame. Point of view, according to Welty, is "a product of personal experience and time . . . and the imagination," causing the writer to see his or her picture and the world's picture superimposed in the frame of place. Welty believes the writer works best when he or she is aware of the relationship between the two [\(8\)](#). Giles's knowledge of place gained over a period of time from her many visits to Adair County and from Henry's accounts of his life on the Ridge, enriched by her interpretation of the place and its people, allows her to write as Welty recommends. Folklorist Lynwood Montell agrees, stating in "[Folklore in the Works of Janice Holt Giles](#)" that Giles's works accurately preserve "in literature certain folk elements of the culture of south central Kentucky that may never again be interpreted by a writer so familiar with the land and its people" [\(42\)](#). Giles's description of Piney Ridge and her presentation of the Ridge people show how geographic location shapes the cultural practices of a people and how the people relate to those practices in order to develop a history of the place.

The opening paragraphs of *The Enduring Hills* introduce the reader to a young Hod Pierce working before breakfast in the cornfield. The scene could be a painting, with the rising sun, the young boy in a blue work shirt, the young corn in a field on top of a ridge bordered by a pine tree, silver poplar trees, and a hickory nut tree with a wood thrush. Giles's verbal description of the Ridge continues to be as vivid as the opening scene. It shows how the lay of the land informed the lives of the people who lived there many years ago and how it controlled the kind of people who settled there.

Piney Ridge is the backbone of a knobby, stony, almost barren line of hills, lying in a remote and neglected section of South Central Kentucky. A gravel pike winds through their jutting lower slopes, but roads back into the hills are little more than trails. Green River cuts a deep gash in the hills, but for a space after it leaves the hills, it flows gently and placidly. In the rich bottoms, the land stretches black and loamy on either side. Piney Ridge rises like a hog back from the litter of low clustering hills, and broods timelessly over old Green. Clinging to the rocky ledges, the thin level tops, and the deep-scarred hollows of Piney Ridge are the descendants of a resolute man who pushed past the great wall of the hills and settled himself and his wife behind it. This resolute man was Thomas Pierce, who had received "600 acres of land near or about Wandering Creek in the territory of Kentucky" [\(11\)](#) as payment for his services in the Continental Army.

Piney Ridge is so rocky and thorny and the community is so isolated that the reader easily understands why Hod is anxious to leave the Ridge and perhaps wonders why he wishes to return. *The Enduring Hills* offers a clue when Hod returns home on a furlough. Nothing was changed: "The rocks are just as sharp, the trees are just as old, the hills are just as steep" [\(162\)](#). The white birch in which he had carved his initials many years ago is still there, mockingbirds still sing and blue jays still squawk. As Hod walks on toward his house, he notices familiar trees and places. When he sees his house he is overcome with emotion. The house too is unchanged. Because the scenery is unchanged, Piney Ridge gives Hod a sense of identity and stability. He knows that he can return to his people who have always lived on Piney Ridge and that he will always be welcome because he is one of them.

Giles's description of winter and spring in *Miss Willie* helps the reader to picture the beauty of rural Kentucky in the 1930s and 1940s. Tara Cochrane, in *Tara's Healing*, is invigorated by the cold winter night and the December night sky. The description is so real that the reader, like Tara, is "transfixed in the atmospheric cold" [\(104\)](#). Like Tara, Miss Willie is carried away by the physical beauty of these isolated hills and she philosophizes that if a place can be so beautiful, surely the people are beautiful too.

The people of Piney Ridge are also beautiful in many ways, but outsiders have to search for this beauty. Matt

Jasper, the pathetic, epileptic young man in *The Enduring Hills* who frightened Mary Hogan, is transformed into a beautiful person when he sings "And I, If I Be Lifted Up, Will Draw All Men Unto Me" at the ice cream social (*Miss Willie*). Wells Pierce, a weathered outdoorsman, is a beautiful person because of his kindness to and sensitivity for other people (*Miss Willie*). Jory Clark is spiritually a beautiful person (*Tara's Healing*). The loveliness of scenery can be seen when passing through a place, but the loveliness of the people can be experienced only by living and working in a place. Piney Ridge, like any other community, has crisis situations which tend to bring out the best in people. Sickness within a family such as Tom's appendectomy, Grandpa Dow's final illness (*The Enduring Hills*), and Hattie's long illness and death (*Tara's Healing*) call upon all members of the Pierce clan to do the chores for the sick person and to help the family care-givers. Happy times such as a shivaree and a house-raising call for a community celebration; tragedies, such as Matt Jasper's murder-suicide which leaves several orphaned children, call for community response. Fredy Jones's successful rehabilitation from alcoholism depends upon the patience and concern of several people.

Some of the crises on Piney Ridge could have been prevented if proper education and medical facilities had been available. However, they were not. When an area such as Piney Ridge in the 1930s and 1940s lacks such facilities, the people are dependent upon subsistence farming, moonshining, and crafts to make a living. Because currency is in short supply, the community has only what the community provides for itself. Few if any professionals go there; natives seldom leave the area because they are not prepared for the outside world. If a Ridge person does leave, he seldom returns. Hod and Mary Pierce are certainly among the exceptions. The Ridge folks are suspicious of outsiders. Mary is accepted into the community because she is Hod's wife. Miss Willie is accepted because she is Mary's aunt and because she finally marries a Pierce. Tara is accepted because of the wartime friendship with Hod. Sarah Pierce's chance to study outside the community is an opportunity that rarely presents itself to Ridge people.

The location of Piney Ridge caused educational and economic isolation, which led Ridge folks to develop sayings peculiar to the area. Giles accurately incorporates local sayings into the conversations of the people. In *Tara's Healing*, "It had been a time and a time" is used to mean "for a long time" ([166](#)). In *Miss Willie* the expression "they'd jist got spliced" meaning "just married" is heard in conversation ([194](#)), as is "get in behind that young man" meaning "give him a spanking" ([172](#)).

The geographical isolation of the Ridge caused some people to turn to a rather fatalistic kind of religion as represented by the faith healers, the group to which John and Irma Walton belong. On the other hand, the Church of the Brethren in Christ or White Caps, as they are locally called, are a small congregation of worshipers on Piney Ridge who approach life through active service rather than fatalistic acceptance. Jory Clark lives out the doctrines of the White Caps.

The isolation of the Ridge folks causes them not to trust outsiders and to prefer the old ways. Miss Willie is constantly frustrated by the folks' acceptance of customs because they have always been done that way. Some of the customs such as the older boys playing pranks on the new school teacher and the women serving the men their meals and then eating their own meals, Miss Willie has to accept. These practices really do not harm any person on the Ridge. However, other customs such as leaving the spring at the schoolhouse uncovered and not listening to new ideas of good nutrition do prove harmful to the Ridge community. Giles tells in *The Enduring Hills* of Hod Pierce's rejecting an opportunity to go to Officers' Candidate School because his poor education makes him feel inferior to the other men. He feels that he is a successful sergeant and that he must stay in that position rather than accept promotion and risk possible failure. His "ridge attitude" robs him of an opportunity to better himself. Hattie dies because she does not want to change. She keeps her old eating habits and chooses not to have surgery. "Hits allus been done this way" and "It's the Lord's will" are two stock replies to an outsider's pleas for change.

In *The Enduring Hills*, *Miss Willie*, and *Tara's Healing*, Janice Holt Giles adopts the strategy recommended by Floyd Watkins. Like most good fiction writers, Giles "provides clutter of a world accurate for the knowing reader and yet clear to the reader who does not know the time and Place" (15). In particular, Giles documents the Ridge people's traditions of hunting and singing the foods they eat. She also documents their traditions of funerals and marriages and river baptisms. She records methods of transportation, superstitions and folk medicine. She talks about the tradition of making moonshine and the community attitudes toward moonshiners and revenueurs. Giles also tells of subsistence farmers picking tomatoes in Indiana and working in lumber camps or on WPA projects during the Depression years in order to earn desperately needed cash.

In the 1930s and 1940s, hard work and a close-knit community helped the Piney Ridge people survive and overcome, to some extent, financial crisis, war, poverty, and ignorance. The emotional stability that comes to people when they balance their place of residence with their spiritual life is as desired in contemporary America as it was then. Kent C. Ryden believes that sense of place makes literary works solid and significant: "[P]laces, or our understanding of and attachment to vanished places, sometimes feel like all that is solid in a world of change, all that is undiminished value in a world of maddening flux (95). This is the true value of Janice Holt Giles's Piney Ridge Trilogy.

Works Cited

Giles, Janice Holt. *The Enduring Hills*. Lexington, KY: UP of Kentucky, 1971.

_____. *Miss Willie*. Chicago. The People's Book Club. 1951.

_____. *Tara's Healing*. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1951.

Montell, Lynwood. "Folklore in the Works of Janice Holt Giles." Address. Campbellsville College: Campbellsville, Kentucky. Giles Symposium, 1991.

Ryden, Kent C. *Mapping the Invisible Landscape, Folklore, Writing, and the Sense of Place*. Iowa City: U of Iowa P, 1993.

Watkins, Floyd C. *In Time and Place, Some Origins of American Fiction*. Athens: U of Georgia P, 1977.

Welty, Eudora. "Place in Fiction." *Three Papers on Fiction*. Northhampton, MA: Smith College, 1962.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](http://spider.georgetowncollege.edu/htallant/border/bs10/fr-metz.htm).

This page was last updated on 3/24/99. | [Border States On-Line](http://spider.georgetowncollege.edu/htallant/border/bs10/fr-metz.htm) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

TENNESSEE'S PRODIGAL DAUGHTER: EVELYN SCOTT

Caroline C. Maun
The University of Tennessee

Novelist Evelyn Scott, born Elsie Dunn in 1893, found it necessary, as a very young woman, to break with the mores of the traditional upper class family in which she was brought up in Clarksville, Tennessee. In her early writings, for example, she makes her position on the "southern belle" especially clear, exposing this role as a damaging and unrealistic model to which young southern women are compelled to aspire. Her first novel, [The Narrow House \(1921\)](#), depicts a family stifled by its adherence to social conventions, which are observed for the sake of appearances. The women of the family are trained to desire romantic love, and to be submissive to their husbands, and to devote themselves to domestic duties. Scott's first autobiography, [Escapade \(1923\)](#), tells of her experience of running away (with her lover Cyril Kay Scott) from America in general, but the American South in particular, where a woman's public virtue is perceived as the bulwark of upright society. During the six years they spent in Brazil, she experienced extreme poverty, a difficult childbirth, and failing health, all accompanied by intense artistic inspiration, which she chronicles in *Escapade*. Cyril Kay Scott developed career interests while in Brazil which forced him to travel often, leaving Evelyn Scott alone. As a foreign woman, she tried to function under the dual pressures of a socially unstable role and a strong commitment to unorthodox sexual freedom. *The Narrow House* and *Escapade* are naturalistic works which convey Scott's harsh reflection of the social conventions governing the roles of women in her native Tennessee. In this reflection, we may also discern the painful and laborious birth of her artistic self.

In view of Scott's expatriation, it is interesting to find among her works the autobiography [Background in Tennessee](#), first published in 1937, which places her in the context both of her childhood experiences of the South and the broader history of her family. She returns to the South as a successful author to reestablish, with qualification, a vital connection with the region and to conduct a reassessment of her artistic self. Years earlier, when Elsie Dunn rebaptized herself Evelyn Scott, she was not only protecting herself in her flight from possible pursuit, she was also beginning to recreate herself psychologically and aesthetically, which her autobiography *Escapade* helped her to accomplish. This self-fashioning continues in *Background in Tennessee*, with a new focus. In this book the past, a specifically southern past, is placed in the foreground to illustrate the genesis of her own artistic sensibility. As Robert Welker points out in his introduction to the 1980 facsimile reprint of *Background in Tennessee*, at the time Scott wrote her book, there was every indication that she would be addressing a wide future audience who admired her work (xi). Thus the background portrayed in *Background in Tennessee* is not simply the factual or even embellished past of Elsie Dunn, but rather the aesthetically reconstructed background of Evelyn Scott, the artistic persona into which Elsie Dunn had transformed herself.

The major purpose of this work is to ask how, in an environment unfriendly to artists, Scott was able to emerge with a heightened aesthetic sense and deeply romantic convictions. To what degree, she asks, does she remain in debt to all that she relinquished by leaving the South? To what extent does she remain in debt to the act of relinquishment itself for her artistic impulses and accomplishments? Or to put it more simply, what does Evelyn

Scott owe to Elsie Dunn, and what to Evelyn Scott? To answer these questions, Scott's *Background in Tennessee* proposes a historical treatment of Middle and East Tennessee in the light of personal and particular experiences. Historical consideration is leavened with a liberal measure of personal reflection. Scott often dwells on factual events, but always in the service of psychological probing. Most remarkably, perhaps, this psychological probing is always conducted via an intertwining of southern history and her personal history as a novelist.

Several important factors enabled Scott to assume a critical distance from her culture. She reacted skeptically to the elaborate worship of the antebellum past because her father's family was from the North and she could not fully participate in Civil War mythmaking which had become *de rigueur* in the South. The maternal side of the family, for its part, lacked Confederate heroes, although otherwise the pedigree was good. Her grandfather had been a non-combatant and took a stand against slavery, a role Scott found burdensome when representing herself to other Southerners. Scott emphasizes that the pioneer history of the region, in which her family participated, could not be far removed from the genteel veneer assumed by those made wealthy by the rise of the great tobacco and locomotive fortunes. The aristocratic pretensions of Scott's family were constantly challenged by the proximity of a rough pioneer history. Not only did she have reason to raise an eyebrow at the aristocratic affectations of her family's circle, the loss of her family's wealth during her childhood punctured the romantic facade of Scott's heritage. Such personal and family circumstances gave her the critical eye from which she looked back upon the southern way of life.

Scott maintains that for her family and for most Tennesseans, pioneer activity was too close in time to the Civil War to allow culture to develop independently of the pursuit of wealth and the affectation of prestige. While the South did, in fact, produce great artists, there were few to whom she could look for inspiration during her childhood. In *Background in Tennessee* she reveals a spiritual kinship with another American author who created a successful and authentic artistic self in spite of an adversarial cultural matrix: Mark Twain. As a young girl wintering in St. Louis, Scott caught a glimpse of Mark Twain as he entered the Saint Louis Club to join a gathering in his honor. He appeared "as I had expected him to be," dressed in white with his "satiric, kindly, hawklike face in its rampant aureole of snow-white hair" (56). She recognized later that this was "the only man who might have explained to me what I really inherited in being American! What it was that had come to me through the lives lived by my grandparents in the yet cruder days of early Tennessee! The one vital American who has preserved art, in his own person, in the environment least friendly to the artist" (57). Scott regards Twain as an authentic southern artist who managed to exist in spite of social paradoxes, and who actually drew from the cultural contradictions of the South to strengthen his fiction.

Scott reveals that the racial matrix of the South contributed to her awakening as an artist, because it was a major source of social paradox. In chapter six she recalls that when she returned to the East through Kansas, she saw crowds of blacks who descended from migrants who came from Tennessee and Kentucky after the Civil War. This sight leads her to speculate on her experience as a white in a society where peonage has supplanted slavery. She characterizes the black in the drama of American racial interaction as a "sympathetic and engaging victim," though she allows that "such aesthetic compensation may not be a substitute for economic advantage" (138). She contrasts the black's position to that of the white who has played another role: "[The black] at least has escaped the traumas which make the distorted psychology of the southern white lyncher" (138-39). The violence that existed without social interpretation presented a paradox for her childhood sensibility. One of the central images in *Background in Tennessee* is a memory of three cedars in a graveyard which her father indicated as the site of a triple lynching. What is remarkable about these trees (aside from the Biblical parallel) is that they are no different in appearance from other trees in other states, and even other regions -- except for three sinister knotholes in the trunks near the roots (145). She finds it difficult to accept the fact that those she loves engaged in or condoned lynching. The

community has participated in mob violence, yet extends kindness to little girls (144-45). In all of the anecdotes surrounding her early impressions of blacks, Scott is faced with the presence of both good and evil. She is left "Wondering, wondering what was to be done, and why even the very nice people I knew seemed to care so little!" (166). These feelings and reflections engendered a permanent unease which fostered her deep skepticism about the South. Her trust in goodness was shattered when she recognized the duplicity inherent in the foundations of her culture.

Chapter Seven begins and ends with the injunction: "Everything had to go!" meaning that Scott as a teenage girl conducted, to the extent that she could, a "reassessment of cultural values" (210). This allowed her to develop a method of seeing beyond the beliefs of other Southerners, beyond beliefs which she fundamentally distrusted. In so doing, she gained a spiritual victory. She expresses it: "[M]y faith in Tennessee-- which was the world-- suffered the first of a series of shocks, which, cumulatively, would have caused rifts and cracks in the foundations of Rome" (167). The actual relations of blacks and whites were, as she witnessed them, fundamentally different from their public representations. Indeed, her characteristic habit as an observer of racial injustice was to recognize a fundamental humanity, where the society attempted to block off the common ground between the races. This tendency resulted in contradictions. In fact, she states that such conflicts informed her aesthetically: the struggles of the South provided her with a sense of tragedy, even though intellectually she rejected the received representations of its history. She explains this contribution in the following way: "I think that what had happened to the South filled me, in my impressionable childhood, with a precocious half awareness of men's perishable ambitions" (122).

Strangely enough, blows to her vanity severed her last thread of loyalty to the southern belle. As a young child she was a vision of porcelain blonde beauty (a stunning picture of her at age seven can be found as the frontispiece of *Background in Tennessee*), until a near-fatal bout with malaria caused her to break out in boils. Her mother cut Scott's hair short, but she dressed her in a particular frilly outfit with a wide sash, in an effort to try to make the child feel better about her appearance. As she approached a creek to play with other children, a boy dared the future writer to "show [herself] worthy of his contemptuous notice by crossing the creek after him" on slippery stepping stones (173). Scott reminds us of the irony of her situation by emphasizing how woefully unsuited for this activity the slippers of little girls are; nevertheless, she attempts the feat and falls in halfway across the creek. In the aftermath of her plunge she runs to the woods, describing the frippery of her dress as transformed into a "sort of suppurating, blistering epidermis" by the water, an irrefutable symbol of her shame and anger at not having a fair chance to succeed when matched in physical endeavors with a boy (175). This experience, coupled with a love disappointment in her teens, increased her resistance to melding placidly with the expectations of society. Prescribed female roles comprise perhaps the major target of Scott's rebellion, and she supplies the most vivid aesthetic memories regarding this subject.

Scott's development of her aesthetic sense is as important to *Background in Tennessee* as her outrage at social injustice, because it explains a powerful mediating force in her social criticism. After her position as a rebel was established, Scott's sensibility caused her to develop as an artist and not as an activist. An unusual example of this type of formative experience occurred when she saw a flag at half-mast for the first time lowered at the schoolhouse after President McKinley's death. She characterizes the sight as a transforming revelation, not especially because of the president's death but because the flag, a symbol she has heretofore known as a "dance of unquenchable color and gaiety in the sky itself" had been transformed into a sagging symbol of vacancy. She specifies: "What stunned me was the abrupt realization that there was a language of *things*..." (195). In this memory she isolates her first understanding of the reach of symbolism, certainly a key insight for a future fiction writer.

Significant aesthetic episodes also occurred in cave explorations with childhood friends. At Dunbar Cave, near Clarksville, Scott and her friends found themselves separated from adults, deep within a cave that had a river running in it. Despite the darkness, the group was impelled to go further until they could no longer see; they lost balance and slipped down a decline "to we knew not what end" (204). They reached a place "more treacherous than any bottom of a pit," because in a pit "you can, if you will, discover what encloses you--your confinement has investigable limits!" (204-5). As they climbed slowly out of the unknown, she says that even as children they felt "the evil receptivity of the abyss" next to them. This is how Scott frequently characterizes death--consciousness--as a sinisterly peaceful relinquishing of life force rather than as a violent battle. Escape from the cave is described as a significant rebirth out of the womb of death. A second cave experience occurred at Porter's Bluff, where she and friends were startled to hear human voices while exploring a cave. Approaching stealthily, she witnessed "five or six Negro men squatted in a circle, shooting craps," the dice becoming in her mind a symbol for Chance itself. These two experiences in caves combined later to move Scott toward the contemplation of death: "It was not until years later I realized we had been where, whether or no, we must go again" (207).

A reader of Scott is drawn to the importance and specificity of the themes of both imprisonment and escape in her writing, the cave experiences being notable examples. Escape is never merely leaving reality behind; in her case it is a fresh and more authentic apprehension of reality. With Scott, there is always a return and a sense of deep responsibility. *Background in Tennessee* itself represents a return from the experiences represented in her first autobiography, *Escapade*. Drawing on the theme of imprisonment, the final chapter of *Background in Tennessee* closes with a remarkable set of paired images. On a trip through the Midwest, Scott's family stopped to tour a state penitentiary. Scott, as a young girl, recognized the individual human qualities of the prisoners before the visit concluded, yet the warden chose to guide her hand to throw the lever that locked the men in their cells. This was profoundly troubling to the young Evelyn because once again she was confronted with questions. Her grandfather then took her hand and guided her in waving goodbye to the prisoners who gathered at the windows. It seemed as if all the prisoners crowded the windows waved with "kind jocularly." She describes it as "for all the world, like the suddenly spontaneous proclamation of good will on earth! Like the enactment of a beatitude!" (299). Leaving the area, she saw, a convent for the first time, and her mother explained that the nuns were not prisoners, but tremendously good, with the minor exception of those who joined to "escape some disastrous love affair" (301). This exception was no minor one for the young girl. Both nuns and convicts separated by gender--had intent and isolation and humanity in common. Their similarities and differences thus raised ethical questions for the sensitive Scott. The ambiguity of her experiences of the prison and the convent, kindness from the evil men and the moral questionability of supposedly holy women, served in her mind to confirm the overlapping quality of good and evil, which the South would continue to maintain with all rigidity.

In characterizing her aesthetic, romantic sensibility about halfway through *Background in Tennessee*, Scott explains that the conflicts she experienced with the South were characterized by both anxiety and exuberance. She says that in a quest to apprehend the beautiful, "we begin to cling to whatever offers hope of that permanence we ourselves continually threaten by the overintensity with which we welcome or abhor the passing hour; and, in aesthetics, seek feverishly for the classical antidote--the simulacrum of what may last!...It is perhaps, by this time, almost beyond the point to add I never found it in Clarksville or in Tennessee" (196). At the close of *Background in Tennessee*, however, one wonders if Scott didn't reassess her position on even this point through the process of writing. She closes with what amounts to a prayer for peace--not for a reconciliation or a refabrication of the paradoxes of her southern past, but rather for a peace that will allow her to "bless the failures which conclude our efforts--raptures of ending" (302). This would seem to be the most complete return to her origins. She shows, through the act of writing about her apprehension of her past, that she may reconstitute it. The conflicts that fueled a novelist, she indicates, can be transcended in this ultimate act of aesthetic will.

WORKS CONSULTED

- Bach, Peggy. "Evelyn Scott: 1920-1988." *Bulletin of Bibliography* 46.2 (1989): 76-91.
- Callard, D.A. *"Pretty Good for a Woman": The Enigmas of Evelyn Scott*. New York: Norton, 1985.
- Carrigg, Mary Ethel. "Escape from *The Narrow House*: The Autobiographies and Fiction of Evelyn Scott". Diss. University of Wisconsin-Madison, 1978.
- Scott, Evelyn. *Background in Tennessee*. New York: McBride, 1937; rpt. Knoxville: U of Tennessee P, 1980.
- _____. *Escapade*. New York: Seltzer, 1923.
- _____. *The Narrow House*. New York: Boni and Liveright, 1921.
- Welker, Robert L. "Evelyn Scott: A Literary Biography." Diss. Vanderbilt University, 1958.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 4/1/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College

400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu



Border States: Journal of the Kentucky-Tennessee American Studies Association, [No. 10](#) (1995)

TENNESSEE'S PRODIGAL DAUGHTER: EVELYN SCOTT

Caroline C. Maun

The University of Tennessee

Novelist Evelyn Scott, born Elsie Dunn in 1893, found it necessary, as a very young woman, to break with the mores of the traditional upper class family in which she was brought up in Clarksville, Tennessee. In her early writings, for example, she makes her position on the "southern belle" especially clear, exposing this role as a damaging and unrealistic model to which young southern women are compelled to aspire. Her first novel, [The](#)

[*Narrow House* \(1921\)](#), depicts a family stifled by its adherence to social conventions, which are observed for the sake of appearances. The women of the family are trained to desire romantic love, and to be submissive to their husbands, and to devote themselves to domestic duties. Scott's first autobiography, [*Escapade* \(1923\)](#), tells of her experience of running away (with her lover Cyril Kay Scott) from America in general, but the American South in particular, where a woman's public virtue is perceived as the bulwark of upright society. During the six years they spent in Brazil, she experienced extreme poverty, a difficult childbirth, and failing health, all accompanied by intense artistic inspiration, which she chronicles in *Escapade*. Cyril Kay Scott developed career interests while in Brazil which forced him to travel often, leaving Evelyn Scott alone. As a foreign woman, she tried to function under the dual pressures of a socially unstable role and a strong commitment to unorthodox sexual freedom. *The Narrow House* and *Escapade* are naturalistic works which convey Scott's harsh reflection of the social conventions governing the roles of women in her native Tennessee. In this reflection, we may also discern the painful and laborious birth of her artistic self.

In view of Scott's expatriation, it is interesting to find among her works the autobiography [*Background in Tennessee*](#), first published in 1937, which places her in the context both of her childhood experiences of the South and the broader history of her family. She returns to the South as a successful author to reestablish, with qualification, a vital connection with the region and to conduct a reassessment of her artistic self. Years earlier, when Elsie Dunn rebaptized herself Evelyn Scott, she was not only protecting herself in her flight from possible pursuit, she was also beginning to recreate herself psychologically and aesthetically, which her autobiography *Escapade* helped her to accomplish. This self-fashioning continues in *Background in Tennessee*, with a new focus. In this book the past, a specifically southern past, is placed in the foreground to illustrate the genesis of her own artistic sensibility. As Robert Welker points out in his introduction to the 1980 facsimile reprint of *Background in Tennessee*, at the time Scott wrote her book, there was every indication that she would be addressing a wide future audience who admired her work (xi). Thus the background portrayed in *Background in Tennessee* is not simply the factual or even embellished past of Elsie Dunn, but rather the aesthetically reconstructed background of Evelyn Scott, the artistic persona into which Elsie Dunn had transformed herself.

The major purpose of this work is to ask how, in an environment unfriendly to artists, Scott was able to emerge with a heightened aesthetic sense and deeply romantic convictions. To what degree, she asks, does she remain in debt to all that she relinquished by leaving the South? To what extent does she remain in debt to the act of relinquishment itself for her artistic impulses and accomplishments? Or to put it more simply, what does Evelyn Scott owe to Elsie Dunn, and what to Evelyn Scott? To answer these questions, Scott's *Background in Tennessee* proposes a historical treatment of Middle and East Tennessee in the light of personal and particular experiences. Historical consideration is leavened with a liberal measure of personal reflection. Scott often dwells on factual events, but always in the service of psychological probing. Most remarkably, perhaps, this psychological probing is always conducted via an intertwining of southern history and her personal history as a novelist.

Several important factors enabled Scott to assume a critical distance from her culture. She reacted skeptically to the elaborate worship of the antebellum past because her father's family was from the North and she could not fully participate in Civil War mythmaking which had become *de rigueur* in the South. The maternal side of the family, for its part, lacked Confederate heroes, although otherwise the pedigree was good. Her grandfather had been a non-combatant and took a stand against slavery, a role Scott found burdensome when representing herself to other Southerners. Scott emphasizes that the pioneer history of the region, in which her family participated, could not be far removed from the genteel veneer assumed by those made wealthy by the rise of the great tobacco and locomotive fortunes. The aristocratic pretensions of Scott's family were constantly challenged by the proximity of a rough pioneer history. Not only did she have reason to raise an eyebrow at the aristocratic affectations of her

family's circle, the loss of her family's wealth during her childhood punctured the romantic facade of Scott's heritage. Such personal and family circumstances gave her the critical eye from which she looked back upon the southern way of life.

Scott maintains that for her family and for most Tennesseans, pioneer activity was too close in time to the Civil War to allow culture to develop independently of the pursuit of wealth and the affectation of prestige. While the South did, in fact, produce great artists, there were few to whom she could look for inspiration during her childhood. In *Background in Tennessee* she reveals a spiritual kinship with another American author who created a successful and authentic artistic self in spite of an adversarial cultural matrix: Mark Twain. As a young girl wintering in St. Louis, Scott caught a glimpse of mark Twain as he entered the Saint Louis Club to join a gathering in his honor. He appeared "as I had expected him to be," dressed in white with his "satiric, kindly, hawklike face in its rampant aureole of snow-white hair" (56). She recognized later that this was "the only man who might have explained to me what I really inherited in being American! What it was that had come to me through the lives lived by my grandparents in the yet cruder days of early Tennessee! The one vital American who has preserved art, in his own person, in the environment least friendly to the artist" (57). Scott regards Twain as an authentic southern artist who managed to exist in spite of social paradoxes, and who actually drew from the cultural contradictions of the South to strengthen his fiction.

Scott reveals that the racial matrix of the South contributed to her awakening as an artist, because it was a major source of social paradox. In chapter six she recalls that when she returned to the East through Kansas, she saw crowds of blacks who descended from migrants who came from Tennessee and Kentucky after the Civil War. This sight leads her to speculate on her experience as a white in a society where peonage has supplanted slavery. She characterizes the black in the drama of American racial interaction as a "sympathetic and engaging victim," though she allows that "such aesthetic compensation may not be a substitute for economic advantage" (138). She contrasts the black's position to that of the white who has played another role: "[The black] at least has escaped the traumas which make the distorted psychology of the southern white lyncher" (138-39). The violence that existed without social interpretation presented a paradox for her childhood sensibility. One of the central images in *Background in Tennessee* is a memory of three cedars in a graveyard which her father indicated as the site of a triple lynching. What is remarkable about these trees (aside from the Biblical parallel) is that they are no different in appearance from other trees in other states, and even other regions -- except for three sinister knotholes in the trunks near the roots (145). She finds it difficult to accept the fact that those she loves engaged in or condoned lynching. The community has participated in mob violence, yet extends kindness to little girls (144-45). In all of the anecdotes surrounding her early impressions of blacks, Scott is faced with the presence of both good and evil. She is left "Wondering, wondering what was to be done, and why even the very nice people I knew seemed to care so little!" (166). These feelings and reflections engendered a permanent unease which fostered her deep skepticism about the South. Her trust in goodness was shattered when she recognized the duplicity inherent in the foundations of her culture.

Chapter Seven begins and ends with the injunction: "Everything had to go!" meaning that Scott as a teenage girl conducted, to the extent that she could, a "reassessment of cultural values" (210). This allowed her to develop a method of seeing beyond the beliefs of other Southerners, beyond beliefs which she fundamentally distrusted. In so doing, she gained a spiritual victory. She expresses it: "[M]y faith in Tennessee-- which was the world-- suffered the first of a series of shocks, which, cumulatively, would have caused rifts and cracks in the foundations of Rome" (167). The actual relations of blacks and whites were, as she witnessed them, fundamentally different from their public representations. Indeed, her characteristic habit as an observer of racial injustice was to recognize a fundamental humanity, where the society attempted to block off the common ground between the races. This

tendency resulted in contradictions. In fact, she states that such conflicts informed her aesthetically: the struggles of the South provided her with a sense of tragedy, even though intellectually she rejected the received representations of its history. She explains this contribution in the following way: "I think that what had happened to the South filled me, in my impressionable childhood, with a precocious half awareness of men's perishable ambitions" (122).

Strangely enough, blows to her vanity severed her last thread of loyalty to the southern belle. As a young child she was a vision of porcelain blonde beauty (a stunning picture of her at age seven can be found as the frontispiece of *Background in Tennessee*), until a near-fatal bout with malaria caused her to break out in boils. Her mother cut Scott's hair short, but she dressed her in a particular frilly outfit with a wide sash, in an effort to try to make the child feel better about her appearance. As she approached a creek to play with other children, a boy dared the future writer to "show [herself] worthy of his contemptuous notice by crossing the creek after him" on slippery stepping stones (173). Scott reminds us of the irony of her situation by emphasizing how woefully unsuited for this activity the slippers of little girls are; nevertheless, she attempts the feat and falls in halfway across the creek. In the aftermath of her plunge she runs to the woods, describing the frippery of her dress as transformed into a "sort of suppurating, blistering epidermis" by the water, an irrefutable symbol of her shame and anger at not having a fair chance to succeed when matched in physical endeavors with a boy (175). This experience, coupled with a love disappointment in her teens, increased her resistance to melding placidly with the expectations of society. Prescribed female roles comprise perhaps the major target of Scott's rebellion, and she supplies the most vivid aesthetic memories regarding this subject.

Scott's development of her aesthetic sense is as important to *Background in Tennessee* as her outrage at social injustice, because it explains a powerful mediating force in her social criticism. After her position as a rebel was established, Scott's sensibility caused her to develop as an artist and not as an activist. An unusual example of this type of formative experience occurred when she saw a flag at half-mast for the first time lowered at the schoolhouse after President McKinley's death. She characterizes the sight as a transforming revelation, not especially because of the president's death but because the flag, a symbol she has heretofore known as a "dance of unquenchable color and gaiety in the sky itself" had been transformed into a sagging symbol of vacancy. She specifies: "What stunned me was the abrupt realization that there was a language of *things*..." (195). In this memory she isolates her first understanding of the reach of symbolism, certainly a key insight for a future fiction writer.

Significant aesthetic episodes also occurred in cave explorations with childhood friends. At Dunbar Cave, near Clarksville, Scott and her friends found themselves separated from adults, deep within a cave that had a river running in it. Despite the darkness, the group was impelled to go further until they could no longer see; they lost balance and slipped down a decline "to we knew not what end" (204). They reached a place "more treacherous than any bottom of a pit," because in a pit "you can, if you will, discover what encloses you--your confinement has investigable limits!" (204-5). As they climbed slowly out of the unknown, she says that even as children they felt "the evil receptivity of the abyss" next to them. This is how Scott frequently characterizes death--consciousness--as a sinisterly peaceful relinquishing of life force rather than as a violent battle. Escape from the cave is described as a significant rebirth out of the womb of death. A second cave experience occurred at Porter's Bluff, where she and friends were startled to hear human voices while exploring a cave. Approaching stealthily, she witnessed "five or six Negro men squatted in a circle, shooting craps," the dice becoming in her mind a symbol for Chance itself. These two experiences in caves combined later to move Scott toward the contemplation of death: "It was not until years later I realized we had been where, whether or no, we must go again" (207).

A reader of Scott is drawn to the importance and specificity of the themes of both imprisonment and escape in her writing, the cave experiences being notable examples. Escape is never merely leaving reality behind; in her case it is a fresh and more authentic apprehension of reality. With Scott, there is always a return and a sense of deep responsibility. *Background in Tennessee* itself represents a return from the experiences represented in her first autobiography, *Escapade*. Drawing on the theme of imprisonment, the final chapter of *Background in Tennessee* closes with a remarkable set of paired images. On a trip through the Midwest, Scott's family stopped to tour a state penitentiary. Scott, as a young girl, recognized the individual human qualities of the prisoners before the visit concluded, yet the warden chose to guide her hand to throw the lever that locked the men in their cells. This was profoundly troubling to the young Evelyn because once again she was confronted with questions. Her grandfather then took her hand and guided her in waving goodbye to the prisoners who gathered at the windows. It seemed as if all the prisoners crowded the windows waved with "kind jocularity." She describes it as "for all the world, like the suddenly spontaneous proclamation of good will on earth! Like the enactment of a beatitude!" (299). Leaving the area, she saw, a convent for the first time, and her mother explained that the nuns were not prisoners, but tremendously good, with the minor exception of those who joined to "escape some disastrous love affair" (301). This exception was no minor one for the young girl. Both nuns and convicts separated by gender--had intent and isolation and humanity in common. Their similarities and differences thus raised ethical questions for the sensitive Scott. The ambiguity of her experiences of the prison and the convent, kindness from the evil men and the moral questionability of supposedly holy women, served in her mind to confirm the overlapping quality of good and evil, which the South would continue to maintain with all rigidity.

In characterizing her aesthetic, romantic sensibility about halfway through *Background in Tennessee*, Scott explains that the conflicts she experienced with the South were characterized by both anxiety and exuberance. She says that in a quest to apprehend the beautiful, "we begin to cling to whatever offers hope of that permanence we ourselves continually threaten by the overintensity with which we welcome or abhor the passing hour; and, in aesthetics, seek feverishly for the classical antidote--the simulacrum of what may last!...It is perhaps, by this time, almost beyond the point to add I never found it in Clarksville or in Tennessee" (196). At the close of *Background in Tennessee*, however, one wonders if Scott didn't reassess her position on even this point through the process of writing. She closes with what amounts to a prayer for peace--not for a reconciliation or a refabrication of the paradoxes of her southern past, but rather for a peace that will allow her to "bless the failures which conclude our efforts--raptures of ending" (302). This would seem to be the most complete return to her origins. She shows, through the act of writing about her apprehension of her past, that she may reconstitute it. The conflicts that fueled a novelist, she indicates, can be transcended in this ultimate act of aesthetic will.

WORKS CONSULTED

Bach, Peggy. "Evelyn Scott: 1920-1988." *Bulletin of Bibliography* 46.2 (1989): 76-91.

Callard, D.A. *"Pretty Good for a Woman": The Enigmas of Evelyn Scott*. New York: Norton, 1985.

Carrigg, Mary Ethel. "Escape from *The Narrow House*: The Autobiographies and Fiction of Evelyn Scott". Diss. University of Wisconsin-Madison, 1978.

Scott, Evelyn. *Background in Tennessee*. New York: McBride, 1937; rpt. Knoxville: U of Tennessee P, 1980.

_____. *Escapade*. New York: Seltzer, 1923.

_____. *The Narrow House*. New York: Boni and Liveright, 1921.

Welker, Robert L. "Evelyn Scott: A Literary Biography." Diss. Vanderbilt University, 1958.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 4/1/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College

400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

WENDELL BERRY: PEOPLE, LAND AND FIDELITY

M. A. Grubbs
University of Kentucky

Wendell Berry lives and farms with his family in Henry County, Kentucky, and is the author of more than thirty books of fiction, non-fiction, and poetry. Among his novels (set in the fictional community of Port William Kentucky) are *Nathan Coulter* (1960), *A Place on Earth* (1967), and *The Memory of Old Jack* (1974); short story collections include *The Wild Birds* (1986), *Remembering* (1988), *Fidelity* (1993), and *Watch With Me* (1994); collections of essays include, among many others, *A Continuous Harmony* (1972), *The Unsettling of America* (1977), *Recollected Essays* (1981), and *Sex, Economy, Freedom, & Community* (1993); and among his many volumes of poetry are *A Part* (1980), *The Wheel* (1982), *Collected Poems* (1985) and *Entries* (1984).

In a commencement address delivered in June 1989 at the College of the Atlantic in Bar Harbor, Maine, Berry gave some advice that to most modern graduates would sound old fashioned, indeed backward. But the advice he gave was timeless, and his reminder seems apocalyptic in view of the world's current environmental crisis and, as Berry sees it, America's cultural crisis. In a sense, Berry's deliverance of such a critical message parallels Moses' deliverance of the Ten Commandments, for Berry's advice is also a prescription for cultural healing through the imposition of a set of laws. The laws Berry delivers, however, seem to be Nature's laws. He closed his address (later published in *Harper's* as "[The Futility of Global Thinking](#)") with a series of ten commands, which, he said, "is simply my hope for us all" ([22](#)). These instructions are at the heart of Berry's personal and literary world, and collectively they express the thesis informing all of his work, a canon now in excess of thirty books of essays, fiction, and poetry:

1. Beware the justice of Nature.
2. Understand that there can be no successful human economy apart from Nature or in defiance of Nature.
3. Understand that no amount of education can overcome the innate limits of human intelligence and responsibility. We are not smart enough or conscious enough or alert enough to work responsibly on a gigantic scale.
4. In making things always bigger and more centralized, we make them both more vulnerable in themselves and more dangerous to everything else. Learn, therefore, to prefer small-scale elegance and generosity to large-scale greed, crudity, and glamour.
5. Make a home. Help to make a community. Be loyal to what you have made.
6. Put the interest of the community first.
7. Love your neighbors--not the neighbors you pick out, but the ones you have.
8. Love this miraculous world that we did not make, that is a gift to us.
9. As far as you are able make your lives dependent upon your local place, neighborhood, and household--which thrive by care and generosity--and independent of the industrial economy, which thrives by damage.
10. Find work, if you can, that does no damage. Enjoy your work. Work well. ([22](#))

Viewed in the context of Berry's canon, this sequence represents far more than a neo-romantic or agrarian appeal to return to "simplicity." To think of his advice in this way is to misinterpret it, for it is more of an oracular warning; either rethink our attitudes toward each other and the natural world, Berry implores, or continue on a path toward natural-, cultural-, and self-annihilation.

Although Berry's tenets echo those of many of his literary ancestors in American literature, his advice is more critical than that of his predecessors, for we now more than ever threaten our existence with destructive potentials unimaginable only a few decades ago. Berry explains our critical condition in "The Loss of the Future," an essay in *The Long-Legged House*:

We have reached a point at which we must either consciously desire and choose and determine the future of the earth or submit to such an involvement in our destructiveness that the earth, and ourselves with it, must certainly be destroyed. And we have come to this at a time when it is hard, if not impossible, to foresee a future that is not terrifying. (46)

Berry's work is an ongoing exploration of man's use of and relationship to the land, and his writing constitutes, as Gary Tolliver has said, one man's "continuing search for avenues of reentry into a proper state of harmony with the natural world" (13). To proponents of modern "progress," Berry's ideas must seem regressive, unrealistic, radical. But no advice could be more needed and more practical, if we are to progress.

Berry's life, his farm work, his writing and teaching, his home and family, and all that each involves are extraordinarily integrated. He understands his writing as an attempt to elucidate certain connections, primarily the interrelationships and interdependencies of man and the natural world. One of his premises in *The Unsettling of America* at once evinces his notion of cultural and natural interdependency: "Everything in the Creation is related to everything else and dependent on everything else" (46). *The Unsettling of America* is about connections and thus ramifications.

Arnold Ehrlich has called the book "a cool, reasoned, lucid and at times poetic explanation of what agribusiness and the mechanization of farming are doing to destroy the American fabric, the community, the household, even the sexual love that is at the basis of *communitas*" (10).

The traditional community is one of Berry's central metaphors for cultural and natural harmony. Such a community is a highly intricate alliance in which individuals function as "parts" of a membership, each depending on and affecting all the others. The traditional community, like the traditional farms within it, is a model of interdependency. Berry explains, "A community is the mental and spiritual condition of knowing that the place is shared, and that the people who share the place define and limit the possibilities of each other's lives" (LLH 61).

Such an intertwinement of lives is a way of describing a traditional community dance, which is usually circular and cyclic and involves several couples, each partner relying on the other, each couple relying on other couples. The result of this interdependence among the dancers, if each dancer has learned the motions, is harmony. Gurney Norman, a friend of Berry's, has explained that "something basic to people's welfare is present in this sort of community dancing; it has to do with people knowing how to affirm one another and to cooperate, and how to have a good time." The dancers move to the music through the intricacies of the dance, and as each sequence is completed, the cycle begins again. In "People, Land, and Community," an essay in *Standing by Words*, Berry speaks of the analogy between an interweaving dance and the traditional community. While elucidating this metaphor for cultural and natural harmony, he brings together his cyclic ideas of traditional work, apprenticeship,

and the dead as an intricate part of the living:

People at work in communities three generations old would know that their bodies renewed, time and again, the movements of other bodies, living and dead, known and loved, remembered and loved, in the same shops, houses, and fields. That, of course, is a kind of community dance. And such a dance is perhaps the best way we have to describe harmony. (79)

Berry uses the dance metaphor throughout his poetry to describe harmony between humans and nature, between the living and the dead of a community, and between members of the living. The music accompanying the dancers is sometimes the music of the spheres (the notes of which are so drawn out they can be heard only over years, decades, even centuries). Other sources of the music are farmers working or whistling a work song in a field, people working together harmoniously in communities, water running in a stream, and rain.

The modern agricultural crisis, as Berry sees it, is a consequence of widening the gap between the way nature farms and the way man farms. Many modern agricultural theories and practices assume universal applications. But such attitudes and practices constitute an affront to Nature--that is, the particular Nature of a particular place. Traditional farmers are sensitive to the particular needs of their farms; through the years and generations they have looked to the Nature of their place to judge which practices, plants, and animals work and thrive the best, given the farm's conditions: "A man ought to study the wilderness of a place" (LLH 206). He explains *The Unsettling of America* that "the land is too various in its kinds, climates, conditions, declivities, aspects, and histories to conform to any generalized understanding or to prosper under generalized treatment...

To treat every field, or every part of every field, with the same consideration is not farming but industry" (31). Farmers, he says in a later essay, "must tend to farms that they know and love, farms small enough to know and love, using tools and methods that they know and love, in the company of neighbors that they know and love" (*What Are People For?* 210).

Berry believes that a "place" has its own ruling Nature. Thus, Berry stresses that a traditional farmer will always consider and adapt his practices to the needs of the land's primal character. Successful and sustainable agriculture, then, as Berry understands it, is possible only by maintaining a cyclic vision, one attuned with Nature, rather than a linear vision, one seeking conquest of Nature.

The more a person is removed from the substance of his work, Berry argues, the greater is his tendency to neglect or to ignore it. He says that a traditional farmer "will walk his fields out of interest; the industrial farmer or manager only out of necessity" (UA 188). Traditional care requires a comprehensive, intimate, often passionate knowledge of the Nature of one's place. Berry writes, for example, in *The Unsettling of America*, "A healthy farm culture can be based only upon familiarity and can grow only among a people soundly established upon the land; it nourishes and safeguards a human intelligence of the earth that no amount of technology can satisfactorily replace" (43). Berry is the fifth generation of his father's family and the sixth generation of his mother's to farm in Henry County, Kentucky. Loyal to the cyclic vision, he knows the history of his ancestors on the land, and he understands how each has affected the other.

To Berry, farming the land requires the same discipline as writing a poem. John Ditsky calls farming Berry's "paradigm of art" (13). And Leon Driskell says frankly that Berry "is the same person when writing as when plowing" (63). Traditional farmers, like artists, learn their art through a kind of cultural process, the cyclic view of education, rather than through training or programming, the linear view. Berry explains that the best farming

grows not only out of factual knowledge but out of cultural tradition; it is learned not only by precept but by example, by apprenticeship; and it requires not merely a competent knowledge of its facts and processes, but also a complex set of attitudes, a certain culturally evolved stance, in the face of the unexpected and the unknown. That is to say, it requires *style* in the highest and richest sense of that term. ([CH 98](#))

Like the farmer, the poet must stay in tune with the natural processes of his world, because "the rhythms of the land are an analogue by which we understand ourselves" ([Prunty 958](#)).

Berry's artistic vision of agricultural work, then, is diametrically opposed to the industrial vision which maximizes agricultural mechanization in order to minimize human interaction with and care of the land. Separating humans as far as possible from Nature in practice has created a character-killing and "community-killing agriculture, with its monomania of bigness" ([UA 41](#)).

The modern linear view of progress not only has destroyed many of America's farmlands; it also has been the driving force behind strip mining, deforestation, pollution, and has widened the gap between culture and nature. The current natural resource crisis, in Berry's view, is a direct consequence of our character, and thus the only real hope lies in the change of attitudes. But for such a change to occur and be effective, Berry contends, it must begin on the local level, not under the guise of national "movements." Berry says in "The Futility of Global Thinking" that "the civil rights movement has not given us better communities. The women's movement has not given us better marriages or better households. The environment movement has not changed our parasitic relationship to nature" ([17](#)).

Aside from our suicidal depletion of natural resources, one of Berry's concerns is that our attitude towards the land necessitates our estrangement from it. Berry has said that "my sense of values comes from what I'm rooted in, what I believe in" ([Ehrlich 11](#)). To him, Nature, more specifically, the Nature of his particular place, serves as a moral teacher. In "The Nature Consumers," an essay in *The Long-Legged House*, Berry explains one of the dangers inherent in our longing to separate ourselves from the land:

Man cannot be independent of nature. In one way or another he must live in relation to it, and there are only two alternatives: the way of the frontiersman, whose response to nature was to dominate it, to assert his presence in it by destroying it; or the way of Thoreau, who went to natural places to become quiet in them, to learn from them, to be restored by them. To know these places, because to know them is to need them and respect them and be humble before the, is to preserve them. To fail to know them, because ignorance can only be greedy of them, is to destroy them. ([41-42](#))

Berry's canon constitutes an urgent call to reevaluate both our use of Nature's "gifts" and our view of ourselves. And it is a plea to redirect our environmental concerns from the abstract notion of our "planet" to the more grounded, familiar notion of our "place" - our homes and our communities. In his address, Berry asked the Bar Harbor graduates, "How, after all, can anybody-- any particular body--do anything to heal a planet?" and he answered, "Nobody can do anything to heal a planet. The suggestion that anybody could do so is preposterous. The heroes of abstraction keep galloping in on their white horses to save the planet--and they keep falling off in front of the grandstand" ("[Futility](#)" [16](#)).

Berry's premise, implicit, often explicit, in almost all of his work, is that we must have a particular place, must

identify with it, must learn from it, must love it, must care for it. And only by living in this place long enough, and by attending to the knowledge of those who have lived there before us, will we fully realize the consequences of our presence there: "We may deeply affect a place we own for good or ill," Berry has written, "but our lives are nevertheless included in its life; it will survive us, bearing the results" ([LLH 143](#)).

WORKS CITED

- Berry, Wendell. *A Continuous Harmony: Essays Cultural and Agricultural*. (CH) New York: Harcourt, 1972.
- . "The Futility of Global Thinking." *Harper's Magazine* Sept. 1989: 16-22. (Adapted from "Word and Flesh, an essay in *What Are People For?*")
- . *The Long-Legged House*. (LLH) New York: Harcourt, 1969.
- . *Standing by Words*. (SBW) San Francisco: North Point, 1983.
- . *The Unsettling of America: Culture and Agriculture*. (UA) 1977. San Francisco: Sierra Club, 1986.
- . *What Are People For?* (WPF) San Francisco: North Point, 1990.
- Ditsky, John. "Wendell Berry: Homage to the Apple Tree." *Modern Poetry Studies* 2.1 (1971): 7-15.
- Driskell, Leon V. "Wendell Berry." *Dictionary of Literary Biography* 5: 62-66.
- Ehrlich, Arnold W. "Wendell Berry" (An interview with Wendell Berry). *Publishers Weekly* 5 Sept. 1977: 10-11.
- Norman, Gurney. *From This Valley*. Kentucky Educational Television Video.
- Prunty, Wyatt. "Myth, History, and Myth Again." *The Southern Review* 20 (1984): 958-68.
- Tolliver, Gary. "Wendell Berry." *Dictionary of Literary Biography* 6: 9-14.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 4/1/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College

400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

WENDELL BERRY: PEOPLE, LAND AND FIDELITY

M. A. Grubbs
University of Kentucky

Wendell Berry lives and farms with his family in Henry County, Kentucky, and is the author of more than thirty books of fiction, non-fiction, and poetry. Among his novels (set in the fictional community of Port William Kentucky) are *Nathan Coulter* (1960), *A Place on Earth* (1967), and *The Memory of Old Jack* (1974); short story collections include *The Wild Birds* (1986), *Remembering* (1988), *Fidelity* (1993), and *Watch With Me* (1994); collections of essays include, among many others, *A Continuous Harmony* (1972), *The Unsettling of America* (1977), *Recollected Essays* (1981), and *Sex, Economy, Freedom, & Community* (1993); and among his many volumes of poetry are *A Part* (1980), *The Wheel* (1982), *Collected Poems* (1985) and *Entries* (1984).

In a commencement address delivered in June 1989 at the College of the Atlantic in Bar Harbor, Maine, Berry gave some advice that to most modern graduates would sound old fashioned, indeed backward. But the advice he gave was timeless, and his reminder seems apocalyptic in view of the world's current environmental crisis and, as Berry sees it, America's cultural crisis. In a sense, Berry's deliverance of such a critical message parallels Moses' deliverance of the Ten Commandments, for Berry's advice is also a prescription for cultural healing through the imposition of a set of laws. The laws Berry delivers, however, seem to be Nature's laws. He closed his address (later published in *Harper's* as "[The Futility of Global Thinking](#)") with a series of ten commands, which, he said, "is simply my hope for us all" [\(22\)](#). These instructions are at the heart of Berry's personal and literary world, and collectively they express the thesis informing all of his work, a canon now in excess of thirty books of essays, fiction, and poetry:

1. Beware the justice of Nature.
2. Understand that there can be no successful human economy apart from Nature or in defiance of Nature.
3. Understand that no amount of education can overcome the innate limits of human intelligence and responsibility. We are not smart enough or conscious enough or alert enough to work responsibly on a gigantic scale.
4. In making things always bigger and more centralized, we make them both more vulnerable in themselves and more dangerous to everything else. Learn, therefore, to prefer small-scale elegance and generosity to large-scale greed, crudity, and glamour.
5. Make a home. Help to make a community. Be loyal to what you have made.
6. Put the interest of the community first.
7. Love your neighbors--not the neighbors you pick out, but the ones you have.
8. Love this miraculous world that we did not make, that is a gift to us.
9. As far as you are able make your lives dependent upon your local place, neighborhood, and household--which thrive by care and generosity--and independent of the industrial economy, which thrives by damage.
10. Find work, if you can, that does no damage. Enjoy your work. Work well. [\(22\)](#)

Viewed in the context of Berry's canon, this sequence represents far more than a neo-romantic or agrarian appeal

to return to "simplicity." To think of his advice in this way is to misinterpret it, for it is more of an oracular warning; either rethink our attitudes toward each other and the natural world, Berry implores, or continue on a path toward natural-, cultural-, and self-annihilation.

Although Berry's tenets echo those of many of his literary ancestors in American literature, his advice is more critical than that of his predecessors, for we now more than ever threaten our existence with destructive potentials unimaginable only a few decades ago. Berry explains our critical condition in "The Loss of the Future," an essay in *The Long-Legged House*:

We have reached a point at which we must either consciously desire and choose and determine the future of the earth or submit to such an involvement in our destructiveness that the earth, and ourselves with it, must certainly be destroyed. And we have come to this at a time when it is hard, if not impossible, to foresee a future that is not terrifying. (46)

Berry's work is an ongoing exploration of man's use of and relationship to the land, and his writing constitutes, as Gary Tolliver has said, one man's "continuing search for avenues of reentry into a proper state of harmony with the natural world" (13). To proponents of modern "progress," Berry's ideas must seem regressive, unrealistic, radical. But no advice could be more needed and more practical, if we are to progress.

Berry's life, his farm work, his writing and teaching, his home and family, and all that each involves are extraordinarily integrated. He understands his writing as an attempt to elucidate certain connections, primarily the interrelationships and interdependencies of man and the natural world. One of his premises in *The Unsettling of America* at once evinces his notion of cultural and natural interdependency: "Everything in the Creation is related to everything else and dependent on everything else" (46). *The Unsettling of America* is about connections and thus ramifications.

Arnold Ehrlich has called the book "a cool, reasoned, lucid and at times poetic explanation of what agribusiness and the mechanization of farming are doing to destroy the American fabric, the community, the household, even the sexual love that is at the basis of *communitas*" (10).

The traditional community is one of Berry's central metaphors for cultural and natural harmony. Such a community is a highly intricate alliance in which individuals function as "parts" of a membership, each depending on and affecting all the others. The traditional community, like the traditional farms within it, is a model of interdependency. Berry explains, "A community is the mental and spiritual condition of knowing that the place is shared, and that the people who share the place define and limit the possibilities of each other's lives" (LLH 61).

Such an intertwinement of lives is a way of describing a traditional community dance, which is usually circular and cyclic and involves several couples, each partner relying on the other, each couple relying on other couples. The result of this interdependence among the dancers, if each dancer has learned the motions, is harmony. Gurney Norman, a friend of Berry's, has explained that "something basic to people's welfare is present in this sort of community dancing; it has to do with people knowing how to affirm one another and to cooperate, and how to have a good time." The dancers move to the music through the intricacies of the dance, and as each sequence is completed, the cycle begins again. In "People, Land, and Community," an essay in *Standing by Words*, Berry speaks of the analogy between an interweaving dance and the traditional community. While elucidating this metaphor for cultural and natural harmony, he brings together his cyclic ideas of traditional work, apprenticeship, and the dead as an intricate part of the living:

People at work in communities three generations old would know that their bodies renewed, time and again, the movements of other bodies, living and dead, known and loved, remembered and loved, in the same shops, houses, and fields. That, of course, is a kind of community dance. And such a dance is perhaps the best way we have to describe harmony. (79)

Berry uses the dance metaphor throughout his poetry to describe harmony between humans and nature, between the living and the dead of a community, and between members of the living. The music accompanying the dancers is sometimes the music of the spheres (the notes of which are so drawn out they can be heard only over years, decades, even centuries). Other sources of the music are farmers working or whistling a work song in a field, people working together harmoniously in communities, water running in a stream, and rain.

The modern agricultural crisis, as Berry sees it, is a consequence of widening the gap between the way nature farms and the way man farms. Many modern agricultural theories and practices assume universal applications. But such attitudes and practices constitute an affront to Nature--that is, the particular Nature of a particular place. Traditional farmers are sensitive to the particular needs of their farms; through the years and generations they have looked to the Nature of their place to judge which practices, plants, and animals work and thrive the best, given the farm's conditions: "A man ought to study the wilderness of a place" (LLH 206). He explains *The Unsettling of America* that "the land is too various in its kinds, climates, conditions, declivities, aspects, and histories to conform to any generalized understanding or to prosper under generalized treatment...

To treat every field, or every part of every field, with the same consideration is not farming but industry" (31). Farmers, he says in a later essay, "must tend to farms that they know and love, farms small enough to know and love, using tools and methods that they know and love, in the company of neighbors that they know and love" (*What Are People For?* 210).

Berry believes that a "place" has its own ruling Nature. Thus, Berry stresses that a traditional farmer will always consider and adapt his practices to the needs of the land's primal character. Successful and sustainable agriculture, then, as Berry understands it, is possible only by maintaining a cyclic vision, one attuned with Nature, rather than a linear vision, one seeking conquest of Nature.

The more a person is removed from the substance of his work, Berry argues, the greater is his tendency to neglect or to ignore it. He says that a traditional farmer "will walk his fields out of interest; the industrial farmer or manager only out of necessity" (UA 188). Traditional care requires a comprehensive, intimate, often passionate knowledge of the Nature of one's place. Berry writes, for example, in *The Unsettling of America*, "A healthy farm culture can be based only upon familiarity and can grow only among a people soundly established upon the land; it nourishes and safeguards a human intelligence of the earth that no amount of technology can satisfactorily replace" (43). Berry is the fifth generation of his father's family and the sixth generation of his mother's to farm in Henry County, Kentucky. Loyal to the cyclic vision, he knows the history of his ancestors on the land, and he understands how each has affected the other.

To Berry, farming the land requires the same discipline as writing a poem. John Ditsky calls farming Berry's "paradigm of art" (13). And Leon Driskell says frankly that Berry "is the same person when writing as when plowing" (63). Traditional farmers, like artists, learn their art through a kind of cultural process, the cyclic view of education, rather than through training or programming, the linear view. Berry explains that the best farming

grows not only out of factual knowledge but out of cultural tradition; it is learned not only by precept but by example, by apprenticeship; and it requires not merely a competent knowledge of its facts and processes, but also a complex set of attitudes, a certain culturally evolved stance, in the face of the unexpected and the unknown. That is to say, it requires *style* in the highest and richest sense of that term. ([CH 98](#))

Like the farmer, the poet must stay in tune with the natural processes of his world, because "the rhythms of the land are an analogue by which we understand ourselves" ([Prunty 958](#)).

Berry's artistic vision of agricultural work, then, is diametrically opposed to the industrial vision which maximizes agricultural mechanization in order to minimize human interaction with and care of the land. Separating humans as far as possible from Nature in practice has created a character-killing and "community-killing agriculture, with its monomania of bigness" ([UA 41](#)).

The modern linear view of progress not only has destroyed many of America's farmlands; it also has been the driving force behind strip mining, deforestation, pollution, and has widened the gap between culture and nature. The current natural resource crisis, in Berry's view, is a direct consequence of our character, and thus the only real hope lies in the change of attitudes. But for such a change to occur and be effective, Berry contends, it must begin on the local level, not under the guise of national "movements." Berry says in "The Futility of Global Thinking" that "the civil rights movement has not given us better communities. The women's movement has not given us better marriages or better households. The environment movement has not changed our parasitic relationship to nature" ([17](#)).

Aside from our suicidal depletion of natural resources, one of Berry's concerns is that our attitude towards the land necessitates our estrangement from it. Berry has said that "my sense of values comes from what I'm rooted in, what I believe in" ([Ehrlich 11](#)). To him, Nature, more specifically, the Nature of his particular place, serves as a moral teacher. In "The Nature Consumers," an essay in *The Long-Legged House*, Berry explains one of the dangers inherent in our longing to separate ourselves from the land:

Man cannot be independent of nature. In one way or another he must live in relation to it, and there are only two alternatives: the way of the frontiersman, whose response to nature was to dominate it, to assert his presence in it by destroying it; or the way of Thoreau, who went to natural places to become quiet in them, to learn from them, to be restored by them. To know these places, because to know them is to need them and respect them and be humble before the, is to preserve them. To fail to know them, because ignorance can only be greedy of them, is to destroy them. ([41-42](#))

Berry's canon constitutes an urgent call to reevaluate both our use of Nature's "gifts" and our view of ourselves. And it is a plea to redirect our environmental concerns from the abstract notion of our "planet" to the more grounded, familiar notion of our "place" - our homes and our communities. In his address, Berry asked the Bar Harbor graduates, "How, after all, can anybody-- any particular body--do anything to heal a planet?" and he answered, "Nobody can do anything to heal a planet. The suggestion that anybody could do so is preposterous. The heroes of abstraction keep galloping in on their white horses to save the planet--and they keep falling off in front of the grandstand" ("[Futility](#)" [16](#)).

Berry's premise, implicit, often explicit, in almost all of his work, is that we must have a particular place, must

identify with it, must learn from it, must love it, must care for it. And only by living in this place long enough, and by attending to the knowledge of those who have lived there before us, will we fully realize the consequences of our presence there: "We may deeply affect a place we own for good or ill," Berry has written, "but our lives are nevertheless included in its life; it will survive us, bearing the results" ([LLH 143](#)).

WORKS CITED

- Berry, Wendell. *A Continuous Harmony: Essays Cultural and Agricultural*. (CH) New York: Harcourt, 1972.
- . "The Futility of Global Thinking." *Harper's Magazine* Sept. 1989: 16-22. (Adapted from "Word and Flesh, an essay in *What Are People For?*")
- . *The Long-Legged House*. (LLH) New York: Harcourt, 1969.
- . *Standing by Words*. (SBW) San Francisco: North Point, 1983.
- . *The Unsettling of America: Culture and Agriculture*. (UA) 1977. San Francisco: Sierra Club, 1986.
- . *What Are People For?* (WPF) San Francisco: North Point, 1990.
- Ditsky, John. "Wendell Berry: Homage to the Apple Tree." *Modern Poetry Studies* 2.1 (1971): 7-15.
- Driskell, Leon V. "Wendell Berry." *Dictionary of Literary Biography* 5: 62-66.
- Ehrlich, Arnold W. "Wendell Berry" (An interview with Wendell Berry). *Publishers Weekly* 5 Sept. 1977: 10-11.
- Norman, Gurney. *From This Valley*. Kentucky Educational Television Video.
- Prunty, Wyatt. "Myth, History, and Myth Again." *The Southern Review* 20 (1984): 958-68.
- Tolliver, Gary. "Wendell Berry." *Dictionary of Literary Biography* 6: 9-14.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 4/1/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College

400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

WHAT CALDWELL'S BOYS DID IN THE CUMBERLAND

Paul Conkin
Vanderbilt University

It makes good sense for scholars and teachers in Kentucky and Tennessee to join together in a chapter of the American Studies Association. The border shared by these two states is almost twice as long as that of the six others shared by Kentucky. Both Kentucky and Tennessee share geographical features, ranging from a mountainous east, to rich central basins, to western slopes that join the Mississippi. Because of their long east-west extent, each state enjoys, or suffers from, several quite distinct regions. Thus, on the basis of terrain, economy, and culture, several inter-state regions, such as the Cumberland area, have much more in common than do the people of each state as a whole.

I now want to make a bold and self-serving claim--that citizens of Kentucky and Tennessee have twice, and only twice, exerted a major and distinctive impact upon American culture as a whole. The first impact involved religious leadership, and the great revivals that began in the Cumberland basin in approximately 1797 and after 1800 spread to central Kentucky and to East Tennessee. These revivals peaked in 1801-2, but in some form continued throughout the nineteenth century. Back to those in a minute.

The second major cultural bequest involved the work of a group of poets, essayists, and economic and social critics who gathered at Vanderbilt University from the end of World War I to around 1936. The small poetry review, *The Fugitive*, gave a name to fourteen young men, and one woman, who boldly entered into the creative and critical ferment of the twenties. Of these poets, four remained close friends, and took the leadership in launching what we now know as Southern Agrarianism in 1930 with the publication by twelve authors of *I'll Take My Stand*. The four men involved in both publications included two born in Kentucky-- Allen Tate and Robert Penn Warren-- and two born in middle Tennessee--John Crowe Ransom and Donald Davidson. It is not my purpose here to essay their contributions to literature, to critical theory, or to social criticism. I only note that their seminars and discussions and fraternal escapades occurred in the same border areas of Kentucky and Tennessee as did the revivals that first erupted in 1797.

My claim for these two groups is self-serving, for I have chosen to write books about both the revivalists and the poets. Also, these two books are the only ones I have written in which the principal characters had such a close tie to Kentucky and Tennessee. Finally, more than is usual, these two groups have a direct relationship to my personal biography. I will clarify later my ties to the revivalists, and only note here that as a graduate student at Vanderbilt in 1951 I met Davidson and took two courses with another Agrarian, H.C. Nixon.

My title comes from an article I published in the *Tennessee Historical Quarterly*. The boys were the five Presbyterian and one Methodist ministers who pastored congregations in Sumner County, Tennessee, and Logan County, Kentucky, by 1800, and whose congregations hosted the joint communion services in which a great revival had its beginning. All had been members of David Caldwell's congregations in Guilford County, North

Carolina, and I am reasonably certain that all had attended Caldwell's famous log-cabin academy. Also one of Caldwell's boys, but in 1801 the pastor at the Cane Ridge meeting House in Bourbon County in central Kentucky, was Barton W. Stone. The brother-in-law of David Caldwell, Thomas Craighead, had earlier come west as the first Presbyterian minister to settle in the Nashville area.

David Caldwell was born in 1725 in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania. His parents had migrated to Pennsylvania from Ulster, as had thousands of other Scotch-Irish by even 1725, although these migrants made up the first wave of a veritable flood of Scotch-Irish who moved to America by 1776. Perhaps a century earlier, David's progenitors had moved from Scotland to the more inviting plantations of Ulster, probably from County Galloway in the Scottish lowlands, or the area of Scotland closest to northern Ireland. The genealogies of what became at least a dozen prominent but only distantly related Caldwell clans in America are full of clearly apocryphal details. The legend is that the original family came to medieval Scotland from France, and gained the name Caldwell from a cold (cauld) well on an early farm. After 1560, the Caldwells, like almost all lowland Scots, accepted the church reforms led by John Knox, and with this a Presbyterian polity. Soon members of the Scottish Kirk would be generally known as Presbyterians. In so far as they were active in churches, the Scotch-Irish immigrants were virtually all Presbyterians.

Most Ulster immigrants first settled in Pennsylvania as did this branch of the Caldwell family. Some brothers of David remained in Lancaster County until their deaths in the nineteenth century. But new waves of immigrants, and a natural increase in the early families, forced many Scotch-Irish to move further inland, both west and south. Many moved down the Valley of Virginia, there planting dozens of Presbyterian congregations. Others moved down the Piedmont, most often to south-central Virginia or into central North Carolina. It seems clear that kinship and congregational ties held firm, and thus the new settlements often were in effect planned colonies, with kinfolk or friends and at times even their minister moving as a group. Some of the close familial ties stretched back to the neighborhoods in Ulster, and I suspect all the way back to Scotland, or five or six generations before the birth of David Caldwell.

David Caldwell belatedly experienced a religious conversion in the family congregation in Lancaster County, in 1750, age twenty-five. He soon decided to become a minister, even though he also dabbled in medicine and taught schools. To be ordained as a Presbyterian, one had to have a classical education. So David was able to enroll in the new Presbyterian College of New Jersey at Princeton, probably in 1758. He studied under the College president, Samuel Davies, the father of Southern Presbyterianism and an intellectual only slightly less brilliant than his friend and predecessor in this cursed college presidency, Jonathan Edwards. David graduated in 1761, the year of Davies' death. He almost immediately gained a license to preach, and began the often extended apprenticeship that led to ordination. He was ordained in 1765, at the advanced age of forty.

By then, several families from his home congregation had settled along Buffalo Creek, near present Greensboro, North Carolina. David may well have planned, long before his ordination, to become pastor of their new congregations. Upon ordination, he came to North Carolina, proved himself in service to mission congregations, and in 1766 became the permanent pastor of two congregations on the Buffalo. He would serve them almost sixty years, for he lived to be 100. In a pattern that typified almost all Presbyterian ministers of the era, he sought ways of supplementing his limited pastoral salary. He practiced medicine, acquired a large farm, and built his own boarding-type academy. David married the daughter of his former pastor in Pennsylvania, Alexander Craighead, and sister of Thomas Craighead, later the founding pastor of the First Presbyterian Church in Nashville. The Craigheads had by then moved to Mecklenburg County, to the present site of Charlotte. One of David's brothers, Alexander, named after their family minister, also moved to the Buffalo, and established a farm next to David's. I

mention all of this to demonstrate the close family and kinship ties that helped determine paths of migration.

David Caldwell's academy became locally famous. Eventually, he would educated over fifty Presbyterian ministers. He taught all his students Latin and Greek, and continued his better students into what then amounted to college-level courses, although his academy never granted degrees. But the education the young men received enabled them to pass rigorous exams before presbyteries, and, with some additional supervised study, meet the high ordination requirements of the now largely Scotch-Irish denomination.

Among the early academy students was one James McGready, whose parents had moved to the Guilford County colony along with David and Alexander Caldwell. Just after the Revolution, McGready moved to near Pittsburgh, and completed college work in a new Presbyterian institution, now Washington and Jefferson College. He was ordained in the Redstone Presbytery of western Pennsylvania, but decided to return to North Carolina in 1787. This was the year a major revival broke out among students at a small Presbyterian college in southern Virginia, Hampden-Sydney. In the next three years, this revival spread among the Presbyterian congregations in both central Virginia and North Carolina, and also to congregations in the great valley of Virginia. Again, as in Scotland and Ulster, the bulk of the affective preaching, and the only large gatherings of people, were in conjunction with the traditional Scottish summer communions. This revival led to the conversion of young men and the commitment of many of them to the ministry. McGready entered enthusiastically into the revival, and proved himself a very gifted preacher, although too moralistic and puritanical for some in his congregation. He frequently preached in chapel to the young boys at the Caldwell Academy, and soon became a tutor to four or five young men just beginning the long journey to a license and then Presbyterian ordination.

By 1790, the new Presbyterian communities in North Carolina had fully matured, and a generation sought better economic opportunities. The pattern of communal mitosis, which had led daughter colonies from Scotland to Ulster, across an ocean to Pennsylvania, and then down to North Carolina, repeated itself once again. Several families, particularly young families, decided to move over the Appalachians to the new Cumberland settlements north of Nashville; others moved either from North Carolina or from the Shenandoah Valley into East Tennessee. Just as after 1760, these migrants established embryonic congregations and begged their former presbyteries to send them ministers. The first colonies to attract numerous former members of Caldwell's congregations clustered in the border counties of Logan and Sumner. The families came because of the excellent land. Very quickly they established farms and communities. The families who settled were reasonably affluent. Even by 1796 this area was populous, no longer a wild frontier.

It was Caldwell's boys, quite appropriately, who first responded to appeals for ministers. James McGready was the older and best established of the second generation of ministers, in fact already famous in North Carolina for the power of his preaching. He decided to move west in 1796, with some indication that he wanted to escape his three scattered congregations in Logan County. McGready, like all the young ministers, was anxious to better himself economically. Entrepreneurial opportunities always mixed with spiritual ones. The other five men that followed him west were just completing their ministerial apprenticeship, most licensed to preach but as yet not ordained. This included two brothers, William and John McGee. John had joined the Methodists, and around 1798 began serving a Methodist circuit in Sumner County. William remained a Presbyterian, and moved to the new Shiloh congregation in Sumner County in 1796. In the same year, John Rankin, another former member of David Caldwell's congregations, moved to another Sumner County congregation. In 1798, William Hodge, a Caldwell student and apprentice under McGready, would take over this pulpit, allowing Rankin to move to a former McGready congregation at Gasper River, in northern Logan County. In 1800, William McAdow, an often sickly young minister, took over McGready's Red River Tennessee congregation in southern Logan County, so close to

the Tennessee border that it had members from both states.

The six wild men of the Cumberland were now all in place.

Barton Stone also came west in 1796, with a new license to preach. He was not Scotch-Irish, and had grown up in an Anglican parish in southern Virginia. But his mother used a legacy to help him get a classical education, and selected Caldwell's academy. While boarding there, he was converted in the 1787 revivals and, with some later doubts, committed himself to the Presbyterian ministry. He preached in east Tennessee in the summer of 1796, then came to visit McGready, where he learned of an open pulpit at Cane Ridge in the bluegrass. He preached there briefly, but only belatedly decided to become its permanent minister in 1798, and he would be ordained. His attachment to that congregation would have enormous significance in American history because of the great communion of 1801, the largest and most influential in American history, and Stone's later role in founding a branch of the Restoration or Christian movement. I can only refer you to my Cane Ridge book for that story.

McGready was a very successful minister in Logan County. He immediately began holding the large summer communions in each of his three scattered congregations. The communion season meant opening services on Friday evening and all-day preaching on Saturday, often from an outdoor shell or what the Scots had always called a tent. On Sunday the visiting ministers all participated in multiple communion services, with communicants taking a seat at tables for each meal. On Monday morning, a thanksgiving service normally ended the communion season, except in periods of great fervor, when the people often chose to remain on the grounds for up to two extra days. Until 1800, host congregations always provided room and board for all the visiting congregations. For parents long separated from earlier North Carolina friends, this was reunion time; for young people, a courting time; for sinners, a converting time.

Beginning in the summer of 1797, these communions, which moved from one congregation to another during the summer months, gradually drew larger and larger crowds. They were marked by increased fervor and by intense physical manifestations, climaxing in 1800 by large numbers of people who fell to the ground in something like a coma. This had happened before, back in Scotland and Ulster, even in the colonies in the 1740s, but few remembered such exercises, as they called them. In the summer of 1800, at least 10 such communions took place in the border area congregations, including one in Nashville. But for several reasons, it would be the ones in Logan County that became famous.

McGready wrote "A Short Narrative of the Revival of Religion in Logan County" in 1801 and sent parts or all of this manuscript to eastern ministers and to two new evangelical journals. It seems that, within the next three years, everyone involved in evangelical Christianity had read McGready's narrative. Its impact is almost unmeasurable, but clearly more influential than any other description of revivals except Jonathan Edwards' *Faithful Narrative* of the Northampton revival of 1734. The just emerging journals gave it a circulation impossible for even Edwards sixty years before. Ministers all over the country read it to congregations, with almost magical effect. Even Methodist Bishop Francis Asbury, when too ill to prepare a sermon, simply read one version of McGready's narrative, and reported that nothing had ever so moved one of his congregations.

McGready was the first to circulate such a description. This later contributed the undeserved claim that he began something called a Second Great Awakening. Yet, had he not written and circulated the narrative, had he not had a sense of the importance of such publicity, the religious history of the United States might have been quite different. I think he was honest in his description of events in Logan County, although one can see the effect of literary conventions. In a sense he placed himself much more in the center of events in the Cumberland than he deserved.

The narrative led people to refer to the multiple communions as McGready's revival, thus obscuring the role of his colleagues. It also gave an undeserved Logan County stamp to the events, when I believe more of the great communions took place in Sumner than in Logan County. McGready's account also concealed the fact that, by 1800, he had already surrendered two of his three Logan County pulpits to Rankin and McAdow. Not only McGready, but all neighboring ministers, preached at each inter-congregational communion.

What first happened at two 1800 communions, at McAdow's Red River and Rankin's Gasper River congregations, became famous. At Red River, John McGee, the uninhibited Methodist circuit preacher, used late evening exhortations to rouse the congregation into what seemed like unprecedented physical exercises. In the intense emotional atmosphere, several collapsed into a coma. News of this falling at Red River spread like wildfire through the Cumberland, and insured an even larger crowd at the next communion at Gasper River. Spectators were now joining communicants at such events, and were helping shift the focus away from the Sunday communion to what was closer to a protracted revival. The outdoor preaching, from the tent, was often all that non-members or casual observers experienced.

In July, people came from up to one hundred miles to attend the much anticipated Gasper River communion. When the host minister, John Rankin, arrived on Friday afternoon, to prepare for the opening services, he was astonished to find from twenty to thirty wagons, with provisions, encamped on the rising ground above the river and meeting house. These families had, in effect, already established an impromptu camp ground. Camping in or beside wagons was not new; in moving west, families had become expert at this. Something close to camping had occurred in the yards or barns of host families at earlier communions. We have earlier reports of people camping at Baptist association meetings. Yet, this spontaneous camp at Gasper River turned out to be a dramatic new departure in both American religious and recreational history. The on-site families did not want to miss the religious excitement, which often peaked in the night hours. Possibly they wanted to spare local families from a hospitality overload.

News of the camping spread as fast as reports of the physical exercises, which rivaled those at Red River. John Rankin soon took a trip, back through East Tennessee, to the home congregations in Guilford County. He told his story over and over again, both about the exercises and the camping. The story was sufficient, almost everywhere, to create great religious excitement, and as early as 1801 huge communions, or union meetings organized with other denominations, occurred throughout the Carolinas. Camping was a normal part of these meetings. Even as early as 1801 some host congregations began to lay in provisions or mark off grounds for prospective campers. At the great Cane Ridge communion in August of 1801 an estimated 140 wagons, or over 800 people, camped on the grounds.

Thus, in the sense of a major American institution, religious camping began at Gasper River. In the summer of 1989 I twice wandered around the present cow pasture where the first wagons had gathered in 1800. I first came before reading Rankin's hand written account in his brief autobiography now preserved by the Kentucky Museum in Bowling Green, and then came back second time to fit my image to his description. The old Gasper River cemetery alone allows one to identify the exact spot. No historical markers document the significance of what happened there. The present farm owner probably has no awareness of it. In my imagination, the scene came back to life for me, and I was deeply moved. Thus, I placed one of my photographs of that deserted field into my book on Cane Ridge-- the only homage I could offer.

It is hard to exaggerate the significance of camping. Many Presbyterian ministers reacted negatively to the extreme physical exercises, and thus refused to institutionalize what had been spontaneous in 1800 and 1801. Not so the

Methodists and later Cumberland Presbyterians. Even by 1802 local entrepreneurs, or ministers in Methodist circuits, began developing permanent camping sites (well-attended camps brought hundreds of people into a local area, people willing to pay for various provisions or services). Within a decade well-laid-out sites for wagons and tents gave way to rude cabins built by individual families. By 1810, almost all Methodist circuits had camp grounds, and blended their quarterly conferences into planned summer retreats or camp meetings. The practice even spread to Britain, where camping was the reason for a split among English Methodists.

As I argued in my book on Cane Ridge, such planned camping offered evangelical Christians a new type of experience. The camps allowed them to extend the scope, and to blur the boundaries, of distinctively religious activities. It also broadened the range of social contacts, much as group camps today. Instead of the more familial setting of home hospitality, campers confronted something close to an urban neighborhood. They clustered, made up a crowd. And some clearly loved the experience. This deliberate clustering, often in restricted space, became the norm for American camping, in contrast to a lonely wilderness experience. Soon, for rural Americans, living on widely dispersed homesteads, going to camp was literally a way of creating temporary cities, with all the diverse people, the bustle, the excitement, and even the personal anonymity of street life. It involved people in a social environment far removed from their lonely cabins, and allowed them to escape old roles and assume new ones. Add a heady dose of religious ecstasy, and people could literally lose themselves in self-justifying experiences that enabled them to forget, or temporarily transcend, all the strains and problems of everyday life. This meant escape, renewal, recreation, all sanctioned by ostensible religious goals.

Gaspar River, even though unplanned, unorganized, and spontaneous, first initiated people into this type of camping experience. Innovative institutions very quickly provided order and continuity for such experience. This led to the camp meeting and to a variety of functionally similar modern substitutes, such as summer youth camps and adult retreat centers. Remove the religious motifs, secularize the goals, and we have present-day campgrounds and resorts, not a few of which actually derive from earlier camp meetings.

The dramatic communions, the hundreds of new converts, provided a sequel to what had happened a generation earlier in Guilford County. Two-score young men, converted in the revival, wanted to go into the ministry. The expansion of congregations led the Kentucky Synod to create a new Cumberland Presbytery in 1802. Within two years it had licensed seventeen young ministers and already ordained two of them. To do so, it followed earlier patterns in its parent presbytery, and relaxed some traditional requirements of Greek and Latin, and out of deference to some doctrinal qualms, it allowed candidates to finesse the Westminster doctrine of double predestination.

Thomas Craighead of Nashville, jealous of the greater wealth and political influence of the ablest of the young ministers, Finis Ewing, protested to the Kentucky Synod. This led to an inquiry, to the refusal of the young ministers to submit to a doctrinal examination, to jurisdictional arguments over the power of local presbyteries, and eventually to the dissolution of the Cumberland Presbytery, suspension of all the young ministers on what were primarily doctrinal grounds, and synodical charges against McGready and his four original colleagues. Appeals to the General Assembly kept the controversy alive until 1810, when the Synod won. McGready and Hodge reluctantly adhered to the old church. A disgusted John Rankin joined the Shakers, and helped create the South Union colony almost in the shadow of the Gaspar River church. Ewing, now a powerful figure in these border areas (he helped found a family dynasty along the Red near present Adairville), a close friend and later patronage appointee of Andrew Jackson, led the dissidents who refused to submit. In 1810 he and Samuel King, another of the young ministers,

traveled to Dickson County, Tennessee, to the cabin of McAdow, who was then too ill to preach, and there the three formed an independent presbytery. William McGee soon joined.

In time this lone Cumberland Presbytery expanded into a major new denomination. In polity the Cumberlands remained Presbyterian, in doctrine they developed a fascinating hybrid of Calvinism and Wesleyanism, and in style they were as evangelical as the Methodists, and joined them in developing camp grounds. This main institutional product of the Cumberland revivals remained a mid-sized denomination until a majority of its members merged with the northern Presbyterian Church in 1906. Its major college, before merger, was Cumberland University in Lebanon. The remnant of Cumberland Presbyterians who rejected merger now have only one college, Bethel, in McKenzie, Tennessee.

I end by listing some of my personal ties to the work of Caldwell's boys. I grew up in a Cumberland Presbyterian congregation in East Tennessee. I was born on a farm formerly owned by Thomas Caldwell, a nephew of David. David's brother, Alexander, died as a result of illness contracted as a soldier during the Revolution. In 1795 his widow, and two sons, bought land in the valley where I grew up. The two sons had attended David Caldwell's academy as youngsters, and had been classmates of some of the ministers who came west. In 1796 I am reasonably sure that McGready, McGee, and Barton Stone, on their way to the Cumberland settlements, spent some time with Samuel Caldwell in his new cabin, remnants of which remained when I was a boy, not more than a quarter of a mile from our home, where my mother still lives. I am equally sure that John Rankin stopped there in the fall of 1800 as he carried the exciting news of the Gasper River revival and the new camping back to North Carolina. Samuel Caldwell eventually built a school and a camp meeting site on his land, or what was long known as Caldwell's camp. The green-roofed preaching tent gave an enduring name to our little village--Green Shed. In 1834 a new Cumberland Presbyterian congregation built their first log church on this land, land later donated to the congregation by Samuel's son. The brother of Samuel, Thomas, was one of the first two ruling elders in the congregation. Margaret Caldwell, the sister-in-law of David Caldwell, lived on in Samuel's home until sometime after the census of 1830, preserving until at least then bitter memories of the frantic days when Cornwallis's armies ravaged the Alamance area of North Carolina and even burned David Caldwell's library. Samuel, who died in 1841, has the oldest readable tombstone in our church cemetery. Twice, in the last twelve years, the descendants of Samuel and Thomas Caldwell have held reunions at this church, with my mother filling baskets of food for the dinner on the ground. Finally, as a boy, in my family church, I heard over and over again highly embellished stories about the heroes of our denomination, the now venerable trinity of Ewing, King, and McAdow.

Portions of this paper first appeared in "Caldwell's Boys," *Tennessee Historical Quarterly*, 50 (Summer 1991): 71-79.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 3/29/99. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College

400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu

"A Goodly Fellowship": The Kentucky-Tennessee ASA's First Forty Years

Thomas Blues
University of Kentucky

We know who they were, what they proposed to do, and where they began to do it. But exactly what they talked about at that initial gathering forty years ago, and exactly when they talked about it, we don't know; for no written record of the first meeting is extant in the accumulated file folders of papers (the Constitution, membership rosters, meeting sites, officers, programs, bills, and correspondence) that constitute the Archives of the Kentucky-Tennessee American Studies Association.

We can find a few facts in the mists of our origins. Among the founders were Lyman Burbank, Durant da Ponte, Richard Beale Davis, LeRoy Graf, Nathalia Wright (University of Tennessee); Clement Eaton, Robert Jacobs (University of Kentucky); Harold Bradley, Randall Stewart (Vanderbilt); Earl Rovit (University of Louisville); Paul Nagle (Eastern Kentucky State College); Richard Drake (Berea College). The first members gathered in Lexington one day in the spring of 1955. They adopted a Constitution that linked them to the national association and committed them to the promotion of "the study of American civilization, both in general and with particular reference to the area from which its membership is drawn, and especially in aspects which involve more than a single academic discipline." Clement Eaton was elected President, Richard Beale David Vice-President, and LeRoy Graf Secretary-Treasurer.

Thanks to the first issue of the Association's newsletter in June 1956, we know a good deal more about the second annual meeting--April 6-7 in Nashville. Carl Bode of the University of Maryland presented a paper Friday evening. Saturday morning there was a panel discussion on "Urbanism in the South," moderated by August Meier of Fisk University. His distinguished colleague, Arna Bontemps, delivered the concluding luncheon talk on Booker T. Washington.

Thus was established a pattern that carried through several years; three or four presentations, in contrast to the twelve or more we now average; panel discussions ("Tastemakers of the Old South" in 1957, "European Influences on the Culture of the Southeast" in 1958, "The Advancement of Culture in Louisville" in 1959 (featuring Barry Bingham and former Louisville mayor Charles Farnsley), "Contemporary Linguistics and American Studies" in 1961, with John Jacob Niles participating--and so on into the mid 1960s); and distinguished speakers from beyond the borders of the border states (C. Vann Woodward, George Rogers Taylor, Raven McDavid, Louis D. Rubin).

The 1957 meeting, at what was then Eastern Kentucky State College in Richmond, set another pattern that has endured: the alternating of meeting sites between Kentucky in odd years, and Tennessee in even years. Until 1973, meetings were almost always held on college campuses--in Tennessee at such sites as Knoxville, Nashville, Johnson City, Cookeville, and Memphis; in Kentucky at Lexington, Richmond, Berea, Louisville, Georgetown, and Bowling Green. Since the early 1970s, the Association has gathered principally at state parks (perhaps our favorite has been Fall Creek Falls in Tennessee) and at Shakertown in Kentucky.

In numbers, the Association has increased somewhat since its founding. The early years counted members in the forties; we now and for the past several years count ourselves in the fifties at annual meetings. Still, we have lasted over almost half a century, while other small groups have consolidated into larger regional associations (the Southern American Studies Association, which meets biennially, comes to mind). I think one of the reasons for our continued existence is that we teach ourselves something interesting about the region in which we live every time we meet.

From the beginning, the Association has attended to its constitutional obligation to study "the area from which its membership is drawn." A survey of newsletters and programs informs us that we have been interested in the area's popular culture (the automobile in Eastern Kentucky; Saturday night at the movies in Campbellsville), its educational history (education during the Great Depression) and innovations (the Highlander Folk School), religion (revivalism and anti-intellectualism in Kentucky, Zionism in Tennessee), political history (the anti-slavery movement, the New Deal and the South), culture heroes (Daniel Boone, Davy Crockett, Kit Carson, Andrew Jackson, Abraham Lincoln), Appalachian culture (creative expression in the folk arts, ginseng collecting), some Agrarians (Warren, Tate, and Ransom) and Tate's wife, Caroline Gordon, celebrated cases and events (the Beauchamp-Sharp affair, Bryan and Darrow at Dayton, the Black Patch Wars), women's history (women in a rural Kentucky church, the woman as reformer), African-American history (black pioneers from the border states).

Somewhat surprisingly, Kentucky-Tennessee writers have not received the attention we might have expected. Those who have been studied (in addition to the Agrarians mentioned above) include Mary Noailles Murfree, Elizabeth Madox Roberts, John Fox, Jr., Susan Clay Sawitzky, Thomas Merton, Evelyn Scott, Jesse Stuart, Peter Taylor, Bobbie Ann Mason, and Gurney Norman. The first paper on Harriet Arnow was read in 1986; there have been five since. Wendell Berry's work was the subject of a paper for the first and only time in 1993. A number of the area's writers have so far never been attended to; among them George Washington Harris, James Lane Allen, Nikki Giovanni, Cormac McCarthy, Alex Haley, Randall Jarrell, and Richard Marius.

If it is true that we teach other when we meet, it is also true that from the outset we have enjoyed meeting with one another. In the May 1960 Newsletter, Durant da Ponte referred to the Kentucky-Tennessee ASA as "a goodly fellowship...(which) has remained relatively fixed as to its personnel--these comprising a solid core of devoted... members whose aim has been the furtherance of American studies in this region." The structure of our annual gatherings has encouraged our getting to know one another and the development of friendships. For if the time is short, it is time spent together. With few exceptions over the years, we have assembled in single sessions; we enjoy an evening meal together, preceded by the revered "attitudinal adjustment hour." Off-campus meeting sites encourage informality; they effectively reduce academic stuffiness without discouraging serious scholarship and conversation.

While the current vice-president plans each meeting's program, the secretary-treasurer seeks and secures the meeting site, publicizes the event, issues calls for papers, and attends to the myriad details of making everything work. Vice-presidents metamorphose into ceremonial presidents when their real work is done, but secretary-treasurers endure and keep working. Our group's continued existence is owed in large part to a short list of members who have held this key office, from LeRoy Graf and Durant da Ponte of the University of Tennessee in the early years, through William Berge (1967-86) and Gene Forderhase (since 1986) of Eastern Kentucky University. In addition to their other duties, Professors Graf and da Ponte after him edited and disseminated an informative newsletter twice a year from 1956 through 1964. Issues of the newsletter announced our annual meetings, provided abstracts of papers and business reports, gave out news of members' publications and academic

activities, and provided other information of interest to American Studies professionals. As successors to the Office, Professors Berge and Forderhase have been largely responsible for the Association's continuity and stability for nearly thirty years.

Now, four decades beyond the first meeting, we find ourselves a constant and faithful membership that supports the Association with our attendance, scholarly contributions, and participation in the duties of governance. We also have a journal that publishes a biennial issue, under the able co-editorship of Sarah Howell and Michael Dunne of MTSU and with the financial support of several of the area universities. The editorial board is comprised of Thomas Blues of the University of Kentucky, J.W. Cooke of Tennessee State University, and Allison Ensor of the University of Tennessee. *Border States* prints many of the papers presented at our spring meeting, but welcomes essays dealing with all aspects of the regional culture.

We can say with some confidence that the machine is in good working order; but we must also acknowledge that it can always use new parts. Almost from the beginning, the Association has been concerned to sustain and increase its numbers. A membership committee was formed in 1963, and from time to time over the years efforts have been made to draw more participants to the annual meetings. A promising sign is the increased presence of graduate students. We also need to consider ways to attract and involve younger faculty from more of the region's colleges and universities. Forty is not old, but it is getting there.

Copyright © 1995, 1999, Middle Tennessee State University.

Border States On-Line is hosted by [Georgetown College](#).

This page was last updated on 3/16/00. | [Border States On-Line](#) | [Site Map](#)

This web page is maintained by

Dr. Harold D. Tallant, Department of History, Georgetown College
400 East College Street, Georgetown, KY 40324, (502) 863-8075

E-mail: htallant@georgetowncollege.edu